
A NOTE ON ASYMPTOTICALLY GOOD EXTENSIONS IN WHICH INFINITELY MANY PRIMES SPLIT COMPLETELY

by

Oussama Hamza & Christian Maire

Abstract. — Let p be a prime number, and let K be a number field. For $p = 2$, assume moreover K totally imaginary. In this note we prove the existence of asymptotically good extensions L/K of cohomological dimension 2 in which infinitely many primes split completely. Our result is inspired by a recent work of Hajir, Maire, and Ramakrishna [7].

Let K be a number field, and let L/K be an infinite unramified extension. Denote by $\mathcal{S}_{L/K}$ the set of prime ideals of K that split completely in L/K . In [8] Ihara proved that $\sum_{\mathfrak{p} \in \mathcal{S}_{L/K}} \frac{\log N(\mathfrak{p})}{N(\mathfrak{p})} < \infty$, and raised the following interesting question: are there L/K for which $\mathcal{S}_{L/K}$ is infinite? This question was recently answered in the positive by Hajir, Maire, and Ramakrishna in [7]. In fact, infinite unramified extensions L/K are some special cases of infinite extensions for which the root discriminants $\text{rd}_F := |\text{Disc}_F|^{1/[F:\mathbb{Q}]}$ are bounded, where the number fields F vary in L/K , and Disc_F is the discriminant of F . Such extensions are called *asymptotically good*, and it is now well-known that in such extensions the inequality of Ihara involving $\mathcal{S}_{L/K}$ still holds (see for example [16], or [13] for the study of such extensions).

Pro- p extensions of number fields with restricted ramification allow us to exhibit asymptotically good extensions. Let p be a prime number, and let S be a finite set of prime ideals of K coprime to p (more precisely each $\mathfrak{p} \in S$ is such that $|\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{p}| \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$); the set S is called *tame*. Let K_S the maximal pro- p extension of K unramified outside S , put $G_S = \text{Gal}(K_S/K)$. In K_S/K the root discriminants are bounded by some constant depending on the discriminant of K and the norm of the places of S (see for example [6, Lemma 5]). Moreover thanks to Golod-Shafarevich criterion, it is well-known that K_S/K is infinite when $|S|$ is large as compared to $[K:\mathbb{Q}]$ (see for example [14, Chapter X, §10, Theorem 10.10.1]), and then asymptotically good. *E.g.* for $p > 2$, \mathbb{Q}_S/\mathbb{Q} is infinite when $|S| \geq 4$. In [7] the authors showed that when S is large, there exist infinite subextension

2000 Mathematics Subject Classification. — 11R37, 11R29.

Key words and phrases. — Pro- p extensions with restricted ramification, asymptotically good extensions, mild pro- p extensions.

The authors thank Farshid Hajir for useful comments, and Philippe Lebacque for his interest in this work. CM was partially supported by the ANR project FLAIR (ANR-17-CE40-0012), and by the EIPHI Graduate School (ANR-17-EURE-0002).

L/K of K_S/K for which the set $\mathcal{S}_{L/K}$ is infinite. But they give no information about the structure of $\text{Gal}(L/K)$. Here we prove:

Theorem A. — *Let p be a prime number, and let K be a number field. For $p = 2$ assume K totally imaginary. Let T and S_0 be two disjoint finite sets of prime ideals of K where S_0 is tame. Then for infinitely many finite sets S of tame prime ideals of K containing S_0 there exist an infinite pro- p extension L/K in K_S/K such that*

- (i) *the set $\mathcal{S}_{L/K}$ of places that split completely in L/K contains T ;*
- (ii) *the set $\mathcal{S}_{L/K}$ is infinite;*
- (iii) *the pro- p group $G = \text{Gal}(L/K)$ is of cohomological dimension 2;*
- (iv) *the minimal number of relations of G is infinite, i.e. $\dim H^2(G, \mathbb{F}_p) = \infty$;*
- (v) *for each $\mathfrak{p} \in S$, the local extension $L_{\mathfrak{p}}/K_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is maximal, i.e. isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z}_p \rtimes \mathbb{Z}_p$;*
- (vi) *the Poincaré series of the algebra $\mathbb{F}_p[[G]]$, endowed with the graduation from the ideal of augmentation, is equal to $(1 - dt + rt^2 + t^3 \sum_{n \geq 0} t^n)^{-1}$, where $d = \dim G_S$,*
and where r is explicit, depending on K, S, T .

Remark 1. — *We will see that the pro- p group G of Theorem A is mild in the terminology of Anick [2]. See also Labute [10] for arithmetic contexts.*

The proof uses various tools.

The first one is the strategy developed initially by Labute [10], then by Labute-Mináč [11], Schmidt [15], Forré [4] etc. for studying the cohomological dimension of a pro- p group G , through the notion of strongly free sets introduced by Anick [1]. By following the approach of Forré [4], we refine this idea when the minimal number of relations of G is infinite.

This key idea is associated to a result of Schmidt [15] that shows that the pro- p group G_S is of cohomological dimension 2 for some well-chosen S ; the proof of Schmidt involves the cup-product $H^1(G_S, \mathbb{F}_p) \cup H^1(G_S, \mathbb{F}_p)$. Here we use the translation of this cup-product in the polynomial algebra, due to Forré. In particular, this allows us to choose infinitely many Frobenius in G_S such that the family of the highest terms of these plus the highest terms of the relations of G_S , is combinatorially free (see §1.1.3 and Definition 1.2).

