EXPECTED VALUE OF THE SMALLEST DENOMINATOR
IN A RANDOM INTERVAL OF FIXED RADIUS

HUAYANG CHEN, ALAN HAYNES

Abstract. We compute the probability mass function of the random variable which returns the smallest denominator of a reduced fraction in a randomly chosen real interval of radius $\delta$. As an application, we prove that the expected value of the smallest denominator is asymptotic, as $\delta \to 0$, to $(8\sqrt{2}/\pi^2)\delta^{-1/2}$.

1. Introduction

It has been known since work of Franel [2] and Landau [4] in the 1920’s that the Riemann hypothesis can be reformulated as a question about the distribution of reduced rationals in the unit interval. In light of this, it is perhaps not surprising that the solutions to some basic problems in numerical approximation carry with them a shadow of the Riemann zeta function. Here we address one such problem, which was communicated to us by E. Sander and J. D. Meiss.

Section 3 of the paper [5] by Meiss and Sander describes an experiment in which a small parameter $\delta > 0$ is fixed, a point $x$ is chosen randomly and uniformly from $[0, 1)$, and then the smallest denominator of a reduced fraction in the interval $(x - \delta, x + \delta)$, denoted by

$$q_{\min}(x) = \min \{ q \in \mathbb{N} : \frac{p}{q} \in \mathbb{Q} \cap (x - \delta, x + \delta) \},$$

is computed. Various statistics of this quantity are numerically investigated, and it is mentioned that, apart from some related work of C. Stewart [6], basic questions about the distribution of values taken by $q_{\min}$ appear to be unanswered. In this paper we use tools from analytic number theory to study this random variable. As an application, we derive the following formula for its expected value.

Theorem 1. As $\delta \to 0$, we have that

$$E[q_{\min}] = \frac{8\sqrt{2}}{\pi^2} \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log^2 \delta \right).$$

The probability mass function (PMF) of $q_{\min}$ does of course contain more information than just its expected value. However, the precise formula for the PMF is rather complicated. We work it out in detail in Section 3, where we prove the following result.

Key words and phrases. Farey fractions, Diophantine approximation.

Research supported by NSF grant DMS 2001248.

MSC 2020: 11J83, 11B57.
Theorem 2. For $\delta \in (0, 1/2)$, the probability mass function $p : \mathbb{N} \to [0, 1]$ of $q_{\min}$ is supported on the set $\{1, 2, \ldots, \lfloor 1/2\delta \rfloor + 1\}$, and it takes the following values:

- If $1 \leq q \leq (2\delta)^{1/2}$ then
  $$p(q) = 2\delta \varphi(q).$$
- If $(2\delta)^{-1/2} < q \leq \delta^{-1/2}$ then
  $$p(q) = 2 \sum_{q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{q}} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} + \sum_{q' < q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{q}}} 2\delta.$$
- If $\delta^{-1/2} < q \leq (2/\delta)^{1/2}$ then
  $$p(q) = \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\sqrt{q}} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} - \sum_{q' < q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{q}}} 2\delta.$$
- If $(2/\delta)^{1/2} < q \leq (2\delta)^{-1} + 1$ then
  $$p(q) = \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\sqrt{q}} \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} + 2 \sum_{\alpha_q^+ < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{q}}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right),$$
  where
  $$\alpha_q^+ = \frac{q + \sqrt{q^2 - \frac{2}{\delta}}}{2}.$$
be used for ordered pairs \((x, y)\) in \(\mathbb{R}^2\), but the meaning should be clear from context. If \(q\) is a fixed integer and \(S \subseteq \mathbb{R}\) then we write
\[
\sum_{a \in S}'
\]
to denote a sum over integers \(a \in S\) satisfying \((a, q) = 1\). The symbols \(\varphi, \mu, \) and \(\zeta\) denote the Euler phi, Möbius, and Riemann zeta functions, respectively. For \(n \in \mathbb{N}\), \(\sum_{d|n}\) denotes a sum over positive divisors \(d\) of \(n\). For \(x \in \mathbb{R}\), we write \(\lfloor x \rfloor\) for the greatest integer less than or equal to \(x\) and \(\{x\} = x - \lfloor x \rfloor\) for the fractional part of \(x\).

