

# A NOTE ON LINNIK'S THEOREM ON QUADRATIC NON-RESIDUES

PAUL BALISTER, BÉLA BOLLOBÁS, JONATHAN D. LEE, ROBERT MORRIS,  
AND OLIVER RIORDAN

ABSTRACT. We present a short, self-contained and purely combinatorial proof of Linnik's theorem: for any  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a constant  $C_\varepsilon$  such that for any  $N$ , there are at most  $C_\varepsilon$  primes  $p \leq N$  such that the least positive quadratic non-residue modulo  $p$  exceeds  $N^\varepsilon$ .

## 1. INTRODUCTION

In 1941, Linnik [6] developed the Large Sieve and used it (in [7]) to prove that for any  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a constant  $C_\varepsilon$  such that for all  $N$ , there are at most  $C_\varepsilon$  primes  $p \leq N$  such that the least quadratic non-residue modulo  $p$  exceeds  $N^\varepsilon$ . The Large Sieve was subsequently developed as a theorem about quasi-independent functions by Rényi [9, 10, 11, 12], and as a theorem on duality and an approximate Plancherel identity by Bombieri [1] and Roth [13]. Modern presentations include [2, 4].

The techniques of these proofs are ultimately analytic, and relate Fourier analysis on the circle to the discrete Fourier transform on  $\mathbb{Z}/p\mathbb{Z}$ . In this paper, we present a direct combinatorial (or 'elementary') proof of Linnik's theorem, based on an explicit combinatorial sieve. To emphasize the elementary nature of this proof, we also include proofs of some (very weak) estimates on sums of the reciprocals of the primes and smooth numbers. In doing so, we avoid using standard results such as the prime number theorem, which despite having an elementary proof (see [5]), is in fact far deeper than the result we wish to show.

## 2. ESTIMATE ON PRIME NUMBERS

The following is a very weak form of Mertens' Theorem [8]. For completeness we include an elementary proof, inspired by a proof given by Erdős.

**Lemma 1.** *For any fixed  $\varepsilon \in (0, 1)$ , we have*

$$\sum_{\substack{n^{1-\varepsilon} < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{1}{p} \geq \varepsilon + o(1)$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ .

*Proof.* The form of the statement allows us to assume that  $n$  is large, so replacing  $n$  by  $\lfloor n \rfloor$  we may assume that  $n$  is an integer.

First note the elementary result that a prime  $p$  divides  $n!$  exactly  $\sum_{k \geq 1} \lfloor \frac{n}{p^k} \rfloor < \frac{n}{p-1}$  times. Thus if  $a_1 + \dots + a_t = n$ , then the number of times  $p$  divides the multinomial coefficient  $n!/(a_1! \dots a_t!)$  is at most  $\frac{n}{p-1}$ , but is also

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k \geq 1} \left( \lfloor \frac{n}{p^k} \rfloor - \sum_{i=1}^t \lfloor \frac{a_i}{p^k} \rfloor \right) &\leq \sum_{k \geq 1, p^k \leq n} \left( \frac{n}{p^k} - \sum_{i=1}^t \left( \frac{a_i}{p^k} - 1 \right) \right) \\ &= \sum_{k \geq 1, p^k \leq n} t = O(t \log n). \end{aligned}$$

However, the multinomial expansion of

$$t^n = (1 + \dots + 1)^n = \sum_{a_1 + \dots + a_t = n} \frac{n!}{a_1! \dots a_t!},$$

contains at most  $(n+1)^t$  terms, as each  $a_i$  satisfies  $0 \leq a_i \leq n$ . Thus if we choose  $a_1, \dots, a_t$  so as to maximize the multinomial coefficient, we have  $n!/(a_1! \dots a_t!) \geq t^n/(n+1)^t$ . Thus by considering the prime factorization of  $n!/(a_1! \dots a_t!)$  we have, for any  $r < n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} n \log t &\leq \log \frac{n!}{a_1! \dots a_t!} + O(t \log n) \\ &\leq \sum_{\substack{r < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{n}{p-1} \log p + \sum_{\substack{p \leq r \\ p \text{ prime}}} O(t \log n) \log p + O(t \log n) \\ &\leq \sum_{\substack{r < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{n \log n}{p-1} + O(rt(\log n)^2). \end{aligned}$$