We conclude by cutting the tower K_S/K by all these Frobenius: this is the strategy of [7].

This note contains two sections. In §1 we recall the results we need regarding pro- p groups, graded algebras, and arithmetic of pro- p extensions with restricted ramification. In §2 we start with an example when $K = \mathbb{Q}$, and prove the main result.

Notations.

Let p be a prime number.

- If V is a \mathbb{F}_p -vector space we denote by $\dim V$ its dimension over \mathbb{F}_p .
- For a pro- p group G , we denote by $H^i(G)$ the cohomology group $H^i(G, \mathbb{F}_p)$. The p -rank of G , which is equal to $\dim H^1(G)$, is noted $d_p G$.

1. The results we need

1.1. On pro- p groups. — For this section we refer to [3], [9, Chapters 5,6 and 7], and [4]. Take a prime number p .

1.1.1. *Minimal presentation and cohomological dimension.* — Let G be a pro- p group of finite rank d , and let $1 \rightarrow R \rightarrow F \rightarrow G \rightarrow 1$ be a minimal presentation of G by a free pro- p group F . Let $\mathcal{F} := \{\rho_i\}_{i \in I}$ be an \mathbb{F}_p -basis of $R/R^p[F, R]$; observe that I is not necessarily finite. The algebra $\Lambda_G := \mathbb{F}_p[[G]]$ acts on $R/R^p[R, R]$, and by Nakayama's lemma the ρ_i 's generate topologically $R/R^p[R, R]$ as Λ_G -module (see for example [3, Corollary 1.5]).

Let us recall the definition of the cohomological dimension $\text{cd}(G)$ of G : it is the smallest integer n (eventually $n = \infty$) such that $H^i(G) = 0$ for every $i \geq n + 1$.

Theorem 1.1. — *The following assertions are equivalent:*

- (i) $\text{cd}(G) \leq 2$;
- (ii) $R/R^p[R, R]$ is a free compact Λ_G -module;
- (iii) $R/R^p[R, R] \simeq \prod_I \Lambda_G$.

Moreover, $\dim H^2(G) = |I|$.

Proof. — See [3, Corollary 5.3] or [9, Chapter 7, §7.3, Theorem 7.7]. □

We are going to translate conditions of Theorem 1.1 in the algebra $\mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[[X_1, \dots, X_d]]$.

1.1.2. *Filtred and graded algebras.* — The results of this section can be found in [1].

• Let

$$E = \mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[[X_1, \dots, X_d]]$$

be the algebra of noncommutative series in X_1, \dots, X_d with coefficients in \mathbb{F}_p . We consider now noncommutative multi-indices $\alpha = (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_n)$, with $\alpha_i \in \{1, \dots, d\}$, and we denote by X_α the monomial element of the form $X_\alpha = X_{\alpha_1} \cdots X_{\alpha_n}$. We endow each X_i with the degree 1; the degree $\deg(X_\alpha)$ of X_α is $|\alpha|$.

For $Z = \sum_{\alpha} a_{\alpha} X_{\alpha}$, the quantity $\omega(Z) = \min_{a_{\alpha} \neq 0} \{\deg(X_{\alpha})\}$ is the valuation of Z , with the convention that $\omega(0) = \infty$. For $n \geq 0$, put $E_n = \{Z \in E, \omega(Z) \geq n\}$. Observe that E_1 is the augmentation ideal of E : this is the two-sided ideal of E topologically generated by the X_i 's. The algebra E is filtered by the E_n 's and its graded algebra $\text{Grad}(E)$ is then:

$$\text{Grad}(E) = \bigoplus_{n \in \mathbb{Z}_{\geq 0}} E_n/E_{n+1} \simeq \mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[X_1, \dots, X_d].$$

In other words $\text{Grad}(E)$ is isomorphic to the noncommutative polynomial algebra $A := \mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[X_1, \dots, X_d]$, where each X_i is endowed with the formal degree 1. Let $A_n = \{z \in A, \omega(z) \geq n\}$ be the gradation of A ; observe that A_1 is the augmentation ideal of A .

• Let $X_{\alpha}, X_{\alpha'}$ be two monomials (viewed in E or in A). The element X_{α} is a *submonomial* of $X_{\alpha'}$, if $X_{\alpha'} = X_{\beta} X_{\alpha} X_{\beta'}$, with $X_{\beta}, X_{\beta'}$ two monomials of A .

Definition 1.2. — A family $\mathcal{F} = \{X_{\alpha^{(i)}}\}_{i \in I}$ of monomials of A is combinatorially free if for all $i \neq j$:

- (i) $X_{\alpha^{(i)}}$ is not a submonomial of $X_{\alpha^{(j)}}$,
- (ii) if $X_{\alpha^{(i)}} = X_{\alpha} X_{\beta}$ and $X_{\alpha^{(j)}} = X_{\alpha'} X_{\beta'}$, then $X_{\alpha} \neq X_{\alpha'}$, with $X_{\alpha}, X_{\beta}, X_{\alpha'}, X_{\beta'}$ non-trivial monomials, *i.e.* $\neq 1$.

The monomials may be endowed with a total order $<$ as follows.

First let us consider the natural ordering $<'$ defined by: $X_1 <' X_2 <' \cdots <' X_d$.

Let X_α and X_β two monomials, we say that $X_\alpha > X_\beta$, if $\omega(X_\alpha) < \omega(X_\beta)$; if X_α and X_β have the same valuation, we use the lexicographic order induced by $<'$.