First we summarize basic results about Farey fractions, proofs of which can be found in [3, Chapter III]. For each \(Q \in \mathbb{N}\), we define the Farey fractions of order \(Q\) by
\[
F_Q = \left\{ \frac{a}{q} : a, q \in \mathbb{Z}, 0 \leq a < q \leq Q, (a, q) = 1 \right\}.
\]
The set \(F_Q\) is taken with its usual ordering in \([0, 1)\). We also write \(F = \bigcup_{Q \in \mathbb{N}} F_Q\) for the set of all Farey fractions. Fractions \(a/q \in F\) are always assumed to be labeled so that \(q \in \mathbb{N}\) and \((a, q) = 1\). If \(a/q \in F\) and \(q \geq 2\) then we write \(a'/q'\) and \(a''/q''\) for the unique elements of \(F \cup \{1/1\}\) with the property that
\[
\frac{a'}{q'} < \frac{a}{q} < \frac{a''}{q''}
\]
are consecutive in \(F_q \cup \{1/1\}\).

It follows from basic properties of Farey fractions that \(q = q' + q''\) and that
\[
\frac{a}{q} - \frac{a'}{q'} = \frac{1}{qq'}, \quad \frac{a''}{q''} - \frac{a}{q} = \frac{1}{qq''}, \quad \text{and} \quad \frac{a''}{q''} - \frac{a'}{q'} = \frac{1}{q'q''}.
\]

It is evident from this that
\[
aq' - a'q = a''q - aq'' = a''q' - a'q'' = 1,
\]
and it follows that \((q, q') = (q, q'') = (q', q'') = 1\). It also follows that, once \(a/q\) is chosen, \(q'\) and \(q''\) are uniquely determined by the requirements that
\[
q' = a^{-1} \mod q, \quad 1 \leq q' \leq q, \quad \text{and} \quad q'' = q - q'.
\]
It is clear that as \(a\) runs through all reduced residue classes modulo \(q\), so does \(q'\). This implies that, for each \(Q \in \mathbb{N}\), the map
\[
\phi_Q : F_Q \to \left\{ (m, n) \in \mathbb{N}^2 : 1 \leq m \leq n \leq Q, (m, n) = 1 \right\}
\]
defined by
\[
\phi_Q(a/q) = \begin{cases} 
(1, 1) & \text{if } q = 1, \\
(q', q) & \text{if } q \geq 2,
\end{cases}
\]
is a bijection.

We assume that the reader is familiar with basic properties of and identities relating the functions \(\varphi, \mu, \) and \(\zeta\). All such properties and identities which we will use can be found.
in any book which covers elementary analytic number theory, for example [1] or [3]. We will also make use of the following lemmas.

**Lemma 3.** If \( x < y \) are real numbers and \( f : [x, y] \to \mathbb{R} \) is a continuously differentiable function then
\[
\sum_{x < n \leq y} f(n) = f(y)\lfloor y \rfloor - f(x)\lceil x \rceil - \int_x^y f'(t) \lfloor t \rfloor \, dt.
\]

**Lemma 4.** If \( x < y \) are real numbers and \( f : [x, y] \to \mathbb{R} \) is a continuously differentiable function then
\[
\sum_{x < n \leq y} f(n) = \int_x^y f(t) \, dt + \int_x^y \{t\} f'(t) \, dt + \{y\} f(y) - \{x\} f(x).
\]

Lemma 3 is a direct consequence of the integration by parts formula for Riemann-Stieltjes integrals, and Lemma 4 is a version of the well known Euler summation formula (see [1, Theorem 3.1]).

### 3. Probability mass function of \( q_{\min} \)

Fix \( \delta \in (0, 1/2) \) and let \( q_{\min} : [0, 1) \to \mathbb{N} \) be defined by (1). In this section we will compute the probability mass function \( p : \mathbb{N} \to [0, 1) \) of the random variable \( q_{\min} \), assuming uniform probability on the sample space \([0, 1)\). Every closed interval of diameter \( 2\delta \) contains a reduced fraction with denominator no larger than
\[
Q = Q(\delta) = \left\lfloor \frac{1}{2\delta} \right\rfloor + 1,
\]
so by throwing out a subset of \( x \in [0, 1) \) consisting of finitely many points (a set of measure 0), we can assume that the range of \( q_{\min}(x) \) is contained in \( \{1, \ldots, Q\} \).

First of all, we have that \( q_{\min}(x) = 1 \) if and only if \( x \) lies in the set
\[
I_{0/1} := [0, \delta) \cup (1 - \delta, 1),
\]
and this gives that
\[
p(1) = 2\delta.
\]
If \( x \in [0, 1) \setminus I_{0/1} \) is not one of the finitely many values of \( x \) thrown out in the discussion above then the reduced fraction \( a/q \in (x - \delta, x + \delta) \) with smallest positive denominator is an element of \( \mathcal{F}_Q \).