Dividing by  $n \log n$  gives

$$\sum_{\substack{r < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{1}{p-1} \geq \frac{\log t}{\log n} - O\left(\frac{rt \log n}{n}\right).$$

Let  $r = n^{1-\varepsilon}$  and  $t = n^\varepsilon/(\log n)^2$ . Then, noting that

$$\frac{1}{r} = \sum_{i > r} \left( \frac{1}{i-1} - \frac{1}{i} \right) \geq \sum_{\substack{r < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \left( \frac{1}{p-1} - \frac{1}{p} \right),$$

we have

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{\substack{n^{1-\varepsilon} < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{1}{p} &\geq \left( \sum_{\substack{n^{1-\varepsilon} < p \leq n \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{1}{p-1} \right) - \frac{1}{n^{1-\varepsilon}} \\ &\geq \frac{\varepsilon \log n - 2 \log \log n}{\log n} - \frac{O(1)}{\log n} - \frac{1}{n^{1-\varepsilon}} \\ &\geq \varepsilon - o(1) \end{aligned}$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , as required. □

### 3. ESTIMATE ON SMOOTH NUMBERS

We recall that a positive integer  $m$  is called  $y$ -smooth if for any prime  $p$  dividing  $m$ ,  $p \leq y$ . One of the earliest results on the number  $\Psi(n, y)$  of  $y$ -smooth numbers in the set  $\{1, \dots, [n]\}$  was obtained by Dickman [3] in 1930. We will need the following weak version of his theorem; once again, we include an elementary proof for completeness.

**Lemma 2.** *For any  $u > 0$ , there exists a constant  $c_u > 0$  such that*

$$\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) \geq c_u n$$

for all real  $n \geq 1$ .

*Proof.* We induct on  $[2u]$ . If  $u \leq 1$ , then  $n^{1/u} \geq n$  and  $\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) = [n]$ , so we can take  $c_u = 1/2$ . Suppose  $u > 1$ . By decomposing the set of  $y$ -smooth numbers by their largest prime factor we have

$$\Psi(n, y) = 1 + \sum_{\substack{p \leq y \\ p \text{ prime}}} \Psi\left(\frac{n}{p}, p\right). \quad (1)$$

Let  $u' = u + \frac{1}{2}$ , and note that  $\log(n/p)/\log p \leq u' - 1 = u - \frac{1}{2}$  for any prime  $p$  in the range  $n^{1/u'} < p \leq n^{1/u}$ . Hence, by the induction hypothesis, we have  $\Psi\left(\frac{n}{p}, p\right) \geq c_{u-1/2} \frac{n}{p}$  for each such  $p$ , and therefore, by (1),

$$\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) \geq \sum_{\substack{n^{1/u'} < p \leq n^{1/u} \\ p \text{ prime}}} \Psi\left(\frac{n}{p}, p\right) \geq c_{u-1/2} \sum_{\substack{n^{1/u'} < p \leq n^{1/u} \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{n}{p}.$$

Now,  $n^{1/u'} = (n^{1/u})^{1-\varepsilon}$  with  $\varepsilon = 1 - \frac{u}{u'} = \frac{1}{2u'}$ , and therefore, by Lemma 1,

$$\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) \geq c_{u-1/2} \sum_{\substack{n^{1/u'} < p \leq n^{1/u} \\ p \text{ prime}}} \frac{n}{p} \geq c_{u-1/2} \left( \frac{1}{2u'} - o(1) \right) n$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Since  $\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) \geq 1$  for all  $n \geq 1$ , it follows that there exists a  $c_u > 0$  such that  $\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) \geq c_u n$  for all  $n \geq 1$ , as claimed.  $\square$

### 4. THE COMBINATORIAL SIEVE

The following simple combinatorial inequality is in fact the key ingredient of the proof.

**Lemma 3.** *For any sets  $A_1, \dots, A_d \subseteq [n] = \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ ,*

$$(d+1)^2 \left| \bigcap_{i=1}^d A_i \right| \leq (d+1)^2 n - 4d \sum_{i=1}^d |A_i^c| + 4 \sum_{i \neq j} |A_i^c \cap A_j^c|.$$

*Proof.* Suppose  $x \in [n]$  is in  $\ell$  of the sets  $A_i^c$ . Then on the right hand side it is counted

$$(d+1)^2 - 4d\ell + 4\ell(\ell-1) = (d+1-2\ell)^2 \geq 0$$

times and, if it is in all of the sets  $A_i$ , it is counted exactly  $(d+1)^2$  times.  $\square$

## 5. LINNIK'S THEOREM

For any prime number  $p$ , let  $n_p$  be the least positive quadratic non-residue modulo  $p$ .