Now, let $Z = \sum_\alpha a_\alpha X_\alpha$ be a nonzero element of E , with $a_\alpha \in \mathbb{F}_p$. Then $\widehat{Z} := \max\{X_\alpha, a_\alpha \neq 0\}$ is the *highest term* respecting the order $<$.

• Let $\mathcal{F} := \{Z_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a locally finite graded subset of A_1 generating C as two-sided A -ideal: $C = A\mathcal{F}A$. Observe that I is countable. Let $B := A/C$ be the quotient endowed with the quotient gradation; we denote by $P_B(t) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}_{\geq 0}} \dim(B_n/B_{n+1}) \cdot t^n$ the Poincaré series of B . Observe that the family \mathcal{F} generates the B -module C/CA_1 .

Theorem 1.3 (Anick). — *Let $\mathcal{F} = \{Z_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a locally finite graded subset of A_1 , and let C be a two-sided ideal of A generated by the Z_i 's; put $B = A/C$. For each i , let $X_{\alpha(i)} := \widehat{Z}_i$ be the highest term of Z_i . If the family $\{X_{\alpha(i)}\}_{i \in I}$ is combinatorially free, then*

- (i) C/CA_1 is a free B -module over the Z_i 's, and
- (ii) $P_B(t) = (1 - dt + \sum_{i \in I} t^{n_i})^{-1}$, where $n_i = \omega(Z_i) = \omega(X_{\alpha(i)})$.

Proof. — See [1, Theorems 2.6 and 3.2]. □

If C/CA_1 is a free B -module over the Z_i 's, we say that the family $\mathcal{F} = \{Z_i\}_{i \in I}$ is *strongly free* (see [1]).

Example 1.4. — Take $d = 5$, and the lexicographic ordering $X_1 < X_2 < \dots < X_5$. Let $a_n \geq 1$ be an increasing sequence, $n \geq 1$, and consider the family $\mathcal{F} = \{X_5 X_3, X_4 X_2, X_4 X_3, X_5 X_2, X_5 X_1, X_5 X_4^{a_n} X_1, n \geq 1\}$. Put $B = A/A\mathcal{F}A$. Then \mathcal{F} is combinatorially free, and $P_B(t) = (1 - 5t + t^2 \sum_{n \geq 1} t^{a_n})^{-1}$.

1.1.3. Pro- p groups of cohomological dimension ≤ 2 and polynomial algebra. — Let us conserve the notations of §1.1.1.

Let F be a free pro- p group on d generators x_1, \dots, x_d . Let $\Lambda_F := \mathbb{F}_p[[F]]$ be the complete algebra associated to F . Recall that $\mathbb{F}_p[[F]]$ is isomorphic to the Magnus algebra $E = \mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[[X_1, \dots, X_d]]$; this isomorphism φ is given by $x_i \mapsto X_i + 1$ (see for example [9, Chapter 7, §7.6, Theorem 7.16]).

Let us endow E with the filtration and the ordering of §1.1.2. The filtered isomorphism $\varphi : \Lambda_F \xrightarrow{\cong} E$ allows us to endow Λ_F with the valuation ω_F defined as follows: $\omega_F(z) = \omega(\varphi(z))$. Observe that $E_1 \simeq I_F : \ker(\Lambda_F \rightarrow \mathbb{F}_p)$, that is E_1 is isomorphic to the augmentation ideal of Λ_F .

Take $x \in F$, $x \neq 1$. Then the degree $\deg(x)$ of x is defined as $\deg(x) := \omega_F(x - 1) = \omega(\varphi(x - 1))$. We denote by \widehat{x} the highest term of $\varphi(x - 1) \in E$. Hence \widehat{x} is a monomial.

Example 1.5. — Take $d \geq 3$ with the lexicographic ordering $X_1 < X_2 < X_3 < \dots < X_d$.

- (i) The highest term of $[x_1, [x_2^{p^n}, x_3]]$ is $X_3 X_2^{p^n} X_1$.
- (ii) Given $x, y \in F$, let us write $f_x(y) = [x, y] \in F$. Then the highest term of $f_{x_1} \circ f_{x_2}^n(x_3)$ is $X_3 X_2^n X_1$.

Let G be a pro- p group of p -rank d , and let $1 \rightarrow R \rightarrow F \rightarrow G \rightarrow 1$ be a minimal presentation of G by F ; this induces a filtered morphism $\theta : \Lambda_F \rightarrow \Lambda_G$. We now endow Λ_G with the induced valuation ω_G of ω_F as follows: for $z \in \Lambda_G$, let us define

$$\omega_G(z) = \max\{\omega_F(z'), z' \in \Lambda_F, \theta(z') = z\}.$$

Put $E_{G,n} = \{z \in \Lambda_G, \omega_G(z) \geq n\}$, the filtration of Λ_G . Then $\text{Grad}(\Lambda_G) = \bigoplus_n E_{G,n}/E_{G,n+1}$ is the graded algebra of $\mathbb{F}_p[[G]]$ respecting the quotient gradation with $P_G(t) = \sum_{n \geq 0} \dim E_{G,n}/E_{G,n+1} \cdot t^n$ as Poincaré series.

For $n \geq 1$, put $F_n := \{x \in F, \varphi(x-1) \in E_n\}$, and $G_n = F_n R/R$. The sequences (F_n) and (G_n) are the Zassenhaus filtrations of F and G . The filtration $(E_{G,n})$ corresponds also to the filtration coming from the augmentation ideal of Λ_G (see for example [12, Appendice A.3, Théorème 3.5]).

