

Solving equations in the symmetric group

Szilvia Homolya and Jenő Szigeti

ABSTRACT. We investigate the solutions of the general "cubic" equation $\alpha_1 \circ x^{r_1} \circ \alpha_2 \circ x^{r_2} \circ \alpha_3 \circ x^{r_3} = 1$ in the symmetric group S_n . In certain cases this equation can be rewritten as a conjugate equation of the form $\alpha \circ y \circ \alpha^{-1} = y^2$, where $\alpha = \alpha_1^{-1}$ and $y = x \circ \alpha_2$. It turns out that the existence of a non-trivial solution $y \neq 1$ of the above conjugate equation heavily depends on the type of α .

1. INTRODUCTION

One of the starting points of classical algebra is the solution of polynomial equations in fields. Thus, the investigation of equations in groups is a natural idea. Recently a good number of publications appeared that are related to complexity, taking an algorithmic approach to solving such equations. In the present paper we are interested only in the explicit solutions, so we restrict our consideration to the non-algorithmic aspects. In spite of the abundance of the relevant literature in group theory (a short list of examples is [AZ], [I], [Rot], [Rob], [Sc], [Sa]), it is a surprising fact that the authors found only a limited number of results about the explicit solutions of equations in groups. One of the earliest results (due to Frobenius) is about the number of solutions of $x^m = 1$ in a finite group (see [IR]). Further results concerning the equation $x^m = 1$ in the symmetric group S_n consisting of all bijective $\{1, 2, \dots, n\} \rightarrow \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ functions can be found in [CHS], [MW] and [FM]. A general equation (containing constants and group operations) for a single unknown permutation $x \in S_n$ is of the form:

$$\alpha_1 \circ x^{r_1} \circ \alpha_2 \circ \dots \circ \alpha_k \circ x^{r_k} = 1,$$

where $k \geq 1$, $\alpha_i \in S_n$ and $r_i \in \{1, -1\}$ for each $1 \leq i \leq k$. Our first impression is that the complete solution of the above equation is hopeless, on the other hand to deal with some special cases seems to be a challenging problem. We note that in the above equation $r_1 = 1$ can be assumed, otherwise $\alpha_1 \circ x^{-r_1} \circ \alpha_2 \circ \dots \circ \alpha_k \circ x^{-r_k} = 1$ is the same equation for the inverse x^{-1} and $-r_1 = 1$.

The solutions in the ("quadratic") case $k = 2$ can easily be obtained by a simple procedure. If $1 = r_1 = r_2$, then $\alpha_1 \circ x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x = 1$ is equivalent to

$$(x \circ \alpha_2)^2 = \alpha_1^{-1} \circ \alpha_2.$$

2020 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 05A05, 05E16, 20B30, 20B05, 20E45, 20F70 .

The second named author was partially supported by the National Research, Development and Innovation Office of Hungary (NKFIH) K138828.

The above square root equation has a solution if and only if the number of the $2i$ -element cycles in $\alpha_1^{-1} \circ \alpha_2$ is even for all integers $i \geq 1$. In order to construct all the solutions $y = x \circ \alpha_2$, we have to use the odd cycles of $\alpha_1^{-1} \circ \alpha_2$ and all possible pairings of the $2i$ -element cycles of $\alpha_1^{-1} \circ \alpha_2$ for all $i \geq 1$. If $1 = r_1 = -r_2$, then $\alpha_1 \circ x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x^{-1} = 1$ is equivalent to

$$x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x^{-1} = \alpha_1^{-1}.$$

The above conjugate equation has a solution if and only if the permutations α_2 and α_1^{-1} are of the same type. In order to construct all of these solutions, we have to use bijections between the cycles of the same length in α_2 and in α_1^{-1} . Notice that the type of a permutation $\pi \in S_n$ is a sequence $\text{type}(\pi) = \langle t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \rangle$ of integers, where $t_i \geq 0$ denotes the number of cycles in π of length $i \geq 1$. A well-known fact is that for $\pi_1, \pi_2 \in S_n$ the equality $\text{type}(\pi_1) = \text{type}(\pi_2)$ is equivalent to the conjugate relation between π_1 and π_2 (there exists a permutation $\tau \in S_n$ such that $\tau \circ \pi_1 \circ \tau^{-1} = \pi_2$). Further details (on the solutions in the case $k = 2$) are left to the readers.

The situation in the case $k \geq 3$ is far more complicated. A nice summary about the general situation can be found in [L]. An important direction of research is to find solutions of a given group-equation in an appropriate extension of the base group. The Kervaire–Laudenbach (KL) conjecture asserts that if the length $r_1 + r_2 + \dots + r_k$ of the equation $\alpha_1 \circ x^{r_1} \circ \alpha_2 \circ \dots \circ \alpha_k \circ x^{r_k} = 1$ over an arbitrary group G is nonzero, then this equation has a solution in a group H containing G (here we assume that $r_{i-1} + r_i \neq 0$ if $\alpha_i = 1$, $2 \leq i \leq k$). A consequence of a general extension theorem of Gerstenhaber and Rothaus (see [GR]) is that (KL) holds for finite groups. For $k = 5$ the conjecture (KL) is proved in [E].