For each element \( a/q \in \mathcal{F}_Q \) with \( q \geq 2 \), let \( I_{a/q} \) be the subset of \([0, 1)\) defined by
\[
I_{a/q} = \{ x \in [0, 1) : q_{\min}(x) = q, \ a/q \in (x - \delta, x + \delta) \}.
\]
It is not difficult to show that if \( a/q \) and \( \tilde{a}/\tilde{q} \) are distinct reduced fractions with denominator \( q \) then \( I_{a/q} \) and \( I_{\tilde{a}/\tilde{q}} \) are disjoint. This implies that each set \( I_{a/q} \) is an interval, and that it is the set of \( x \in [0, 1) \) for which \( a/q \) is the fraction with smallest positive denominator in the interval \((x - \delta, x + \delta)\). For simplicity in some of the following calculations, we also
write \( I_{a/q} \) for the closure of this interval. Writing \( a'/q' \) and \( a''/q'' \) for the fractions defined by (2), we have the following five possibilities:

(I) If \((qq')^{-1} \geq 2\delta \) and \((qq'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta \) then

\[
I_{a/q} = \left[ \frac{a}{q} - \delta, \frac{a}{q} + \delta \right] \quad \text{and} \quad |I_{a/q}| = 2\delta.
\]

(IIa) If \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta \) and \((qq'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta \) then

\[
I_{a/q} = \left[ \frac{a'}{q'} + \delta, \frac{a}{q} + \delta \right] \quad \text{and} \quad |I_{a/q}| = \frac{1}{qq'}.
\]

(IIb) If \((qq')^{-1} \geq 2\delta \) and \((qq'')^{-1} \leq 2\delta \) then

\[
I_{a/q} = \left[ \frac{a'}{q'} - \delta, \frac{a''}{q''} - \delta \right] \quad \text{and} \quad |I_{a/q}| = \frac{1}{qq''} = \frac{1}{q(q'-q')} - 2\delta.
\]

(IIIa) If \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta, (qq'')^{-1} \leq 2\delta, \) and \((q'q'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta \) then

\[
I_{a/q} = \left[ \frac{a'}{q'} + \delta, \frac{a''}{q''} - \delta \right] \quad \text{and} \quad |I_{a/q}| = \frac{1}{q'q''} - 2\delta = \frac{1}{q'q-q') - 2\delta.
\]

(IIIb) If \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta, (qq'')^{-1} \leq 2\delta, \) and \((q'q'')^{-1} < 2\delta \) then

\[
I_{a/q} = \emptyset \quad \text{and} \quad |I_{a/q}| = 0.
\]

We now divide our analysis of \( p(q) \) into four ranges of \( q \) values, depending on which of possibilities (I)-(IIIb) actually occur. In what follows it is helpful to remember that for \( a/q \in \mathcal{F}_Q \) with \( q \geq 2 \), we have the bounds

\[
\frac{1}{q^2} < \frac{1}{qq'}, \quad \frac{1}{qq''} \leq \frac{1}{q} \quad \text{and} \quad \frac{4}{q^2} \leq \frac{1}{q'q''} \leq \frac{1}{q-1}.
\]

**Case 1** \((2 \leq q \leq (2\delta)^{-1/2})\): In this case only possibility (I) occurs and we have that

\[
p(q) = \sum_{1 \leq q' \leq q} 2\delta = 2\delta \varphi(q).
\]

**Case 2** \(((2\delta)^{-1/2} < q \leq \delta^{-1/2})\): In this case we have that

\[
0 < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq \frac{1}{2\delta q} < q.
\]

- If \( 1 \leq q' \leq q - (2\delta q)^{-1} \) then \((qq')^{-1} \geq 2\delta \) and

\[
\frac{1}{qq'} = \frac{1}{q(q-q')} \leq 2\delta,
\]

and we use the formula from (IIb).
• If \( q - (2\delta q)^{-1} < q' < (2\delta q)^{-1} \) then \((qq')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\) and \((qq'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\), and we use the formula from (I).

• If \((2\delta q)^{-1} \leq q' \leq q\) then \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\) and \((qq'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\), and we use the formula from (IIa).

Summing over these ranges of \( q' \) gives

\[
p(q) = \sum_{1 \leq q' \leq \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \frac{1}{q(q - q')} + \sum_{ \frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < \frac{1}{2\delta q}} 2\delta + \sum_{1/2\delta q \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{qq'} \\
= \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} + \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < \frac{1}{2\delta q}} 2\delta.
\]

**Case 3 \( (\delta^{-1/2} < q \leq (2/\delta)^{1/2}) \):** In this case we have that

\[
0 < \frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq q - \frac{1}{2\delta q} < q.
\]

• If \( 1 \leq q' \leq (2\delta q)^{-1} \) then \((qq')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\) and

\[
\frac{1}{qq''} = \frac{1}{q(q - q')} \leq 2\delta,
\]

and we use the formula from (IIb).