Theorem 1.6. — *Let $\mathcal{F} = \{\rho_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a family of generators $R/R^p[[R, R]]$. For each $i \in I$, let $X_{\alpha(i)} = \{\hat{\rho}_i\}_{i \in I} \in A$ be the highest term of ρ_i . If $\{X_{\alpha(i)}\}_{i \in I}$ is combinatorially free, then*

$$(i) \ R/R^p[[R, R]] \simeq \prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G, \text{ and } \text{cd}(G) \leq 2;$$

$$(ii) \ P_G(t) = \left(1 - dt + \sum_{i \in I} t^{n_i}\right)^{-1}, \text{ where } d = d_p G, \text{ and } n_i = \deg(\rho_i) = \omega(X_{\alpha(i)}).$$

Proof. — When the set of indexes I is finite, this version can be found in [4]. We show here that the result also holds when I is infinite. First, observe that as $\{X_{\alpha(i)}\}_{i \in I}$ is combinatorially free then I is countable infinite.

For $i \in I$, put $Y_i = \varphi(\rho_i - 1) \in E_1$; $n_i = \omega(Y_i)$. Let $I(R) \subset E_1$ be the closed two-sided ideal of E_1 topologically generated by the Y_i 's, $i \in I$; one has $\ker(\theta) \simeq I(R)$ (see for example [9, Chapter 7, §7.6, Theorem 7.17]). Let us recall now the topological G -isomorphism between $R/R^p[[R, R]]$ and $I(R)/I(R)E_1$ (see for example [4, Proposition 4.3]). We want to some informations on the G -module $R/R^p[[R, R]]$, and then on $I(R)/I(R)E_1$.

For $i \in I$, let $Z_i \in A$ be the initial form of $Y_i \in E_1$ defined as follows: let us write $Y_i = Z_{i,n_i} + Z_{i,n_i+1} + \dots$, where $n_i = \omega(Y_i)$ and where $Z_{i,j}$ are homogeneous polynomial of degree j (eventually $Z_{i,j} = 0$); then put $Z_i = Z_{i,n_i}$. Observe that $\hat{\rho}_i = \hat{Y}_i = \hat{Z}_i$.

Let C be the closed ideal of $A = \mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[X_1, \dots, X_d]$ generated by the family $\{Z_i\}_{i \in I}$. As the family $\{\hat{\rho}_i\}_{i \in I}$ is combinatorially free then by Theorem 1.3 the family $\{Z_i\}_{i \in I}$ is strongly free. Put $B = A/C$.

Proposition 1.7. — *One has $C = \text{Grad}(I(R)) \subset A$. In particular, as graded A -modules, one gets $\text{Grad}(\Lambda_G) \simeq B$, and*

$$\text{Grad}(I(R)/I(R)E_1) \simeq C/CA_1 \simeq \bigoplus_{i \in I} BZ_i \simeq \bigoplus_{i \in I} B[n_i],$$

where $B[n_i]$ means B as A -module with an n_i -shift filtration.

Proof. — This is only a slightly generalization of the case I finite; see proof of [4, Theorem 3.7]. \square

Then by Theorem 1.3 and Proposition 1.7 we firstly get

$$P_G(t) = P_B(t) = \left(1 - dt + \sum_{i \in I} t^{n_i}\right)^{-1}.$$

Consider now the continuous morphism

$$\Psi : \prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G \rightarrow I(R)/I(R)E_1 \simeq R/R^p[[R, R]],$$

sendind (a_i) to $\sum_i a_i Y_i \pmod{I(\mathbb{R})E_1}$; as $n_i \rightarrow \infty$ with i , it is well-defined. Remember that $\Lambda_G \simeq E/I(\mathbb{R})$. Put $N = \ker(\Psi)$.

Lemma 1.8. — *The map Ψ is surjective.*

Proof. — Put $W = \{\sum_{i \in I} a_i Y_i, a_i \in E\} \subset I(\mathbb{R})$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} I(\mathbb{R}) &= WE \\ &= W\mathbb{F}_p + EWE_1 = W + WE_1. \end{aligned}$$

We conclude by observing that $WE_1 \subset I(\mathbb{R})E_1$. □

Therefore one gets a sequence of filtered G -modules:

$$1 \rightarrow N \rightarrow \prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G[n_i] \xrightarrow{\Psi} I(\mathbb{R})/I(\mathbb{R})E_1 \rightarrow 1.$$

This one induces the following sequence of graded A -modules:

$$0 \rightarrow \text{Grad}(N) \rightarrow \text{Grad}\left(\prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G[n_i]\right) \rightarrow \text{Grad}(I(\mathbb{R})/I(\mathbb{R})E_1) \rightarrow 0.$$

For the surjectivity, use the fact that I is countable. Now as $n_i \rightarrow \infty$ with i , then

$$\text{Grad}\left(\prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G[n_i]\right) = \text{Grad}\left(\bigoplus_{i \in I} \Lambda_G[n_i]\right) \simeq \bigoplus_{i \in I} B[n_i].$$

By Proposition 1.7, we finally get that Ψ induces an isomorphism between $\text{Grad}\left(\prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G[n_i]\right)$ and $\text{Grad}(I(\mathbb{R})/I(\mathbb{R})E_1)$, which implies $\text{Grad}(N) = 0$, then $N = 0$. Hence, as G -modules, $\prod_{i \in I} \Lambda_G \simeq I(\mathbb{R})/I(\mathbb{R})E_1 \simeq R/R^p[\mathbb{R}, \mathbb{R}]$, and we conclude with Theorem 1.1. □

Remark 1.9. — Conclusions of Theorem 1.6 also hold if $\{\widehat{\rho}_i\}_{i \in I}$ is strongly free.

