

# PRIMES IN NUMERICAL SEMIGROUPS

J.L. RAMÍREZ ALFONSÍN<sup>1</sup> AND M. SKAŁBA

ABSTRACT. Let  $0 < a < b$  be two relatively prime integers and let  $\langle a, b \rangle$  be the numerical semigroup generated by  $a$  and  $b$  with Frobenius number  $g(a, b) = ab - a - b$ . In this note, we prove that there exists a prime number  $p \in \langle a, b \rangle$  with  $p < g(a, b)$  when the product  $ab$  is sufficiently large. Two related conjectures are posed and discussed as well.

Let  $0 < a < b$  be two relatively prime integers. Let  $S = \langle a, b \rangle = \{n \mid n = ax + by, x, y \in \mathbb{Z}, x, y \geq 0\}$  be the numerical semigroup generated by  $a$  and  $b$ . A well-known result due to Sylvester [6] states that the largest integer not belonging to  $S$ , denoted by  $g(a, b)$ , is given by  $ab - a - b$ .  $g(a, b)$  is called the *Frobenius number*. We refer the reader to [3] for a complexity result on the Frobenius number for general numerical semigroups and to [4] for an extensive literature on it.

We clearly have that any prime  $p$  larger than  $g(a, b)$  belongs to  $\langle a, b \rangle$ . A less obvious and more intriguing question is whether there is a prime  $p \leq g(a, b)$  belonging to  $\langle a, b \rangle$ .

In this note, we show that there always exists a prime  $p \in \langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $p < g(a, b)$  when the product  $ab$  is sufficiently large. The latter is a straight forward consequence of the below Theorem.

Let  $0 < u < v$  be integers. We define

$$\pi_S[u, v] = |\{p \text{ prime} \mid p \in S, u \leq p \leq v\}|.$$

For short, we may write  $\pi_S$  instead of  $\pi_S[0, g(a, b)]$ .

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $3 \leq a < b$  be two relatively prime integers and let  $S = \langle a, b \rangle$  be the numerical semigroup generated by  $a$  and  $b$ . Then, for any fixed  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists  $C(\varepsilon) > 0$  such that*

$$\pi_S > C(\varepsilon) \frac{g(a, b)}{\log(g(a, b))^{2+\varepsilon}}$$

for  $ab$  sufficiently large.

---

2010 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 11D07, 11N13, 11A41.

*Key words and phrases.* Primes, numerical semigroups, Frobenius number.

<sup>1</sup> Partially supported by Program MATH AmSud, Grant MATHAMSUD 18-MATH-01, Project FLaNASAGraTA..

Let us quickly introduce some notation and recall some facts needed for the proof of Theorem 1.

Let  $S = \langle a, b \rangle$  and let  $0 < u < v$  be integers. We define

$$n_S[u, v] = |\{n \in \mathbb{N} \mid u \leq n \leq v, n \in S\}|$$

and

$$n_S^c[u, v] = |\{n \in \mathbb{N} \mid u \leq n \leq v, n \notin S\}|.$$

For short, we may write  $n_S$  instead of  $n_S[0, g(a, b)]$  and  $n_S^c$  instead of  $n_S^c[0, g(a, b)]$ . The set of elements in  $n_S^c = \mathbb{N} \setminus S$  are usually called the *gaps* of  $S$ .

It is known [4] that  $S$  is always *symmetric*, that is, for any integer  $0 \leq s \leq g(a, b)$

$$s \in S \text{ if and only if } g(a, b) - s \notin S.$$

Obtaining that

$$n_S = \frac{g(a, b) + 1}{2}.$$

Let  $\pi(x)$  be the number of primes integers less or equals to  $x$  for any real number  $x$ . We recall that the well-known prime number theorem asserts that

$$(1) \quad \pi(x) \sim \frac{x}{\log x}.$$

We may now prove Theorem 1.

*Proof of Theorem 1.* Let  $\varepsilon > 0$  be fixed. We distinguish two cases.