• If \((2\delta q)^{-1} < q' < q - (2\delta q)^{-1} \) then \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta, (qq'')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\), and

\[
\frac{1}{q'q''} \geq \frac{4}{q^2} \geq 2\delta,
\]

and we use the formula from (IIIa).

• If \( q - (2\delta q)^{-1} \leq q' \leq q \) then \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\) and \((qq'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\), and we use the formula from (IIa).

Summing over these ranges of \( q' \) gives

\[
p(q) = \sum_{1 \leq q' \leq \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \frac{1}{q(q - q')} + \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right) + \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{qq'} \\
= \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} + \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right).
\]

(3)

Now notice that

\[
\sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} = \frac{1}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q'} + \frac{1}{q - q'} \right)
\]
\[
= \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \frac{1}{q'}.
\]

Combining this with (3) gives

\[
p(q) = \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < q} \frac{1}{q'} - \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}} 2\delta.
\]

Case 4 \((2/\delta)^{1/2} < q \leq (2\delta)^{-1} + 1\): In this case, as in Case 3, we have that

\[
0 < \frac{1}{2\delta q} < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q} < q.
\]

- If \(1 \leq q' \leq (2\delta q)^{-1}\) then, as in Case 3, \((qq')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\) and \((qq'')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\), and we use the formula from (IIb).

- If \((2\delta q)^{-1} < q' < q - (2\delta q)^{-1}\) then \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\), \((qq'')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\), and we use formulas (Ila) and (Ilb). We have that

\[
\frac{1}{qq'} = \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} \geq 2\delta
\]

if and only if

\[
q' \leq \alpha^-_q \quad \text{or} \quad q' \geq \alpha^+_q,
\]

where

\[
\alpha^\pm_q = \frac{q \pm \sqrt{q^2 - \frac{2}{\delta}}}{2}.
\]

Furthermore it is easy to check that

\[
\frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq \alpha^-_q \leq \alpha^+_q \leq q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}.
\]

- If \(q - (2\delta q)^{-1} \leq q' \leq q\) then, again as in Case 3, \((qq')^{-1} \leq 2\delta\) and \((qq'')^{-1} \geq 2\delta\), and we use the formula from (Iia).

Summing over these ranges of \(q'\) gives

\[
p(q) = \sum_{1 \leq q' \leq \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \frac{1}{qq'} + \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' \leq \alpha^-_q} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right) + \sum_{\alpha^+_q \leq q' < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right) + \sum_{q - \frac{1}{2\delta q} \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{qq'}
\]

\[
= \frac{2}{q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta q} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} + 2 \sum_{\alpha^-_q < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right).
\]
Assembling the results from the four cases described above completes the proof of Theorem 2.

4. Expected value of $q_{\text{min}}$

In this section we will prove Theorem 1. For fixed $\delta \in (0, 1/2)$, the expected value of $q_{\text{min}}$ is

$$E[q_{\text{min}}] = \sum_{1 \leq q \leq \frac{1}{\delta} + 1} qp(q).$$

We estimate this sum by dividing the range of $q$ values into the intervals prescribed in the statement of Theorem 2.

4.1. Contribution from $1 \leq q \leq (2 \delta)^{-1/2}$: For this range of $q$ values we have that

$$\sum_{q \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} qp(q) = 2 \delta \sum_{q \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} q \varphi(q)$$

$$= 2 \delta \sum_{q \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} q^2 \sum_{d \mid q} \frac{\mu(d)}{d}$$

$$= 2 \delta \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} d \mu(d) \sum_{k \leq \frac{1}{d(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} k^2.$$ We estimate this as

$$2 \delta \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} d \mu(d) \left( \frac{1}{3} \left( \frac{1}{d(2 \delta)^{1/2}} \right)^3 + O \left( \left( \frac{1}{d \delta^{1/2}} \right)^2 \right) \right)$$

$$= \frac{1}{3(2 \delta)^{1/2}} \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d^2} + O \left( \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}}} \frac{|\mu(d)|}{d} \right)$$

$$= \frac{1}{3(2 \delta)^{1/2}} \left( \zeta^{-1}(2) + O(\delta^{1/2}) \right) + O(\log(1/\delta))$$

$$= \frac{6 \sqrt{2}}{\pi^2} \frac{1}{6 \cdot \delta^{1/2}} + O(\log(1/\delta)). \quad (4)$$