Remark 1.10. — For references on graded and filtered modules, see also [12, Chapter I and II].

1.1.4. Cup-products and cohomological dimension. — Here we suppose now $p > 2$.

Let G be a pro- p group of p -rank d which is not pro- p free. Recall that the cup product sends $H^1(G) \otimes H^1(G)$ to $H^2(G)$. Labute in [10] gave a criterion involving cup-products so that $\text{cd}(G) = 2$. This point of view has been developped by Forré in [4]. Let us recall it.

Theorem 1.11 (Forré). — *Let $p > 2$ be a prime number. Let G be a finitely presented pro- p group which is not pro- p free. Suppose that $H^1(G) = U \oplus V$ such that $U \cup U = 0$ and $U \cup V = H^2(G)$. Put $c = \dim V$. Then $\text{cd}(G) = 2$, and G can be described by some relations ρ_1, \dots, ρ_r such that the highest term of each ρ_i can be written as $X_{t(i)}X_{s(i)}$ for some $s(i), t(i)$ such that $s(i) \leq c < t(i)$, and such that $(s(i), t(i)) \neq (s(j), t(j))$ for $i \neq j$.*

Proof. — See the proof of [4, Theorem 6.4, Corollary 6.6] with the choice of the ordering $X_1 < X_2 < \dots < X_d$. □

Remark 1.12. — Observe that the family $\{X_{s(i)}X_{t(i)}\}_i$ of Theorem 1.11 is combinatorially free.

Before to present a corollary, let us make the following observation: given $n \geq 1$, thanks to Example 1.5, one may find some $x \in F$ such that the highest term of x is like $X_k X_j^n X_i$ for $i < j < k$.

Corollary 1.13. — *Consider the situation of Theorem 1.11. Suppose $c \geq 2$. For some fixed $1 < i_0 \leq c < j_0 \leq d$, and $n \geq 1$, let $x_n \in F$ of highest term $X_{j_0} X_{i_0}^n X_1$. Suppose moreover that $r < (d - c)(c - 1)$. Then there exists (i_0, j_0) such that the family $\{\widehat{\rho}_1, \dots, \widehat{\rho}_r, \widehat{x}_n, n \geq 1\}$ is combinatorially free. In particular for such (i_0, j_0) :*

- (i) the group quotient $\Gamma := F / \langle \rho, \dots, \rho_r, x_n, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle^{\text{Nor}}$ of G is of cohomological dimension 2;
- (ii) $\dim H^2(\Gamma, \mathbb{F}_p) = \infty$;
- (iii) The Poincaré series of Λ_Γ is $(1 - dt + rt^2 + t^3 \sum_{n \geq 0} t^n)^{-1}$.

Proof. — Thanks to Theorem 1.11, for $i = 1, \dots, r$, the highest term of ρ_i is of the form $X_{t(i)} X_{s(i)}$ for some $s(i) \leq c < t(i)$, and the family $\mathcal{E} := \{X_{t(1)} X_{s(1)}, \dots, X_{t(r)} X_{s(r)}\}$ is combinatorially free. Now, as $r < (d - c)(c - 1)$ and $c \geq 2$, we can find (i_0, j_0) such that $X_{j_0} X_{i_0}$ is not in \mathcal{E} , and then $\mathcal{E} \cup \{X_{j_0} X_{i_0}^n X_1, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}\}$ is combinatorially free. Then apply Theorem 1.6. \square

Remark 1.14. — In fact $r \leq (d - c)c - 2$ is sufficient. Indeed, with such condition one has $X_{j_0} X_{i_0} \notin \mathcal{E}$ for some $(i_0, j_0) \neq (1, r)$, $i_0 \leq c < j_0 \leq r$. Hence, if $i_0 \neq 1$ the family $\mathcal{E} \cup \{X_{j_0} X_{i_0}^n X_1, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}\}$ is combinatorially free. Otherwise $j_0 \neq r$, and take $\mathcal{E} \cup \{X_r X_{j_0}^n X_{i_0}, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}\}$.

1.2. Arithmetic backgrounds. — Let p be a prime number, and let K be a number field. For $p = 2$, assume K totally imaginary. Let S and T two disjoint finite sets of prime ideals of the ring of integers \mathcal{O}_K of K . We assume moreover that each $\mathfrak{p} \in S$ is such that $|\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{p}| \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$; the set S is called tame. We denote by $\text{Cl}_K^T(p)$ the p -Sylow of the T -class group of K .

Let K_S^T/K be the maximal pro- p extension of K unramified outside S and where each $\mathfrak{p} \in T$ splits completely in K_S/K ; put $G_S^T = \text{Gal}(K_S^T/K)$. As we recalled it in Introduction, when G_S^T is infinite, the extension K_S^T/K is asymptotically good. Recall Shafarevich's formula (see for example [5, Chapter I, §, Theorem 4.6]):

$$d_p G_S^T = |S| - (r_1 + r_2) - 1 - |T| + \delta_{K,p} + d_p V_S^T/K^{\times p},$$

where

$$V_S^T = \{x \in K^\times, x \in K_{\mathfrak{p}}^p U_{\mathfrak{p}} \ \forall x \notin S \cup T, x \in K_{\mathfrak{p}}^p \ \forall \mathfrak{p} \in S\},$$

and where $\delta_{K,p} = 1$ if K contains μ_p (the p -roots of 1), 0 otherwise. Here as usual, $K_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is the completion of K at \mathfrak{p} , and $U_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is the group of the local units at \mathfrak{p} . Observe that if there is no p -extension of $K(\mu_p)$ unramified outside T and p in which each prime of S splits completely, then $V_S^T/K^{\times p}$ is trivial: this is a Chebotarev condition type.