Our paper is devoted to the study of the solutions of the "cubic" equation

$$(*) \quad \alpha_1 \circ x^{r_1} \circ \alpha_2 \circ x^{r_2} \circ \alpha_3 \circ x^{r_3} = 1$$

in S_n , where $r_1 = 1$ and the constants $\alpha_1, \alpha_2, \alpha_3 \in S_n$ satisfy certain extra conditions. According to the choice of the exponents we have the following four possibilities

$$(*1) \quad \alpha_1 \circ x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x \circ \alpha_3 \circ x^{-1} = 1, \quad (*2) \quad \alpha_1 \circ x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x^{-1} \circ \alpha_3 \circ x = 1,$$

$$(*3) \quad \alpha_1 \circ x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x^{-1} \circ \alpha_3 \circ x^{-1} = 1, \quad (*4) \quad \alpha_1 \circ x \circ \alpha_2 \circ x \circ \alpha_3 \circ x = 1.$$

We consider only the first case and assume that $x = \alpha_2^{-1}$ is a solution of (*1). Our requirement seems to be artificial, however the weaker assumption, that (*1) has at least one solution in S_n is quite natural. Clearly, the condition that α_2^{-1} is a solution of (*1) is equivalent to $\alpha_3 \circ \alpha_2 \circ \alpha_1 = \alpha_2$ and (*1) can be rewritten as $\alpha_1^{-1} \circ y \circ \alpha_1 = y^2$, where $y = x \circ \alpha_2$. Indeed,

$$y^2 = (x \circ \alpha_2) \circ (x \circ \alpha_2) = \alpha_1^{-1} \circ (x \circ \alpha_2) \circ \alpha_2^{-1} \circ \alpha_3^{-1} \circ \alpha_2 = \alpha_1^{-1} \circ y \circ \alpha_1$$

and $\alpha_1 = \alpha_2^{-1} \circ \alpha_3^{-1} \circ \alpha_2$ follows from $\alpha_3 \circ \alpha_2 \circ \alpha_1 = \alpha_2$. In the rest of the paper we focus our attention on the conjugate equation of the form

$$(*\alpha) \quad \alpha \circ y \circ \alpha^{-1} = y^2,$$

where $\alpha, y \in S_n$. We prove that in some cases equation (* α) has only one trivial solution $y = 1$ (see Theorems (A1) and (A2)), while in other cases there are several non-trivial solutions of (* α) (see Theorems (B1) and (B2)). Using $\alpha = \alpha_1^{-1}$ and the above mentioned rewritten form of (*1), we obtain that in some cases $x = \alpha_2^{-1}$

is the only solution of (*1), while in other cases there are several other solutions of (*1). In order to emphasize the importance of (* α), we present the following (probably convincing) remarks about the equations (*2) and (*3). If $x = \alpha_1^{-1}$ is a solution of (*2), then (*2) can be rewritten as $\alpha_2 \circ y \circ \alpha_2^{-1} = y^2$, where $y = x \circ \alpha_1^{-1}$. If $x = \alpha_3$ is a solution of (*3), then (*3) can be rewritten as $\alpha_1 \circ y \circ \alpha_1^{-1} = y^2$, where $y = x \circ \alpha_3^{-1}$.

The case of (*4) is different, here the additional condition that $x = \alpha_3^{-1}$ is a solution of (*4) ensures, that (*4) can be rewritten as $(\alpha_1 \circ \alpha_3^{-1}) \circ y \circ (\alpha_1 \circ \alpha_3^{-1})^{-1} = y^{-2}$, where $y = \alpha_3 \circ x$. The authors plan to present results in a future paper about the solutions of the conjugate equation of the form $\alpha \circ y \circ \alpha^{-1} = y^{-2}$ arising from (*4). For an integer k a more general power conjugate equation is of the form

$$(*\alpha)_k \quad \alpha \circ y \circ \alpha^{-1} = y^k.$$

One of the solutions of $(*\alpha)_k$ can be expected as a power $y = \alpha^t$ for some $t \geq 1$, the only condition we need is: $\alpha^t = \alpha \circ \alpha^t \circ \alpha^{-1} = (\alpha^t)^k = \alpha^{tk}$. Thus, α^t is a non-trivial solution if $\alpha^{t(k-1)} = 1$ and $\alpha^t \neq 1$ ($t(k-1)$ is a multiple and t is not a multiple of the order of α), the existence of such a t is equivalent to $\gcd(k-1, \text{ord}(\alpha)) \neq 1$.

2. THE SOLUTIONS OF THE CONJUGATE EQUATION $\alpha \circ y \circ \alpha^{-1} = y^2$

Let $\beta = \tau \circ \alpha \circ \tau^{-1}$ be a conjugate of α (here $\tau \in S_n$ is fixed). Since the conjugation is an automorphism of S_n , the solutions of $(*\beta)$: $\beta \circ z \circ \beta^{-1} = z^2$ can be obtained as the conjugates $z = \tau \circ y \circ \tau^{-1}$ of the solutions of $(*\alpha)$. Thus, the number of solutions of $(*\alpha)$ depends only on the conjugacy class (or the type) of α .