**Case 1)** Suppose that  $a > (\log(ab))^{1+\varepsilon}$ . Let us take  $c = ab/(\log(ab))^{1+\varepsilon}$ . It is known [1] that if  $k \in [0, \dots, g(a, b)]$  then

$$n_S[0, k] = \sum_{i=0}^{\lfloor \frac{k}{b} \rfloor} \left( \left\lfloor \frac{k - ib}{a} \right\rfloor + 1 \right).$$

In our case, we obtain that

$$\begin{aligned} n_S[0, c] &< \lfloor \frac{c}{a} \rfloor + \lfloor \frac{c}{b} \rfloor \left( \lfloor \frac{c-b}{a} \rfloor + 1 \right) < \lfloor \frac{c}{a} \rfloor + \lfloor \frac{c}{b} \rfloor \left( \lfloor \frac{c}{a} \rfloor + 1 \right) \\ &< \frac{c}{a} + \frac{c}{b} + \frac{c^2}{ab} < \frac{bc+ac+c^2}{ab} < \frac{2c^2+c^2}{ab} = \frac{3c^2}{ab} = \frac{3ab}{(\log(ab))^{2+2\varepsilon}} \end{aligned}$$

where the last inequality holds since  $c > b > a$ .

Due to the symmetry of  $S$ , we have

$$(2) \quad n_S^c[g(a, b) - c, g(a, b)] = n_S[0, c] < \frac{3ab}{(\log(ab))^{2+2\varepsilon}}.$$

Now, by (1), we have

$$(3) \quad \pi_S[g(a, b) - c, g(a, b)] = \pi(g(a, b)) - \pi(g(a, b) - c) \gg \frac{c}{\log(ab)} = \frac{ab}{(\log(ab))^{2+\varepsilon}}$$

when  $ab$  is large enough.

Finally, by combining equations (2) and (3), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \pi_S &> \pi_S[g(a, b) - c, g(a, b)] - n_S^c[g(a, b) - c, g(a, b)] \\ &> \frac{ab}{(\log(ab))^{2+\varepsilon}} - \frac{3ab}{(\log(ab))^{2+2\varepsilon}} > 0 \end{aligned}$$

where the last inequality holds since  $(\log(ab))^\varepsilon > 3$  for  $ab$  large enough for the fixed  $\varepsilon$ . The above leads to the desired estimation of  $\pi_S$ .

**Case 2)** Suppose that  $3 \leq a \leq (\log(ab))^{1+\varepsilon}$ .

If  $p \in [b, \dots, g(a, b)]$  is a prime and  $p \equiv b \pmod{a}$  then  $p$  is clearly representable as  $p = b + \frac{p-b}{a}a$ . By Siegel-Walfisz theorem [2, 8], the number of such primes  $p$ , denoted by  $N$ , is

$$N = \frac{1}{\varphi(a)} \int_b^{g(a,b)} \frac{du}{\log u} + R$$

where  $\varphi$  is the *Euler totient function* and  $|R| < D'(\varepsilon) \frac{g(a,b)}{(\log(g(a,b)))^{2+2\varepsilon}}$  uniformly in  $[a, \dots, g(a, b)]$ .

Since the function  $1/\log u$  is decreasing on the interval  $[b, g(a, b)]$  then

$$\int_b^{g(a,b)} \frac{du}{\log u} > (g(a, b) - b) \cdot \frac{1}{\log g(a, b)}$$

and therefore

$$(4) \quad N > \frac{1}{\varphi(a)} \cdot \frac{g(a, b) - b}{\log(g(a, b))} - D'(\varepsilon) \frac{g(a, b)}{(\log(g(a, b)))^{2+2\varepsilon}}.$$

Now, we have that

$$\begin{aligned} &\frac{1}{\varphi(a)} \cdot \frac{g(a,b)-b}{\log(g(a,b))} \cdot \frac{(\log(g(a,b)))^{2+\varepsilon}}{g(a,b)} \\ &= \frac{1}{\varphi(a)} \log(g(a, b))^{1+\varepsilon} \left(1 - \frac{b}{g(a,b)}\right) \\ &> \frac{1}{\log(ab)^{1+\varepsilon}} \log(g(a, b))^{1+\varepsilon} \left(1 - \frac{b}{g(a,b)}\right) \quad (\text{since } (\log(ab))^{1+\varepsilon} \geq a > \varphi(a)) \\ &> \left(\frac{\log(ab)-\log(3)}{\log(ab)}\right)^{1+\varepsilon} \frac{1}{5} > F > 0 \quad (\text{since } g(a, b) > ab/3 \text{ and } \frac{b}{g(a,b)} \leq \frac{4}{5}) \end{aligned}$$

for some absolute  $F > 0$ , uniformly for  $ab \geq D''(\varepsilon)$  with  $a \geq 3$ .