4.2. Contribution from $(2 \delta)^{-1/2} < q \leq \delta^{-1/2}$: For this range of $q$ values we have that

$$\sum_{\frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}} < q \leq \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}}} qp(q) = 2 \sum_{\frac{1}{(2 \delta)^{1/2}} < q \leq \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{3 \delta q} \leq q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'}$$
We will deal with each of the two double sums on the right hand side separately. For the first we have that

\begin{align*}
2 \sum_{(2\delta)^{1/2} < q \leq \frac{1}{3^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25q} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'}
&= 2 \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{3^{1/2}}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \sum_{\frac{1}{d(2\delta)^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25kd^{2}} \leq \ell \leq \frac{1}{k}} \frac{1}{\ell}.
\end{align*}

(6)

Applying Lemma 3 to the sum over \( \ell \), then to the sum over \( k \), we obtain

\begin{align*}
\sum_{\frac{1}{d(2\delta)^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25kd^{2}} \leq \ell \leq \frac{1}{k}} \frac{1}{\ell}
&= \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \left( \log(2\delta k^{2}d^{2}) + O \left( \delta kd^{2} \right) \right)
&= \left( \log 2 + \sqrt{2} - 2 \right) \frac{1}{d^{1/2}} + O(1).
\end{align*}

Using this estimate, (6) is equal to

\begin{align*}
2 \left( \log 2 + \sqrt{2} - 2 \right) \frac{1}{d^{1/2}} \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d^{2}} + O \left( \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \frac{1}{d} \right)
&= \frac{12}{\pi^{2}} \left( \log 2 + \sqrt{2} - 2 \right) \frac{1}{d^{1/2}} + O \left( \log(1/d) \right) .
\end{align*}

(7)

For the second double sum on the right hand side of (5) we use similar steps to obtain

\begin{align*}
2\delta \sum_{(2\delta)^{1/2} < q \leq \frac{1}{3^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25q} < q' < \frac{1}{25q}} 1
&= 2\delta \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{3^{1/2}}} \mu(d) \sum_{\frac{1}{d(2\delta)^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25kd^{2}} < \ell < \frac{1}{25kd^{2}}} k.
\end{align*}

(8)

For the sums over \( \ell \) and \( k \) we have

\begin{align*}
\sum_{\frac{1}{d(2\delta)^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25kd^{2}} < \ell < \frac{1}{25kd^{2}}} k
&= \sum_{\frac{1}{d^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{1}{d^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{25kd^{2}} < \ell < \frac{1}{25kd^{2}}} k.
\end{align*}
\[
\sum_{d \leq (2\delta)^{1/2}} \frac{1}{d^2} - k^2 + O(k) = \left( \frac{2}{3} - \frac{5}{6\sqrt{2}} \right) \frac{1}{d^3\delta^{3/2}} + O \left( \frac{1}{d^2\delta} \right).
\]

Substituting this into (8), we obtain
\[
\left( \frac{4}{3} - \frac{5}{3\sqrt{2}} \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d^2} + O \left( \sum_{d \leq \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}}} \frac{1}{d} \right) = \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( \frac{4 - 5\sqrt{2}}{3} \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log(1/\delta) \right).
\] (9)

Adding together the estimates from (7) and (9), we have that
\[
\sum_{\frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} < q \leq \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}}} q \mu(q) = \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( 2 \log 2 + \frac{7\sqrt{2}}{6} - \frac{8}{3} \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log(1/\delta) \right).
\] (10)

4.3. Contribution from \(\delta^{-1/2} < q \leq (2/\delta)^{1/2}\): For this range of \(q\) values we have that
\[
\sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} q \mu(q) = 2 \sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} \sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'} - 2\delta \sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} \sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q' < q} 1.
\] (11)

The two double sums here are similar to the ones in the previous case. For the first one we have that
\[
2 \sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} \sum_{\frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'}
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{d \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \sum_{\frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{2^{1/2}}{d\delta^{1/2}}} \sum_{\frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} \leq \ell \leq k} \frac{1}{\ell}
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{d \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \sum_{\frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} < k \leq \frac{2^{1/2}}{d\delta^{1/2}}} \left( \log(2d\delta^2) + O \left( \delta kd^2 \right) \right)
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{d \leq (\frac{2}{\delta})^{1/2}} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \left( \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} \left( \log 2(2\sqrt{2} - 1) + 2 - 2\sqrt{2} \right) + O(1) \right)
\]
\[
= 12 \left( 2\sqrt{2} \log 2 - \log 2 + 2 - 2\sqrt{2} \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log(1/\delta) \right) \cdot
\] (12)
For the second double sum we have that
\[
2\delta \sum_{\frac{1}{\sqrt{\delta}} < q \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} q \sum'_{\frac{1}{2\sqrt{\delta}} < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\delta}}} 1
\]
\[
= 2\delta \sum_{d \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} \mu(d) d \sum_{\frac{1}{\sqrt{\delta}} < k \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta k d^2} < \ell < k - \frac{1}{2\delta k d^2}} k
\]
\[
= 2\delta \sum_{d \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} \mu(d) d \sum_{\frac{1}{\sqrt{\delta}} < k \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} \left( k^2 - \frac{1}{d^2} + O(k) \right)
\]
\[
= 2\delta \sum_{d \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} \mu(d) \left( \frac{1}{d^2} \delta^{3/2} \left( \frac{2}{3} - \sqrt{2} \right) + O \left( \frac{1}{d^2} \right) \right)
\]
\[
= \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( \frac{4}{3} - \frac{2\sqrt{2}}{3} \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log(1/\delta) \right). \quad (13)
\]