For a given permutation $\alpha \in S_n$ with $\text{type}(\alpha) = \langle g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n \rangle$ and for an integer $1 \leq d \leq n$ we define a set of integers (the d -range of α) as

$$F_d(\alpha) = \left\{ \sum_{1 \leq j \leq n, d|j} q_j \cdot j \mid 0 \leq q_j \leq g_j \text{ for all } 1 \leq j \leq n \right\} = \\ \{q_d \cdot d + q_{2d} \cdot 2d + \dots + q_{\lfloor n/d \rfloor d} \cdot \lfloor n/d \rfloor d \mid 0 \leq q_{id} \leq g_{id} \text{ for all } 1 \leq i \leq \lfloor n/d \rfloor\}.$$

Now $g_1 \cdot 1 + g_2 \cdot 2 + \dots + g_n \cdot n = n$ gives that $F_d(\alpha) \subseteq \{d, 2d, \dots, \lfloor n/d \rfloor d\}$ and $g_n = 1$ implies that $g_1 = g_2 = \dots = g_{n-1} = 0$, whence $F_1(\alpha) = \{0, n\}$ follows. Clearly, the divisibility $d_1 \mid d_2$ implies that $F_{d_2}(\alpha) \subseteq F_{d_1}(\alpha)$.

Lemma 1. *If the containment $\alpha(H) \subseteq H$ holds for some subset $H \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ (it is a fixed set of $\alpha \in S_n$), then $\alpha(H) = H$ and $H = D_1 \cup D_2 \cup \dots \cup D_w$ is a union of certain pairwise disjoint cycles of α . If $1 \leq d \leq n$ and $d \mid |D_j|$ holds for all $1 \leq j \leq w$, then for the number of elements we have*

$$|H| = |D_1| + |D_2| + \dots + |D_w| \in F_d(\alpha).$$

Proof. Obvious. \square

Lemma 2. *If $\alpha \circ y \circ \alpha^{-1} = z$ holds for $\alpha, y, z \in S_n$ and (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_r) is a cycle of y , then $(\alpha(c_1), \alpha(c_2), \dots, \alpha(c_r))$ is a cycle of z .*

Proof. Clearly, $z(\alpha(c_i)) = (z \circ \alpha)(c_i) = (\alpha \circ y)(c_i) = \alpha(y(c_i)) = \alpha(c_{i+1})$ (indices $1 \leq i \leq r$ are considered modulo r). \square

Lemma 3. *If $y_1, y_2 \in S_n$ are solutions of $(*\alpha)$ such that $y_1 \circ y_2 = y_2 \circ y_1$, then the product $y_1 \circ y_2$ is also a solution of $(*\alpha)$. If $y \in S_n$ is a solution of $(*\alpha)$, then for $i \geq 0$ and $k \geq 0$ we have*

$$\alpha^k \circ y^i = y^{2^k i} \circ \alpha^k.$$

Proof. Since $\alpha \circ y_1 \circ \alpha^{-1} = y_1 \circ y_1$ and $\alpha \circ y_2 \circ \alpha^{-1} = y_2 \circ y_2$ hold, the multiplicative property of the conjugation gives that

$$\alpha \circ y_1 \circ y_2 \circ \alpha^{-1} = \alpha \circ y_1 \circ \alpha^{-1} \circ \alpha \circ y_2 \circ \alpha^{-1} = (y_1 \circ y_1) \circ (y_2 \circ y_2) = (y_1 \circ y_2) \circ (y_1 \circ y_2).$$

If $y \in S_n$ is a solution of $(*\alpha)$, then y^i is also a solution of $(*\alpha)$. Thus, $\alpha \circ y^i \circ \alpha^{-1} = y^i \circ y^i$, whence $\alpha \circ y^i = y^{2^i} \circ \alpha$ follows for all $i \geq 0$. Now for $k \geq 0$ we use an induction:

$$\alpha^{k+1} \circ y^i = \alpha \circ (\alpha^k \circ y^i) = \alpha \circ (y^{2^k i} \circ \alpha^k) = (\alpha \circ y^{2^k i}) \circ \alpha^k = (y^{2^{(2^k i)}} \circ \alpha) \circ \alpha^k = y^{2^{k+1} i} \circ \alpha^{k+1}. \square$$

Lemma 4. *If $y \in S_n$ is a solution of $(*\alpha)$, then y and y^2 are of the same type $\langle t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \rangle$ and for any cycle (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_r) of y we have $r = 2m + 1$ (i.e. y and y^2 have no even cycles, in other words $t_r = 0$ for all even integers $1 \leq r \leq n$) and $(c_1, c_3, c_5, \dots, c_{2m+1}, c_2, c_4, \dots, c_{2m})$ is a cycle of y^2 consisting of the same elements as the original cycle of y and each cycle of y^2 can be uniquely obtained by the above construction.*

Proof. According to $(*\alpha)$ the permutation y^2 is the conjugate of y (by α), whence $\text{type}(y) = \text{type}(y^2)$ follows. If (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_r) is a cycle of y and $r = 2m + 1$, then $(c_1, c_3, c_5, \dots, c_{2m+1}, c_2, c_4, \dots, c_{2m})$ is obviously a cycle of y^2 of the same length r . If (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_r) is a cycle of y and $r = 2m$, then $(c_1, c_3, c_5, \dots, c_{2m-1})$ and $(c_2, c_4, \dots, c_{2m})$ are two disjoint cycles of y^2 of length m . Thus, an even cycle of y^2 can be obtained only from a double sized even cycle of y . If $2s$ is the length of one of the longest even cycle of y^2 , then such a cycle can appear as the "half" of a certain even cycle of y . It follows, that y has an even cycle of length $4s$, whence the existence of a cycle of length $4s$ in y^2 follows. This contradiction shows that there is no even cycle in y^2 and in y . \square