Yielding to

$$(5) \quad \frac{1}{\varphi(a)} \cdot \frac{g(a, b) - b}{\log(g(a, b))} \geq F \frac{g(a, b)}{\log(g(a, b))^{2+\varepsilon}}$$

and combining equations (4) and (5) we obtain

$$N > F' \frac{g(a, b)}{\log(g(a, b))^{2+\varepsilon}}$$

for  $ab$  large enough for the fixed  $\varepsilon$ . The latter leads to the desired estimation of  $\pi_S$  also in this case. ■

## 1. CONCLUDING REMARKS

A number of computer experiments lead us to the following.

**Conjecture 1.** *Let  $1 \leq a < b$  be two relatively prime integers and let  $S$  be the numerical semigroup generated by  $a$  and  $b$ . Then,*

$$\pi_S > 0.$$

In analogy with the symmetry of  $\langle a, b \rangle$  mentioned above, our task of looking for primes in  $\langle a, b \rangle$  is related with the task of finding primes in  $[g(a, b) - 1)/2, \dots, g(a, b)]$ . From this point of view, Conjecture 1 can be thought of as a counterpart of the famous Chebyshev theorem stating that there is always a prime in  $[n, \dots, 2n]$  for any  $n \geq 2$ , see [5, Chapter 3]. A way to attack Conjecture 1 could be by applying *effective versions* of Siegel-Walfisz theorem. For instance, one may try to use [7, Corollary 8.31] in order to get computable constants in our estimates. However, it is not an easy task to trace all constants appearing in the relevant estimates of  $L(x, \chi)$  (but in principle possible). The remaining cases for *small* values  $ab$  must to be treated by computer.

**Conjecture 2.** *Let  $1 \leq a < b$  be two relatively prime integers and let  $S$  be the numerical semigroup generated by  $a$  and  $b$ . Then,*

$$\pi_S \sim \frac{\pi(g(a, b))}{2} \quad \text{for } ab \rightarrow \infty.$$

In the same spirit as the prime number theorem, this conjecture seems to be out of reach.

The famous Linnik's theorem asserts that there exist absolute constants  $C$  and  $L$  such that: for given relatively prime integers  $a, b$  the least prime  $p$  satisfying  $p \equiv b \pmod{a}$  is less than  $Ca^L$ . It is conjectured that the value  $L = 2$ , but the current record is only that  $L \leq 5$ , see [9].

On the same flavor of Linnik's theorem that concerns the existence of primes of the form  $ax + b$ , Theorem 1 is concerning the existence of primes of the form  $ax + by$  with  $x, y \geq 1$  less than  $ab$  for sufficiently large  $ab$ . This relation could shed light on in either direction.

## REFERENCES

- [1] G. Márquez-Campos, J.L. Ramírez Alfonsín, J.M. Tornero, Integral points in rational polygons: a numerical semigroup approach, *Semigroup Forum* **94**(1) (2017), 123-138.
- [2] K. Prachar, Primzahlverteilung, Die Grundlehren der Mathematischen Wissenschaften XCI, Springer-Verlag 1957.
- [3] J.L. Ramírez Alfonsín, Complexity of the Frobenius problem, *Combinatorica* **16**(1) (1996), 143-147.
- [4] J.L. Ramírez Alfonsín, The Diophantine Frobenius Problem, Oxford Lecture Ser. in Math. and its Appl. 30, Oxford University Press 2005.
- [5] W. Sierpinski, Elementary Theory of Numbers, Second Ed., PWN-Polish Scientific Publisher and North-Holland 1988,
- [6] J.J. Sylvester *Question 7382*, Mathematical Questions from Educational Times 41, 1884.
- [7] G. Tenenbaum, Introduction to Analytic and Probabilistic Number Theory, Third Edition, Graduate Studies in Mathematics 163, AMS 2015.
- [8] A. Walfisz, Zur additiven Zahlentheorie. II *Mathematische Zeitschrift* **40**(1) (1936) 592-607.
- [9] T. Xylouris, *Über die Nullstellen der Dirichletschen L-Funktionen und die kleinste Primzahl in einer arithmetischen Progression*, Dissertation, Bonn 2011.

INSTITUTE OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF WARSAW, BANACHA 2, 02-097  
WARSAWA, POLAND

*E-mail address:* skalba@mimuw.edu.pl

IMAG, UNIV. MONTPELLIER, CNRS, MONTPELLIER, FRANCE AND UMI2924  
- JEAN-CHRISTOPHE YOCOZ, CNRS-IMPA

*E-mail address:* jorge.ramirez-alfonsin@umontpellier.fr