Schmidt in [15] showed that G_S^T may be *mild* following the terminology of Labute [10]. More precisely, he proved:

Theorem 1.15 (Schmidt). — *Let K be a number field and let p be a prime number. For $p = 2$ suppose K totally imaginary. Let S_0 and T two disjoint finite sets of prime ideals of K with S_0 tame. Assume T sufficiently large such that $\text{Cl}_K^T(p)$ is trivial; when $\mu_p \subset K$, assume moreover that T contains all prime ideals above p . Then there exist*

infinitely finite tame sets S containing S_0 such that $H^1(G_S^T) = U \oplus V$ where the two subspaces U and V satisfy: (i) $U \cap U = 0$; (ii) $U \cup V = H^2(G_S^T)$. Moreover, for such S and T one has $\dim H^2(G_S^T) = \dim H^1(G_S^T) + r_1 + r_2 + |T| - 1$.

Theorem 1.15 is not presented in this form in [15], here we give the form we need: the result presented here can be found in the proof of Theorem 6.1 of [15].

At this level, let us compute the value of $c = \dim V$ of Theorem 1.15, following [15]. When $\mu_p \not\subset K$ let us choose first a finite set S_0 of prime ideals of K , tame and disjoint from T , such that for every $\mathfrak{p} \in S_0$, one has

$$d_p G_{S_0 \setminus \{\mathfrak{p}\}}^T = |S_0| - r_1 - r_2 - |T| + \delta_{K,p},$$

which is equivalent by Shafarevich's formula to the triviality of $V_{S_0 \setminus \{\mathfrak{p}\}}^T / K^{\times p}$.

When $\mu_p \subset K$ let us choose S_0 , finite, tame and disjoint from T , such that the set of the Frobenius at \mathfrak{p} in G_T^{p-el} when \mathfrak{p} varies in S_0 , corresponds to the nontrivial elements of G_T^{p-el} , where G_T^{p-el} is the Galois group of the p -elementary abelian extension K_T^{p-el}/K of K_T/K . Here one has also the triviality of $V_{S_0 \setminus \{\mathfrak{p}\}}^T / K^{\times p}$.

The set S of Theorem 1.15 contains S_0 , and is of size $2|S_0|$; the prime ideals $\mathfrak{p} \in S - S_0$ are chosen by respecting some global conditions, thanks to Chebotarev density theorem. Moreover $U = H^1(G_{S_0}^T, \mathbb{F}_p)$, and the subspace V is such that $\dim V = c = |S_0|$. See [15, Proof of Theorem 6.1] for more details.

Now observe the following:

Lemma 1.16. — *Above the previous conditions, each prime $\mathfrak{p} \in S$ is ramified in the p -elementary abelian extension $K_S^{T,p-el}/K$ of K_S^T/K .*

Proof. — Observe first that if $S'' \subset S'$, then $V_{S'}^T / K^{\times p} \hookrightarrow V_{S''}^T / K^{\times p}$.

Hence thanks to the choice of S_0 , it is not difficult to see the following: for every $\mathfrak{p} \in S$, $V_{S \setminus \{\mathfrak{p}\}}^T / K^{\times p}$ is trivial. Then by Shafarevich's formula, we get that

$$d_p G_S^T = 1 + d_p G_{S \setminus \{\mathfrak{p}\}}^T,$$

showing that \mathfrak{p} is ramified in $K_S^{T,p-el}/K$. □

Put $\alpha_{K,T} = 3 + 2\sqrt{2 + r_1 + r_2 + |T|}$. In Theorem 1.15 one may take S sufficiently large so that $d = \dim H^1(G_S^T, \mathbb{F}_p) > \alpha_{K,T}$.

Lemma 1.17. — *If $d > \alpha_{K,T}$, then $d + r_1 + r_2 + |T| - 1 < (d - c)(c - 1)$ for every $c \in [2, d]$.*

Proof. — Easy computation. □

Let us finish this part with an obvious observation thanks to class field theory.

Remark 1.18. — If G_S^T is not trivial and of cohomological dimension at most 2, then $\text{cd}(G_S^T) = 2$.

2. Example and proof

2.1. Example. — • Take $p > 2$, and $K = \mathbb{Q}$. In this case the relations of the pro- p groups G_S are all local, and then not difficult to describe: this is the description due to Koch [9, Chapter 11, §11.4, Example 11.11].

Let ℓ be a prime number such that $p \mid \ell - 1$. Denote by \mathbb{Q}_ℓ the (unique) cyclic degree p -extension of \mathbb{Q} unramified outside ℓ ; the extension $\mathbb{Q}_\ell/\mathbb{Q}$ is totally ramified at ℓ .