Lemma 5. *Let $y \in S_n$ be a solution of $(*\alpha)$ with $\text{type}(y) = \langle t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \rangle$ and for a given $r = 2m + 1$ with $t_r \geq 1$ consider the base sets*

$$C_i^{(r)} \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, n\}, 1 \leq i \leq t_r$$

of all r -element cycles of y ($|C_i^{(r)}| = r$ for all $1 \leq i \leq t_r$). Then there exists a permutation γ of the index set $\{1, 2, \dots, t_r\}$ such that

$$\alpha(C_i^{(r)}) = C_{\gamma(i)}^{(r)}.$$

Since γ is uniquely determined by α , it is natural to use the notation $\gamma = \alpha^{(r)}$. Now $t_r, r \in F_1(\alpha)$ and if $\alpha^{(r)}$ has a cycle (i_1, i_2, \dots, i_d) of length $1 \leq d \leq t_r$, then $d \in F_d(\alpha)$.

Proof. In view of Lemmas 2 and 4, any r -element cycle of y^2 can be obtained as the α image of a unique r -element cycle of y . Since the base sets of the r -element cycles in y and in y^2 coincide, we obtain that $\alpha(C_i^{(r)}) = C_{\gamma(i)}^{(r)}$ for some permutation

γ of the indices. Now $H = C_1^{(r)} \cup C_2^{(r)} \cup \dots \cup C_{t_r}^{(r)}$ is a fixed set of α , whence $t_r r = |H| \in F_1(\alpha)$ follows by Lemma 1. If (i_1, i_2, \dots, i_d) is a cycle of $\alpha^{(r)}$, then

$$\alpha(C_{i_1}^{(r)}) = C_{i_2}^{(r)}, \alpha(C_{i_2}^{(r)}) = C_{i_3}^{(r)}, \dots, \alpha(C_{i_{d-1}}^{(r)}) = C_{i_d}^{(r)}, \alpha(C_{i_d}^{(r)}) = C_{i_1}^{(r)}.$$

In view of the above "d-cyclic" property of α , the use of Lemma 1 gives that

$$H(d) = C_{i_1}^{(r)} \cup C_{i_2}^{(r)} \cup \dots \cup C_{i_d}^{(r)} = D_1 \cup D_2 \cup \dots \cup D_w,$$

where D_1, D_2, \dots, D_w are certain pairwise disjoint cycles of α such that $d \mid |D_j|$ holds for all $1 \leq j \leq w$. Thus

$$dr = |H(d)| = |D_1| + |D_2| + \dots + |D_w| \in F_d(\alpha)$$

follows by the repeated application of Lemma 1. \square

Lemma 6. *Let $y \in S_n$ be a solution of $(*\alpha)$ with $\text{type}(y) = \langle t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \rangle$. If the induced permutation $\alpha^{(r)}$ of the indices $\{1, 2, \dots, t_r\}$ has a cycle (i_1, i_2, \dots, i_d) of length $1 \leq d \leq t_r$ and $\gcd(2^d - 1, r) = 1$, then α also has a cycle of length d in $C_{i_1}^{(r)} \cup C_{i_2}^{(r)} \cup \dots \cup C_{i_d}^{(r)}$. In particular, if $\alpha^{(r)}$ has a fixed point, then α also has a fixed point (case $d = 1$).*

Proof. Let $C_{i_1}^{(r)} = \{c_1, c_2, \dots, c_r\}$ be the set of all elements in a cycle (c_1, c_2, \dots, c_r) of y (notice that $r = 2m + 1$ by Lemma 4). Since $c_1 \in C_{i_1}^{(r)}$ and

$$\alpha(C_{i_1}^{(r)}) = C_{i_2}^{(r)}, \alpha(C_{i_2}^{(r)}) = C_{i_3}^{(r)}, \dots, \alpha(C_{i_{d-1}}^{(r)}) = C_{i_d}^{(r)}, \alpha(C_{i_d}^{(r)}) = C_{i_1}^{(r)},$$

the containment $\alpha^d(c_1) \in C_{i_1}^{(r)}$ holds, whence $\alpha^d(c_1) = y^s(c_1)$ follows for some $1 \leq s \leq r$. Now $\gcd(2^d - 1, r) = 1$ implies that $(2^d - 1)u + s = rv$ for some $u, v \geq 1$ and $y^u(c_1)$ is a fixed point of α^d . Indeed, the application of Lemma 3 gives that

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha^d(y^u(c_1)) &= (\alpha^d \circ y^u)(c_1) = (y^{2^d u} \circ \alpha^d)(c_1) = y^{2^d u}(\alpha^d(c_1)) = y^{2^d u}(y^s(c_1)) = \\ &= y^{2^d u + s}(c_1) = y^{u + rv}(c_1) = y^u(c_1). \end{aligned}$$

Thus $(y^u(c_1), \alpha(y^u(c_1)), \dots, \alpha^{d-1}(y^u(c_1)))$ is a d -element cycle of α . \square

Theorem (A1). *Let $\alpha \in S_n$ be a permutation of $\text{type}(\alpha) = \langle g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n \rangle$. Assume that for any choice of the integers $r = 2m + 1$ ($m \geq 1$) and $d \geq 1$ with $dr \in F_d(\alpha)$ we have $g_d = 0$ and $\gcd(2^d - 1, r) = 1$. Then $(*\alpha)$ has only the trivial solution $y = 1$.*

Proof. Let $y \in S_n$ be a solution of $(*\alpha)$ with $\text{type}(y) = \langle t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \rangle$. Assume that $y \neq 1$, then y has at least one cycle of length $r \geq 2$. Now Lemma 4 ensures that $r = 2m + 1 \geq 3$ is odd.