Substituting (12) and (13) into (11) gives
\[
\sum_{\frac{1}{\sqrt{\delta}} < q \leq \left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2}} qp(q) = \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( 4\sqrt{2} \log 2 - 2 \log 2 + \frac{8}{3} - \frac{10\sqrt{2}}{3} \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log(1/\delta) \right). \quad (14)
\]

**4.4. Contribution from $\left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2} < q \leq (2\delta)^{-1} + 1$:** Write $Q = \left\lfloor \frac{1}{2\delta} \right\rfloor + 1$. For this range of $q$ values we have that
\[
\sum_{\left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2} < q \leq Q} qp(q) = 2 \sum_{\left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2} < q \leq Q} \sum'_{q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\delta}} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'}
\]
\[
+ 2 \sum_{\left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2} < q \leq Q} q \sum'_{\frac{1}{2\sqrt{\delta}} < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\delta}}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q')} - 2\delta \right). \quad (15)
\]

For the first double sum, we begin by writing it as
\[
2 \sum_{\left(\frac{2}{\delta}\right)^{1/2} < q \leq Q} \sum'_{q - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\delta}} < q' \leq q} \frac{1}{q'}
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{d \leq Q} \mu(d) d \sum_{\frac{1}{\sqrt{\delta}} < k \leq Q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta k d^2} < \ell < k - \frac{1}{2\delta k d^2}} \frac{1}{\ell}
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{d \leq Q} \mu(d) d \sum_{\frac{1}{\sqrt{\delta}} < k \leq Q} \left( - \log \left( 1 - \frac{1}{2\delta k^2 d^2} \right) + O \left( \left( k - \frac{1}{2\delta k d^2} \right)^{-1} \right) \right). \quad (16)
\]

For the main term in the sum over $k$ we use Lemma 3 with
\[
f(t) = - \log(1 - (2\delta t^2 d^2)^{-1})
\]
to obtain

\[
\sum_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}} < k < \frac{Q}{d}} - \log \left(1 - \frac{1}{2\delta k^2 d^2}\right)
\]

\[
= -\log \left(1 - \frac{1}{2\delta Q^2}\right) - \log \left(\frac{4}{3}\right) \lim_{\epsilon \to 0^+} \left[ \frac{\sqrt{2}}{d^{1/2}} - \epsilon \right]
\]

\[+ \int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{2|t|}{2\delta d^3 t^3 - t} \, dt
\]

\[= -\sqrt{2} \log \left(\frac{4}{3}\right) \frac{1}{d^{3/2}} + O\left(\frac{1}{d}\right)
\]

\[+ \int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{2}{2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1} \, dt + O\left(\int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{\{t\}}{t} \frac{1}{2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1} \, dt\right). \tag{17}
\]

We evaluate the first integral here as

\[\int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{2}{2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1} \, dt = \frac{1}{d^2 \delta} \int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{1}{t^2 - (2\delta d^2)^{-1}} \, dt + O(\delta)
\]

\[= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\delta d^{1/2}}} \left[ \log \left( t - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\delta d^{1/2}}} \right) - \log \left( t + \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\delta d^{1/2}}} \right) \right]_{t=\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\delta d}}}
\]

\[= \frac{\sqrt{2}}{2} \log 3 \frac{1}{d^{3/2}} + O\left(\delta + \frac{1}{d}\right). \tag{18}
\]

We divide the consideration of the integral in the error term in (17) into two cases. In both cases, note that the quantity \(2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1\) in the denominator of the integrand is bounded uniformly away from 0. If \(d \leq \delta^{-1/2}\) then

\[\int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{\{t\}}{t} \frac{1}{2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1} \, dt \ll \int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{1}{\delta d^2 t^3} \, dt \ll 1. \tag{19}
\]