**Theorem 4.** *Fix integers  $N > B \geq 2$ . Let  $\mathcal{P} = \{p \leq N : p \text{ is prime and } n_p > B\}$  and  $d = |\mathcal{P}|$ . Then  $(d+1)\Psi(N^3, B) \leq (5 + dB^{-2})N^3$ .*

*Proof.* Fix  $n$  (to be chosen later) and, for each  $p_i \in \mathcal{P}$ , let  $A_i = \{x \in [n] : \left(\frac{x}{p_i}\right) = 1\}$ . Each  $A_i$  contains all primes less than or equal to  $B$ . Furthermore, if  $x, y \in A_i$  and  $xy \leq n$ , then  $xy \in A_i$ . Hence,

$$\left| \bigcap_{i=1}^d A_i \right| \geq \Psi(n, B).$$

The set  $A_i^c$  contains all integers up to  $n$  in  $(p_i + 1)/2$  of the congruence classes modulo  $p_i$ , so

$$|A_i^c| \geq \frac{n}{2} \left(1 + \frac{1}{p_i}\right) - p_i,$$

and hence

$$4d \sum_{i=1}^d |A_i^c| \geq 2d^2n + 2dn \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} \frac{1}{p} - 4d \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} p.$$

By the Chinese remainder theorem, when  $i \neq j$  the set  $A_i^c \cap A_j^c$  contains all integers up to  $n$  in  $(p_i + 1)(p_j + 1)/4$  of the congruence classes modulo  $p_i p_j$ . Thus

$$|A_i^c \cap A_j^c| \leq \frac{n}{4} \left(1 + \frac{1}{p_i}\right) \left(1 + \frac{1}{p_j}\right) + p_i p_j,$$

and hence

$$4 \sum_{i \neq j} |A_i^c \cap A_j^c| \leq d(d-1)n + 2(d-1)n \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} \frac{1}{p} + n \sum_{p, q \in \mathcal{P}, p \neq q} \frac{1}{pq} + 4 \sum_{p, q \in \mathcal{P}, p \neq q} pq.$$

Hence by Lemma 3,

$$\begin{aligned} (d+1)^2 \Psi(n, B) &\leq (d+1)^2 n - 2d^2 n - 2dn \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} \frac{1}{p} + 4d \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} p \\ &\quad + d(d-1)n + 2(d-1)n \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} \frac{1}{p} + n \sum_{p, q \in \mathcal{P}, p \neq q} \frac{1}{pq} + 4 \sum_{p, q \in \mathcal{P}, p \neq q} pq \\ &\leq (d+1)n + 4d \sum_{p \in \mathcal{P}} p + n \sum_{p, q \in \mathcal{P}, p \neq q} \frac{1}{pq} + 4 \sum_{p, q \in \mathcal{P}, p \neq q} pq \end{aligned}$$

Note that  $n_p < p$ , and so each  $p \in \mathcal{P}$  is at least  $B$  and at most  $N$ . Hence

$$(d+1)^2 \Psi(n, B) \leq (d+1)n + 4d^2 N + \frac{nd^2}{B^2} + 4d^2 N^2.$$

We now fix  $n = N^3$ . Then, as  $d \leq N$ ,

$$(d+1)^2 \Psi(N^3, B) \leq (d+1)N^3 + 4N^3 + d^2 B^{-2} N^3 + 4dN^3,$$

and so  $(d+1)\Psi(N^3, B) \leq (5 + dB^{-2})N^3$  as required.  $\square$

**Corollary 5.** Fix  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Then there is a constant  $C_\varepsilon$  such that for all  $N$  there are at most  $C_\varepsilon$  primes  $p \leq N$  with  $n_p > N^\varepsilon$ .