Let $C_i^{(r)} \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$, $1 \leq i \leq t_r$ be the pairwise disjoint base sets of the r -element cycles of y . In view of Lemma 5 we have $\alpha(C_i^{(r)}) = C_{\gamma(i)}^{(r)}$, $1 \leq i \leq t_r$, where $\gamma = \alpha^{(r)}$ is the induced permutation of the indices $\{1, 2, \dots, t_r\}$. Consider an arbitrary cycle (i_1, i_2, \dots, i_d) of $\alpha^{(r)}$, then $1 \leq d \leq t_r$ and Lemma 5 gives that $dr \in F_d(\alpha)$ holds. Thus, we have $g_d = 0$ and $\gcd(2^d - 1, r) = 1$. The application of Lemma 6 gives that α also has a cycle of length d , in contradiction with $g_d = 0$. \square

Theorem (A2). *Let $\alpha \in S_n$ be a permutation of type $\text{type}(\alpha) = \langle g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n \rangle$ such that $g_1 = 0$ and $g_a \neq 0 \neq g_b$ and $a \neq b$ imply that $\gcd(a, b) = 1$ (two different*

cycle lengths are relative primes). If $g_a \neq 0$ (i.e. $1 \leq a \leq n$ is a cycle length of α), then $1 \leq g_a \leq 2$ and $2^{\frac{a}{p}} - 1$ is not divisible by p (i.e. $p \nmid 2^{\frac{a}{p}} - 1$) for any prime divisor $p \geq 3$ of a . Then $(*\alpha)$ has only the trivial solution $y = 1$.

Proof. We use Theorem (A1). If $r = 2m + 1$ (with $m \geq 1$) and $d \geq 1$ are integers with $dr \in F_d(\alpha)$, then $F_d(\alpha) \neq \{0\}$. If $d \geq 2$, then our condition on the type of α ensures the existence of a unique integer $k \geq 1$ such that $1 \leq dk \leq n$ and $g_{dk} \neq 0$, whence $F_d(\alpha) = F_{dk}(\alpha) = \{0, dk, 2dk, \dots, g_{dk}dk\}$ follows. In view of $1 \leq g_{dk} \leq 2$ we have $F_d(\alpha) \subseteq \{0, dk, 2dk\}$ and $dr = dk$ ($dr = 2dk$ would imply that $r = 2k$ is even). Thus, $g_{dr} \neq 0$ and $g_d = 0$ is a consequence of our condition on the type of α . If $\gcd(2^d - 1, r) \neq 1$, then $p \mid 2^d - 1$ and $p \mid r$ hold for some prime $p \geq 3$. Since

$$(2^d)^{\frac{r}{p}} - 1 = 2^{\frac{dr}{p}} - 1$$

is divisible by $2^d - 1$, we obtain that $p \mid 2^{\frac{dr}{p}} - 1$, which is in contradiction with our non-divisibility assumption on the cycle lengths ($g_{dr} \neq 0$). If $d = 1$, then $g_1 = 0$ and $\gcd(2^d - 1, r) = 1$ obviously holds. \square

Corollary (A3). Let $\alpha \in S_n$ be a cyclic permutation of length n (say $\alpha = (1, 2, \dots, n)$). If $2^{\frac{n}{p}} - 1$ is not divisible by p (i.e. $p \nmid 2^{\frac{n}{p}} - 1$) for any prime divisor $p \geq 3$ of n , then $(*\alpha)$ has only the trivial solution $y = 1$. Notice that $n = 3 \cdot 5 \cdot 11$ is an example of such integer.

Proof. There are no different cycle lengths and the number of cycles in α is one. Since the non-divisibility condition on n holds, Theorem (A2) can be applied. \square

Theorem (B1). Let $p \geq 3$ be a prime divisor of the integer $n \geq 3$ such that $2^{\frac{n}{p}} - 1$ is divisible by p (i.e. $p \mid 2^{\frac{n}{p}} - 1$). Then for any cyclic permutation $\alpha \in S_n$ of length n , equation $(*\alpha)$ has a non-trivial solution. Notice that $n = 6, 20, 21$ are examples of such integers with $3 \mid 2^{\frac{6}{3}} - 1$, $5 \mid 2^{\frac{20}{5}} - 1$ and $7 \mid 2^{\frac{21}{7}} - 1$.