If \(d > \delta^{-1/2}\) then let

\[J_1 = [0, 1] \cap \left[ \frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}, \frac{1}{2\delta d} \right] \quad \text{and} \quad J_2 = (1, \infty) \cap \left[ \frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}, \frac{1}{2\delta d} \right].
\]

In this case we also have that

\[\int_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d^{1/2}}}^{\frac{Q}{d}} \frac{\{t\}}{t} \frac{1}{2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1} \, dt \ll \int_{J_1} \frac{1}{2\delta d^2 t^2 - 1} \, dt + \int_{J_2} \frac{1}{\delta d^2 t^3} \, dt
\]

\[\ll 1 + \frac{1}{\delta d^2} \ll 1. \tag{20}
\]
Combining estimates (18)-(20) we have that (17), which is the main term in the sum over $k$ in (16), is equal to
\[
\left(\frac{3\sqrt{2}\log 3}{2} - 2\sqrt{2}\log 2\right) \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} + O(1).
\]
For the error term in the sum over $k$ in (16), first note that
\[
\left( k - \frac{1}{2\delta kd^2} \right)^{-1} = \frac{1}{k} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2\delta kd^2} \right) < \frac{2}{k}
\]
for $k \geq 2^{1/2}/(d\delta^{1/2})$. This gives
\[
\sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta kd^2} < k \leq Q} \left( k - \frac{1}{2\delta kd^2} \right)^{-1} \ll \log (1/\delta).
\]
Thus we find that (16) is equal to
\[
2 \sum_{d \leq Q} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \left( \left( \frac{3\sqrt{2}\log 3}{2} - 2\sqrt{2}\log 2\right) \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} + O(\log (1/\delta)) \right) = \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( 3\sqrt{2}\log 3 - 4\sqrt{2}\log 2 \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O(\log^2 \delta).
\]
(21)

Next, we come to the estimate for the second double sum in (15). First of all, we have that
\[
2 \sum_{(\frac{1}{2})^{1/2} < q \leq Q} \sum_{\alpha_q^+ < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q'(q - q') - 2\delta} \right)
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{(\frac{1}{2})^{1/2} < q \leq Q} \sum_{\alpha_q^+ < q' < q - \frac{1}{2\delta q}} \left( \frac{1}{q} + \frac{1}{q - q'} - 2\delta q \right)
\]
\[
= 2 \sum_{d \leq Q} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta kd^2} < k \leq Q} \sum_{\frac{1}{2\delta kd^2} < \ell < k - \frac{1}{2\delta kd^2}} \left( \frac{1}{\ell} + \frac{1}{k - \ell} - 2\delta kd^2 \right)
\]
(22)

For the sum over $\ell$ we apply Lemma 4 with
\[
f(t) = \frac{1}{t} + \frac{1}{k - t} - 2\delta d^2 k.
\]
Write $x = \frac{\alpha_q^+}{d}$ and $y = k - \frac{1}{2\delta kd^2}$. Then
\[
\sum_{x < \ell < y} \left( \frac{1}{\ell} + \frac{1}{k - \ell} - 2\delta kd^2 \right)
\]
\[
= \int_x^y f(t) \, dt + \int_x^y \{t\} f'(t) \, dt + O\left( |f(x)| + |f(y)| \right)
\]
\[
= \int_x^y f(t) \, dt + \int_x^y \{t\} f'(t) \, dt + O\left( \frac{1}{k} \right).
\]
For the first integral on the right hand side is easily seen to be equal to
\[
\int_x^y f(t) \, dt = \log \left( \frac{2}{\delta} \frac{2\delta k^2 d^2 - 1}{(kd + \sqrt{k^2 d^2 - 2/\delta})^2} \right) - \frac{2}{\delta} \frac{1}{(kd + \sqrt{k^2 d^2 - 2/\delta})^2}.
\]

To estimate the second integral note that the function
\[
f(t) = k \left( \frac{1}{t(k - t)} - 2\delta d^2 \right)
\]
is strictly increasing for \( t > k/2 \). Since \( x > k/2 \), we can use this fact to deduce that
\[
\left| \int_x^y \{t\} f'(t) \, dt \right| = \int_x^y \{t\} |f'(t)| \, dt \leq \int_x^y |f'(t)| \, dt = f(y) - f(x) \ll \frac{1}{k}.
\]