*Proof.* Recall from Lemma 2 that  $\Psi(n, n^{1/u}) \geq c_u n$ . Take  $u = 3/\varepsilon$  and  $n = N^3$  so that  $\Psi(N^3, N^\varepsilon) \geq c_{3/\varepsilon} N^3$ . Hence, by Theorem 4, the number  $d$  of primes  $p \leq N$  with  $n_p > B = N^\varepsilon$  satisfies

$$d \left( \Psi(N^3, N^\varepsilon) - \frac{N^3}{N^{2\varepsilon}} \right) \leq 5N^3 - \Psi(N^3, N^\varepsilon).$$

Thus

$$d \leq \frac{5N^3}{\Psi(N^3, N^\varepsilon) - N^{3-2\varepsilon}} \leq \frac{5}{c_{3/\varepsilon} - N^{-2\varepsilon}},$$

which is bounded as  $N \rightarrow \infty$ . □

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The work of the first two authors was partially supported by NSF grant DMS 1600742, and work of the second author was also partially supported by MULTIPLEX grant 317532. The work of the fourth author was partially supported by CNPq (Proc. 303275/2013-8) and FAPERJ (Proc. 201.598/2014). The research in this paper was carried out while the third, fourth and fifth authors were visiting the University of Memphis.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] E. Bombieri, On the large sieve, *Mathematika*, **12** (1965), 201–225.
- [2] A.C. Cojocaru and M.R. Murty, An introduction to sieve methods and their applications, London Mathematical Society Student Texts, **66**, Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- [3] K. Dickman, On the frequency of numbers containing prime factors of a certain relative magnitude, *Ark. Mat. Astron. Fys.*, **22** (1930), 1–14.
- [4] J.B. Friedlander and H. Iwaniec, Opera de cribro, American Mathematical Society Colloquium Publications, vol. 57, American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 2010.
- [5] D. Goldfeld, The elementary proof of the prime number theorem: an historical perspective, In: Number Theory (Chudnovsky D., Chudnovsky G., Nathanson M., eds), pp. 179–192, Springer, New York, 2004.
- [6] U.V. Linnik, The large sieve, *C. R. (Doklady) Acad. Sci. URSS (N.S.)*, **30** (1941), 292–294.
- [7] U.V. Linnik, A remark on the least quadratic non-residue, *C. R. (Doklady) Acad. Sci. URSS (N.S.)*, **36** (1942), 119–120.
- [8] F. Mertens, Ein Beitrag zur analytischen Zahlentheorie, *J. Reine Angew. Math.*, **78** (1874), 46–62.
- [9] A. Rényi, On the representation of an even number as the sum of a single prime and a single almost-prime number, *Doklady Akad. Nauk SSSR (N.S.)*, **56** (1947), 455–458.
- [10] A. Rényi, Un nouveau théorème concernant les fonctions indépendantes et ses applications à la théorie des nombres, *J. Math. Pures Appl.*, **28** (1949), 137–149.
- [11] A. Rényi, On the large sieve of Ju.V. Linnik, *Compos. Math.*, **8** (1951), 68–75.
- [12] A. Rényi, New version of the probabilistic generalization of the large sieve, *Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hung.*, **10** (1959), 217–226.
- [13] K.F. Roth, On the large sieves of Linnik and Rényi, *Mathematika*, **12** (1965), 1–9.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES, UNIVERSITY OF MEMPHIS, MEMPHIS TN 38152, USA  
*E-mail address:* pbalistr@memphis.edu

DEPARTMENT OF PURE MATHEMATICS AND MATHEMATICAL STATISTICS, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE,  
WILBERFORCE ROAD, CAMBRIDGE CB3 0WB, UK; *and* DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES,  
UNIVERSITY OF MEMPHIS, MEMPHIS TN 38152, USA; *and* LONDON INSTITUTE FOR MATHEMATICAL  
SCIENCES, 35A SOUTH ST., MAYFAIR, LONDON W1K 2XF, UK  
*E-mail address:* b.bollobas@dpms.cam.ac.uk

MICROSOFT RESEARCH, REDMOND, USA  
*E-mail address:* jonatlee@microsoft.com

IMPA, ESTRADA DONA CASTORINA 110, JARDIM BOTÂNICO, RIO DE JANEIRO, RJ, BRAZIL  
*E-mail address:* rob@impa.br

MATHEMATICAL INSTITUTE, UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD, RADCLIFFE OBSERVATORY QUARTER, WOOD-  
STOCK ROAD, OXFORD OX2 6GG, UK  
*E-mail address:* riordan@maths.ox.ac.uk