Proof. Take $q = n/p$ and define an n -element set P_n of ordered pairs and a function $\beta : P_n \rightarrow P_n$ as follows:

$$P_n = \{(i, j) \mid 1 \leq i \leq q \text{ and } 1 \leq j \leq p\},$$

$$\beta(i, j) = \begin{cases} (i + 1, 2j) & \text{if } 1 \leq i \leq q - 1 \text{ and } 1 \leq j \leq p \\ (1, 2j + 1) & \text{if } i = q \text{ and } 1 \leq j \leq p \end{cases},$$

where $2j$ and $2j + 1$ are taken in $\{1, 2, \dots, p\}$ modulo p . It is straightforward to check that β is injective (hence a permutation of P_n). Clearly, the definition of β immediately gives that the length of a cycle in β is a multiple of q . If $1 \leq k \leq q - 1$ and $1 \leq j \leq p$, then $\beta^k(1, j) = (1 + k, 2^k j)$ and $p \mid 2^q - 1$ ensures that $\beta^q(1, j) = (1, 2^q j + 1) = (1, j + 1)$. Thus

$$\beta^q(1, j) = (1, j + 1), \beta^{2q}(1, j) = (1, j + 2), \dots, \beta^{(p-1)q}(1, j) = (1, j + p - 1)$$

are distinct elements and $\beta^{pq}(1, j) = (1, j + p) = (1, j)$ (in P_n). It follows that β has exactly one cycle of length $n = pq$. Now define a permutation $y : P_n \rightarrow P_n$ as follows:

$$y(i, j) = (i, j + 1),$$

where $1 \leq i \leq q$, $1 \leq j \leq p$ and $j + 1$ is taken in $\{1, 2, \dots, p\}$ modulo p . The number of cycles in y is exactly q and each cycle of y is of the form

$$((i, 1), (i, 2), \dots, (i, p)).$$

An easy calculation shows that $\beta \circ y = y^2 \circ \beta$. If $1 \leq i \leq q - 1$ and $1 \leq j \leq p$, then

$$\beta(y(i, j)) = \beta((i, j + 1)) = (i + 1, 2j + 2)$$

and

$$y(y(\beta(i, j))) = y(y((i + 1, 2j))) = y((i + 1, 2j + 1)) = (i + 1, 2j + 2).$$

If $i = q$ and $1 \leq j \leq p$, then

$$\beta(y(q, j)) = \beta((q, j + 1)) = (1, 2j + 3)$$

and

$$y(y(\beta(q, j))) = y(y((1, 2j + 1))) = y((1, 2j + 2)) = (1, 2j + 3).$$

Thus, y is a non-trivial solution of $(*\beta)$. Finally we deduce, that $(*\alpha)$ has a non-trivial solution for any permutation $\alpha \in S_n$ with $\text{type}(\alpha) = \text{type}(\beta)$. \square

Theorem (B2). *Let $p \geq 3$ be a prime divisor of $2^{2^m} - 1$ and take $n = p2^m$. If $\alpha = (1, 2, \dots, n) \in S_n$ is a cyclic permutation, then the only solutions of $(*\alpha)$ are the powers $y, y^2, \dots, y^{p-1}, y^p = 1$ of an arbitrary solution $1 \neq y \in S_n$.*

Proof. The application of Theorem (B1) gives the existence of a non-trivial solution of $(*\alpha)$. Fix an element $a \in \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ and let $1 \neq y \in S_n$ be an arbitrary solution of $(*\alpha)$ with $\text{type}(y) = \langle t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \rangle$. Now y has at least one cycle of length $r \geq 2$ and Lemma 4 ensures that $r = 2m + 1 \geq 3$ is odd. Let $C_i^{(r)} \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$, $1 \leq i \leq t_r$ be the pairwise disjoint base sets of the r -element cycles of y . The type of α and Lemma 5 ensure that $t_r r \in F_1(\alpha) = \{0, n\} = \{0, p2^m\}$, whence $r = p$ and $t_p = 2^m$ follows. Thus, $t_k = 0$ for each $1 \leq k \leq n$, $k \neq p$ and the powers $y, y^2, \dots, y^{p-1}, y^p = 1$ are distinct solutions of $(*\alpha)$.

If $1 \leq q \leq t_p = 2^m$ is the length of a cycle (i_1, i_2, \dots, i_q) of the induced permutation $\alpha^{(p)}$, then Lemma 5 gives $qp \in F_q(\alpha) \subseteq F_1(\alpha) = \{0, p2^m\}$ and $q = 2^m$. It follows that $\alpha^{(p)}$ has only one cycle of length $q = 2^m$ and we can assume that $\alpha^{(p)} = (1, 2, \dots, q)$ and $a \in C_1^{(p)}$ (hence $\alpha(C_j^{(p)}) = C_{j+1}^{(p)}$ for $1 \leq j \leq q - 1$ and $\alpha(C_q^{(p)}) = C_1^{(p)}$). The above cyclic property of $\alpha^{(p)}$ and $1 \leq q = n/p \leq n - 1$ ensure that $a \neq \alpha^q(a) \in C_1^{(p)}$, whence $\alpha^q(a) = y^s(a)$ follows for some $1 \leq s \leq p - 1$ (s depends on the choice of a). We claim that $y(\alpha^i(a)) = \alpha^{\bar{s}(i)q+i}(a)$ holds for all integers $0 \leq i \leq pq = n$, where $1 \leq \bar{s}(i) \leq p - 1$ denotes the multiplicative inverse (reciprocal) of $2^i s$ in the prime field \mathbb{Z}_p .