Using these estimates, the sum over \( k \) in (22) is equal to
\[
\sum_{\frac{2^{1/2}}{d}\delta^{1/2} < k \leq \frac{Q}{d}} \left( g(k) - h(k) + O \left( \frac{1}{k} \right) \right),
\]
with
\[
g(t) = \log \left( \frac{2}{\delta} \frac{2\delta t^2 d^2 - 1}{(td + \sqrt{t^2 d^2 - 2/\delta})^2} \right)
\]
and
\[
h(t) = \frac{2}{\delta} \frac{1}{(td + \sqrt{t^2 d^2 - 2/\delta})^2}.
\]

We claim that the function \( g(t) \) is decreasing for \( t \geq \frac{2^{1/2}}{d}\delta^{1/2} \). To see this, write
\[
\frac{1}{\delta} \frac{2\delta t^2 d^2 - 1}{(td + \sqrt{t^2 d^2 - 2/\delta})^2} = \frac{1 - (2\delta t^2 d^2)^{-1}}{1 - (z - 1)^{-1}} = \frac{2z - 1 + \sqrt{4z - 3}}{z},
\]
with \( z = 1 - (2\delta t^2 d^2)^{-1} \), and note that the derivative of this function with respect to \( z \) is negative for \( 3/4 < z < 1 \). Now writing \( x = \frac{2^{1/2}}{d}\delta^{1/2} \) and \( y = \frac{1}{2d} \) we apply Lemma 4 to obtain
\[
\sum_{x < k \leq \frac{Q}{d}} g(k) = \int_x^y g(t) \, dt + O \left( g(x) + g \left( \frac{Q}{d} \right) \right) = \int_x^y g(t) \, dt + O (1).
\]

Substituting \( s = \delta^{1/2}td \) in the integral gives
\[
\int_x^y g(t) \, dt = \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} \int_{\sqrt{2}}^{2x/\delta^{1/2}} \log \left( \frac{2s^2 - 1}{s + \sqrt{s^2 - 2}} \right) \, ds
\]
\[
= \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} \left[ s \log \left( \frac{2s^2 - 1}{s + \sqrt{s^2 - 2}} \right) + \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \log \left( \frac{\sqrt{2} s + 1}{\sqrt{2} s - 1} \right) + 2\sqrt{s^2 - 2} - 2s \right]_{s = \sqrt{2}}^{s = \frac{x}{\delta^{1/2}}}.
\]
\[
= \left( 2\sqrt{2} - \frac{3\sqrt{2} \log 3}{2} \right) \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \frac{1}{d} \right). 
\]  

(24)

Similarly, the function \( h(t) \) is strictly decreasing for \( t > 0 \) so applying Lemma 4 gives

\[
\sum_{x < k \leq y} h(k) = \int_x^y h(t) \, dt + O \left( h(x) + h(y) \right) = \int_x^y h(t) \, dt + O \left( 1 \right).
\]

Again substituting \( s = \delta^{1/2}td \) gives

\[
\int_x^y h(t) \, dt = \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} \int_{\frac{1}{2\delta^{1/2}}}^{\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}} \frac{2}{(s + \sqrt{s^2 - 2})^2} \, ds
\]

\[
= \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} \left[ \frac{1}{3}s^3 - \frac{1}{3}(s^2 - 2)^{3/2} - s \right]_{s=\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}}^{s=\frac{1}{2\delta^{1/2}}}
\]

\[
= \frac{\sqrt{2}}{3} \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \frac{1}{d} \right). 
\]  

(25)

Using (24) and (25) in (23), the double sum from equation (22) becomes

\[
2 \sum_{d \leq Q} \frac{\mu(d)}{d} \left( \frac{5\sqrt{2}}{3} - \frac{3\sqrt{2} \log 3}{2} \right) \frac{1}{d\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log \left( 1/\delta \right) \right)
\]

\[
= \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( \frac{10\sqrt{2}}{3} - 3\sqrt{2} \log 3 \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log^2 \delta \right). 
\]  

(26)

Substituting (21) and (26) into (15), we have that

\[
\sum_{(\frac{x}{y})^{1/2} < q \leq Q} q \mu(q) = \frac{6}{\pi^2} \left( \frac{10\sqrt{2}}{3} - 4\sqrt{2} \log 2 \right) \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log^2 \delta \right). 
\]  

(27)

Finally, summing the contributions from (4), (10), (14), and (27), we obtain

\[
E[q_{\min}] = \frac{6}{\pi^2} \frac{4\sqrt{2}}{3} \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log^2 \delta \right) = \frac{8\sqrt{2}}{\pi^2} \frac{1}{\delta^{1/2}} + O \left( \log^2 \delta \right),
\]

which completes the proof of Theorem 1.

### References


Department of Mathematics,
University of Houston,
Houston, TX, United States.
hchen60@uh.edu, haynes@math.uh.edu