Let $S = \{\ell_1, \dots, \ell_d\}$ be d different prime numbers such that p divides each $\ell_i - 1$. The pro- p group G_S can be described by x_1, \dots, x_d generators, and ρ_1, \dots, ρ_d relations verifying:

$$(1) \quad \rho_i = \prod_{j \neq i} [x_i, x_j]^{a_j(i)} \text{ mod } F_3,$$

where $a_j(i) \in \mathbb{Z}/p\mathbb{Z}$; moreover the element x_i can be chosen such that it is a generator of the inertia group of ℓ_i . The element $a_j(i)$ is zero if and only the prime ℓ_i splits in $\mathbb{Q}_{\ell_j}/\mathbb{Q}$, which is equivalent to

$$\ell_i^{(\ell_j-1)/p} \equiv 1 \pmod{\ell_j}.$$

• Typically take $p = 3$, and $S_0 = \{7, 13\}$, $T = \emptyset$. Then put $S = \{p_1, p_2, p_3, p_4, p_5\}$ with $p_1 = 31, p_2 = 19, p_3 = 13, p_4 = 337, p_5 = 7$. Then the highest terms of the relations (1), viewed in $\mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[X_1, \dots, X_5]$, are $\hat{\rho}_1 = X_1 X_3$, $\hat{\rho}_2 = X_2 X_4$, $\hat{\rho}_3 = X_2 X_3$, $\hat{\rho}_4 = X_1 X_4$, $\hat{\rho}_5 = X_1 X_5$. Hence as the $\hat{\rho}_i$'s are combinatorially free, then G_S is of cohomological dimension 2 by Theorem 1.6.

Now for each $n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}$, let us choose a prime number p_n of \mathbb{Z} such that the highest term in $\mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[X_1, \dots, X_5]$ of its Frobenius $\sigma_n \in G_S$ is like $X_5 X_4^n X_1$ (which is possible by Example 1.5 or Corollary 1.13, see next section). Then consider the maximal Galois subextension L/\mathbb{Q} of \mathbb{Q}_S/\mathbb{Q} fixed by all the conjugates of the τ_n 's (this is the “cutting towers” strategy of [7]). Put $G = \text{Gal}(L/\mathbb{Q})$. Then the pro-3 group G can be described by the generators x_1, \dots, x_5 , and the relations $\{\rho_1, \dots, \rho_5, \tau_n, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}\}$ (which is not *a priori* a minimal set). By construction all the p_n split totally in L/\mathbb{Q} . Observe now that

$$\{\hat{\rho}_1, \dots, \hat{\rho}_5, \hat{\tau}_n, n \geq 1\} = \{X_5 X_1, X_5 X_2, X_4 X_3, X_4 X_2, X_5 X_3, X_5 X_4^n X_1, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}\},$$

which is combinatorially free. By Theorem 1.6 the pro-3-group G is of cohomological dimension 2, $H^2(G)$ is infinite, and $\mathbb{F}_3[[G]]$ has $(1 - 5t + 5t^2 + t^3(1 + t + t^2 + \dots))^{-1}$ as Poincaré series.

2.2. Proof of the main result. — • Let $p > 2$ be a prime number, and let K be a number field. Let S_0 and T two finite disjoint sets of prime ideals of K , where S_0 is tame. Take T sufficiently large such that $\text{Cl}_K^T(p)$ is trivial. When K contains μ_p , assume moreover that T contains all p -adic prime ideals.

First take S containing S_0 as in Theorem 1.15, and sufficiently large such that $d > \alpha_{K,T}$. Put $G = G_S^T$. Here $r = \dim H^2(G) = d + r_1 + r_2 - 1 + |T|$.

Let us start with a minimal presentation of G :

$$1 \longrightarrow R \longrightarrow F \xrightarrow{\varphi} G \longrightarrow 1.$$

By Theorem 1.15 and Theorem 1.11 the quotient $R/R^p[F, R]$ may be generated as \mathbb{F}_p -vector spaces by some relations ρ_1, \dots, ρ_r such that the highest terms $\hat{\rho}_k$ are like $X_i X_j$ for some $i \leq c < j$, where $c = \dim V$. Observe that as G is FAb then $c \in [2, d - 2]$.

Given $n \geq 1$, then the quotient G/G_{n+1} is finite. Put $K_{(n+1)} = (K_S^T)^{G_{n+1}}$. Let $a_n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0}$ be an increasing sequence. Let $x_n \in F_{a_n} \setminus F_{a_{n+1}}$. By Chebotarev density theorem there exists some prime ideal $\mathfrak{p}_n \subset \mathcal{O}_K$ such that $\sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}$ is conjugate to x_n in $\text{Gal}(K_{(a_{n+1})}/K)$. Here $\sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n} \in G$ denotes the Frobenius of \mathfrak{p}_n in K_S^T/K . Now take $z_n \in F$ such that $\varphi(z_n) = \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}$. Hence

$$z_n \equiv \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n} \pmod{\text{RF}_{a_{n+1}}}.$$

In other words, there exists $y_n \in F_{a_{n+1}}$ and $r_n \in R$ such that $z_n = \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n} y_n r_n$.

Let $\Sigma = T \cup \{\mathfrak{p}_1, \mathfrak{p}_2, \dots\}$, and consider K_S^Σ the maximal pro- p extension of K unramified outside S and where each prime \mathfrak{p}_i of Σ splits completely. Put $G_S^\Sigma = \text{Gal}(K_S^\Sigma/K)$. Then

$$G_S^\Sigma \simeq G / \langle \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle^{\text{Nor}}.$$

Here $\langle \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle^{\text{Nor}}$ is the normal closure of $\langle \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle$ in G_S^Σ . Hence K_S^Σ satisfies (i) and (ii) of Theorem A. But observe now that

$$G / \langle \sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle^{\text{Nor}} \simeq F / \langle \rho_1, \dots, \rho_r, z_n, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle^{\text{Nor}} = F / \langle \rho_1, \dots, \rho_r, x_n y_n, n \in \mathbb{Z}_{>0} \rangle^{\text{Nor}},$$

as $\sigma_{\mathfrak{p}_n}$ and x_n are conjugate.