First we use $\alpha^i \circ y^s = y^{2^i s} \circ \alpha^i$ (in Lemma 3) to get

$$\alpha^q(\alpha^i(a)) = \alpha^i(\alpha^q(a)) = \alpha^i(y^s(a)) = y^{2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))$$

and then we prove by induction, that $\alpha^{kq}(\alpha^i(a)) = y^{k2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))$ holds for all integers $k \geq 0$. Lemma 3 gives that $\alpha^{kq} \circ y^{2^i s} = y^{2^{kq} 2^i s} \circ \alpha^{kq}$ and $2^{kq} 2^i s - 2^i s = (2^{kq} - 1)2^i s$ is divisible by $2^q - 1$ and hence by p . Now $2^{kq} 2^i s - 2^i s = pw$ and the validity of the above equality for $k + 1$ can be derived as

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha^{(k+1)q}(\alpha^i(a)) &= \alpha^{kq}(\alpha^q(\alpha^i(a))) = \alpha^{kq}(y^{2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))) = \\ y^{2^{kq} 2^i s}(\alpha^{kq}(\alpha^i(a))) &= y^{2^{kq} 2^i s}(y^{k2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))) = y^{2^{kq} 2^i s - 2^i s}(y^{(k+1)2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))) = \end{aligned}$$

$$y^{pw}(y^{(k+1)2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))) = y^{(k+1)2^i s}(\alpha^i(a)).$$

In view of $\bar{s}(i)2^i s = 1 + pv$, the substitution $k = \bar{s}(i)$ into $\alpha^{kq}(\alpha^i(a)) = y^{k2^i s}(\alpha^i(a))$ gives our claim

$$y(\alpha^i(a)) = y^{\bar{s}(i)2^i s}(\alpha^i(a)) = \alpha^{\bar{s}(i)q}(\alpha^i(a)) = \alpha^{\bar{s}(i)q+i}(a).$$

Since $\{\alpha^i(a) \mid 0 \leq i\} = \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$, the permutation y is completely determined by s . The fact that $1 \leq s \leq p-1$ can be chosen in $p-1$ different ways implies that the number of non-trivial solutions of $(*\alpha)$ is at most $p-1$. It follows that $y, y^2, \dots, y^{p-1}, y^p = 1$ is the complete list of solutions.

Starting from $\alpha^q(a) = y^s(a)$, we have a chance to use the definition $y(\alpha^i(a)) = \alpha^{\bar{s}(i)q+i}(a)$ and some calculations in \mathbb{Z}_p to prove directly that y is a permutation satisfying $(*\alpha)$. \square

Corollary (B3). *If $n = 6 = 3 \cdot 2^1$ and $\alpha = (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6) \in S_6$ is a cyclic permutation, then the non-trivial solutions of $(*\alpha)$ are the following:*

$$y_1 = (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4) \text{ and } y_2 = y_1^2 = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6).$$

The following is an application of Corollary (B3).

Corollary (B4). *If $n = 12$ and $\alpha \in S_{12}$ has two disjoint cycles of length 6, say $\alpha = (1, 2, \dots, 6) \circ (7, \dots, 12)$, then the non-trivial solutions of $(*\alpha)$ are the following:*

$$\begin{aligned} y_1 &= (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4), y_3 = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6) = y_1^2, \\ y_2 &= (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10), y_4 = (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12) = y_2^2, \\ y_5 &= (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4) \circ (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10) = y_1 \circ y_2 \\ y_6 &= (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4) \circ (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12) = y_1 \circ y_2^2 \\ y_7 &= (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6) \circ (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10) = y_1^2 \circ y_2 \\ y_8 &= (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6) \circ (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12) = y_1^2 \circ y_2^2 \end{aligned}$$

Notice that $y_2 \circ y_1 = y_1 \circ y_2$ and $y_1^3 = y_2^3 = 1$. All the 9 solutions of $(*\alpha)$ are of the form $y_1^i \circ y_2^j$, where $0 \leq i, j \leq 2$.

Proof. Consider the type $(y) = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_{12})$ of y . If $y \neq 1$, then y has at least one cycle of length $r \geq 2$. Now Lemma 4 ensures that $r = 2m + 1 \geq 3$ is odd. Let $C_i^{(r)} \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, 12\}$, $1 \leq i \leq t_r$ be the pairwise disjoint base sets of the r -element cycles of y . The type of α and Lemma 5 ensure that $F_1(\alpha) = \{0, 6, 12\}$ and $t_r r \in F_1(\alpha)$, whence $r = 3$ and $t_3 \in \{2, 4\}$ follows.

If $t_3 = 2$, then we have two possible cases (i) or (ii).

(i): $t_1 = 6$, ($t_i = 0$ for $i \notin \{1, 3\}$) and y is of the form

$$y = (a_1, a_2, a_3) \circ (b_1, b_2, b_3).$$

(ii): $t_1 = t_5 = 1$ ($t_i = 0$ for $i \notin \{1, 3, 5\}$). Clearly, in case (ii) the induced permutation $\alpha^{(5)} = 1$ is identical, whence the existence of a fixed point of α follows by Lemma 6, a contradiction.

Thus, $t_3 = 2$ and $t_1 = 6$, moreover $C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)}$ and its complement H are fixed sets of α and y . In consequence, we have

$$C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = \{1, 2, \dots, 6\} \text{ and } H = \{7, 8, \dots, 12\}$$

or

$$C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = \{7, 8, \dots, 12\} \text{ and } H = \{1, 2, \dots, 6\}.$$

Since the restriction $y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)}$ of y to $C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)}$ is also a solution of $(*\beta)$ with $\beta = \alpha \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)}$ and $y \upharpoonright H = 1$, the application of Corollary (B3) gives that we have the following possibilities:

$$y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4), \quad y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6)$$

and

$$y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10), \quad y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12).$$

As a consequence, we obtain four solutions

$$y_1 = (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4), \quad y_3 = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6) = y_1^2$$

and

$$y_2 = (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10), \quad y_4 = (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12) = y_2^2.$$

If $t_3 = 4$, then $t_i = 0$ for $i \neq 3$ and y is of the form

$$y = (a_1, a_2, a_3) \circ (b_1, b_2, b_3) \circ (c_1, c_2, c_3) \circ (d_1, d_2, d_3)$$

and $C_1^{(3)} = \{a_1, a_2, a_3\}$, $C_2^{(3)} = \{b_1, b_2, b_3\}$, $C_3^{(3)} = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\}$, $C_4^{(3)} = \{d_1, d_2, d_3\}$, where $a_1 = 1$ can be assumed, and we are free to take $b_1 = \alpha(1)$. Thus, we have

$$C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = \{1, 2, \dots, 6\} \text{ and } C_3^{(3)} \cup C_4^{(3)} = \{7, 8, \dots, 12\}$$

Since the restrictions of y to $C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)}$ and to $C_3^{(3)} \cup C_4^{(3)}$ are also solutions of $(*\lambda)$ with $\lambda = \alpha \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)}$ and $\lambda = \alpha \upharpoonright C_3^{(3)} \cup C_4^{(3)}$, the application of Corollary (B3) gives that we have the following possibilities:

$$y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4), \quad y \upharpoonright C_1^{(3)} \cup C_2^{(3)} = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6)$$

and

$$y \upharpoonright C_3^{(3)} \cup C_4^{(3)} = (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10), \quad y \upharpoonright C_3^{(3)} \cup C_4^{(3)} = (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12).$$

As a consequence, we obtain four solutions

$$y_5 = (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4) \circ (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10) = y_1 \circ y_2,$$

$$y_6 = (1, 3, 5) \circ (2, 6, 4) \circ (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12) = y_1 \circ y_4,$$

$$y_7 = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6) \circ (7, 9, 11) \circ (8, 12, 10) = y_3 \circ y_2,$$

$$y_8 = (1, 5, 3) \circ (2, 4, 6) \circ (7, 11, 9) \circ (8, 10, 12) = y_3 \circ y_4.$$

Thus, we have 8 non-trivial solutions. \square

REFERENCES

[AZ] Judith M. Alcock-Zeilinger: *The Symmetric Group, its Representations, and Combinatorics*,

Lecture Notes 2018/19, Tübingen

<https://www.math.uni-tuebingen.de/de/forschung/maphy/lehre/ws-2018-19/sgc/dateien/combinatorics-lecturenotes.pdf>

[CHS] S. Chowla, I.N. Herstein, W.R. Scott: *The solutions of $x^d = 1$ in symmetric groups*,

Norske Vid. Selsk. (Trindheim) 25, 29-31 (1952)

[E] A. Evangelidou: *The Solution of Length Five Equations Over Groups*,

- Communications in Algebra, 35:6, 1914-1948 (2007)
- [FM] H.Finkelstein, K.I. Mandelberg: *On Solutions of "Equations in Symmetric Groups"*,
- Journal of Combinatorial Theory, Series A, 25, 142-152 (1978)
- [GR] M. Gerstenhaber, O. S. Rothaus: *The solution of sets of equations in groups*, Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 48, 1531-1533 (1962)
- [IR] I. M. Isaacs, G. R. Robinson: *On a Theorem of Frobenius: Solutions of $x^n = 1$ in Finite Groups*,
- American Mathematical Monthly, Vol. 99, No. 4, pp. 352-354 (Apr., 1992)
- [I] I. Martin Isaacs: *Finite Group Theory*, American Mathematical Society, 2008
- [L] R. C. Lyndon: *Equations in groups*, Boletim Da Sociedade Brasileira de Matemática, 11(1), 79-102 (1980)
- [MW] L. Moser, M. Wyman: *On solutions of $x^d = 1$ in symmetric groups*, Canad. J. Math. 7, 159-168 (1955)
- [Rob] D. J. S. Robinson: *A Course in the Theory of Groups*, Graduate Texts in Mathematics, Vol. 80, 2nd edn. (Springer-Verlag, New York, 1996).
- [Rot] Joseph J. Rotman: *An Introduction to the Theory of Groups*, Published August 13th 1999 by Springer (first published January 1st 1984)
- [Sc] W. Scott: *Group Theory*, Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs N.J., 1964
- [Sa] Bruce E. Sagan: *The Symmetric Group, Representations, Combinatorial Algorithms, and Symmetric Functions* Graduate Texts in Mathematics 203, Springer, 2000

INSTITUTE OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF MISKOLC., 3515 MISKOLC-EGYETEMVÁROS,
HUNGARY

Email address: szilvia.homolya@uni-miskolc.hu

INSTITUTE OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF MISKOLC., 3515 MISKOLC-EGYETEMVÁROS,
HUNGARY

Email address: matjeno@uni-miskolc.hu