Since the highest term of each $x_n y_n$ in $E = \mathbb{F}_p^{nc}[[X_1, \dots, X_d]]$ is the same as the highest term of x_n , it suffices to choose the x_n 's as in Corollary 1.13 which is possible: indeed as $d > \alpha_{K,T}$ then by Lemma 1.17 $r < (c-1)(d-c)$, for every $c \in [1, d-1]$. Thanks to Corollary 1.13, one gets (iii), (iv), and (v) of Theorem A.

(v): by Lemma 1.16 each prime ideal $\mathfrak{p} \in S$ is ramified in $K_S^{T,p-el}/K$, showing that $\tau_{\mathfrak{p}} \in G$ is not in $\text{RF}^p[F, F]$, where $\tau_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is a generator of the inertia group at \mathfrak{p} in G . As the p -rank of G_S^Σ is the same as the p -rank of G , each prime $\mathfrak{p} \in S$ is ramified in K_S^Σ . But as G is without torsion (because $\text{cd}(G) = 2$), necessarily $\langle \tau_{\mathfrak{p}} \rangle \simeq \mathbb{Z}_p$, and the structure of local extensions forces $(K_S^\Sigma)_{\mathfrak{p}}/K_{\mathfrak{p}}$ to be maximal.

- Assume $p = 2$, and K be totally imaginary. Then Theorem 1.15 holds, but Theorem 1.11 does not. As explained by Forré in [4, Proof Theorem 6.4], one has to take two orderings to show that the highest terms of the relations ρ_1, \dots, ρ_r are strongly free. Now in this context the strategy of the approximation of elements x_n by some Frobenius as in Corollary 1.13 also applies. Then by following the proof of Theorem 6.4 in [4], and by choosing the x_n 's as in the case $p \neq 2$, we observe that the initial forms of the new relations $\{\rho_1, \dots, \rho_r, x_n, n \geq 1\}$ are still strongly free. We conclude by using Remark 1.9 of Theorem 1.6. □

References

- [1] D. J. Anick, *Non-commutative graded algebras and their Hilbert series*, J. of Algebra **78** n1 (1982), 120-140.
- [2] D. J. Anick, *Inert sets and the Lie algebra associated to a group*, J. Algebra **111** (1987), 154-165.
- [3] A. Brumer, *Pseudocompact algebras, profinite groups and class formations*, J. of Algebra **4** (1966), 442-470
- [4] P. Forré, *Strongly free sequences and pro- p -groups of cohomological dimension 2*, J. reine u. angew. Math **658** (2011), 173-192.

- [5] G. Gras, *Class Field Theory, From Theory to practice*, corr. 2nd ed., Springer Monographs in Mathematics, Springer (2005), xiii+507 pages.
- [6] F. Hajir, C. Maire, *Tamely ramified towers and discriminant bounds for number fields*, *Compositio Math.* **128** (2001), 35-53.
- [7] F. Hajir, C. Maire, R. Ramakrishna, *Cutting towers of number fields*, 2019, arXiv:1901.04354.
- [8] Y. Ihara, *How many primes decompose completely in an infinite unramified Galois extension of a global field ?*, *J. Math. Soc. Japon* **35** (1983), no4, 693-709.
- [9] H. Koch, *Galois Theory of p -Extensions*, Springer Monographs in Mathematics, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 2002.
- [10] J. Labute, *Mild pro- p -groups and Galois groups of p -extensions of \mathbb{Q}* , *J. reine u. angew. Math.* **596** (2006), 155–182.
- [11] J. Labute, J. Mináč, *Mild pro-2-groups and 2-extensions of \mathbb{Q} with restricted ramification*, *J. Algebra* **332** (2011), 136–158.
- [12] M. Lazard, *Groupes analytiques p -adiques*, *IHES Publ. Math.* **26** (1965), 389-603.
- [13] P. Lebacque, *Quelques résultats effectifs concernant les invariants de Tsfasman-Vladut*, *Ann. Inst. Fourier* **65** (2015), no. 1, 63–99.
- [14] J. Neukirch, A. Schmidt and K. Wingberg, *Cohomology of Number Fields*, GMW 323, Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, 2000.
- [15] A. Schmidt, *Über Pro- p -Fundamentalgruppen markierter arithmetischer Kurven*, *J. reine u. angew. Math.* **640** (2010), 203-235.
- [16] M. Tsfasman and S. Vladut, *Infinite global fields and the generalized Brauer-Siegel theorem. Dedicated to Yuri I. Manin on the occasion of his 65th birthday*, *Mosc. Math. J.* **2** (2002), no 2, 329-402.

October 31, 2021

OUSSAMA HAMZA, Ecole Normale Supérieure de Lyon, Université de Lyon, 15 parvis René Descartes, 69342 Lyon Cedex 07, France • *E-mail* : oussama.hamza@ens-lyon.fr

CHRISTIAN MAIRE, FEMTO-ST Institute, Université Bourgogne Franche-Comté, 15B Avenue des Montboucons, 25030 Besançon Cedex, France • *E-mail* : christian.maire@univ-fcomte.fr