Gravitational waves from accretion-induced descalarization in massive scalar-tensor theory

Hao-Jui Kuan,1,2,* Arthur G. Suvorov,3 Daniela D. Doneva,1,4 and Stoytcho S. Yazadjiev1,5,6

1Theoretical Astrophysics, Eberhard Karls University of Tübingen, Tübingen 72076, Germany
2Department of Physics, National Tsing Hua University, Hsinchu 300, Taiwan
3Manly Astrophysics, 15/41-42 East Esplanade, Manly, NSW 2095, Australia
4INRNE - Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, 1784 Sofia, Bulgaria
5Department of Theoretical Physics, Faculty of Physics, Sofia University, Sofia 1164, Bulgaria
6Institute of Mathematics and Informatics, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Acad. G. Bonchev St. 8, Sofia 1113, Bulgaria

(Dated: March 9, 2022)

Many classes of extended scalar-tensor theories predict that dynamical instabilities can take place at high energies, leading to the formation of scalarized neutron stars. Depending on the theory parameters, stars in a scalarized state can form a solution-space branch that shares a lot of similarities with the so-called mass twins in general relativity appearing for equations of state containing first-order phase transitions. Members of this scalarized branch have a lower maximum mass and central energy density compared to Einstein ones. In such cases, a scalarized star could potentially over-accrete beyond the critical mass limit, thus triggering a gravitational phase transition where the star sheds its scalar hair and migrates over to its non-scalarized counterpart. Such an event resembles, though is distinct from, a nuclear or thermodynamic phase transition. We dynamically track a gravitational transition by first constructing hydrostatic, scalarized equilibria for realistic equations of state, and then allowing additional material to fall onto the stellar surface. The resulting bursts of monopolar radiation are dispersively-stretched to form a quasi-continuous signal that persists for decades, carrying strains of order $\geq 10^{-22} (\text{kHz/L})^{3/2} \text{Hz}^{-1/2}$ at frequencies of $\leq 300 \text{ Hz}$, detectable with the existing interferometer network out to distances of $L \leq 10 \text{ kpc}$, and out to a few hundred kpc with the inclusion of the Einstein Telescope. Electromagnetic signatures of such events, involving gamma-ray and neutrino bursts, are also considered.

Introduction. General relativity (GR) has historically provided an excellent description for both local (e.g., solar system) and global (e.g., cosmology) gravitational phenomena. It is well known however that the theory cannot by itself be fully complete, and the non-renormalizability of the action implies that additional ingredients, possibly in the form of non-minimally coupled fields [1, 2], should activate at extreme scales. Nevertheless, any theoretical extension must be virtually invisible at low energies, and also somehow suppressed in certain strong-field environments. For example, binary pulsar experiments restrict the possibility for significant sub-quadrupolar radiation over super-Compton length scales [3–7], and gravitational-wave (GW) experiments suggest that (at least some) black holes should be approximately, if not exactly, Kerr [8]. An observationally-viable class of extensions that can survive these issues is massive scalar-tensor theory (STT): the mass of the scalar field suppresses the scalar dipole radiation [9, 10], and the classical no-hair theorems tend to be respected [11], implying that astrophysically stable black holes would be indistinguishable from their GR counterparts.

Material degrees of freedom in these theories however allow for the possibility of scalarized stars [12]. This phenomenon can be generally thought of as a consequence of the effective curvature-coupled mass term, which appears in the relevant Klein-Gordon equation, changing sign once some critical threshold is breached, thereby inducing a tachyonic instability (though see also Ref. [13]). Thus for neutron stars a critical compactness exists at which a branch of strongly scalarized solutions emerges. In some cases, the heaviest scalarized neutron star has lower baryon mass and lower central energy density compared to the maximum mass (stable) non-scalarized neutron star [14] and there is a gap between the two branches where no stable neutron star solutions exist. This picture resembles very closely the so-called mass twins in pure GR that are manifestations of the presence of first order phase transition in the equation of state [15–18] This implies that if a near-critical scalarized star were to acquire additional mass through accretion, the system may promptly discharge its scalar hair. Importantly, the neutron star needs not to collapse to a black hole in this scenario, as considered in, e.g., [19–22], but rather may undergo a gravitational phase transition, distinct from a material (e.g., hadron-quark) phase transition [23], and migrate to the GR branch pertaining to the same equation of state (EOS). This novel scenario is considered in this Letter. We begin by constructing hydrostatic equilibria in a massive STT, and then allow additional material to fall onto the stellar surface until the point of descalarization, so as to dynamically track the migration process.

A migration to a new branch is likely to carry a variety of observational signatures. As a scalar shedding necessarily compactifies the star over a short, dynamical timescale ($\geq \text{ms}$), abrupt changes in the electromagnetic output of the source, most notably those associated with gamma-ray burst (GRB) afterglows and neutrino bursts [24–26], would point towards such a transition. These signatures could, however, be imitated by a nuclear phase transition [27–32], thus highlighting the well-known degeneracy between effects coming from a modification of gravity and the uncertainties in the nuclear EOS (e.g., Sec. 4 of [33]). One key difference is that a gravitational transition will unleash a burst of scalar radiation which, for a massive theory, will be dispersively stretched into a quasi-continuous signal, as higher frequency components are first to arrive at the detector(s) [21]. GW afterglows lasting up to a ~kyr may therefore be expected following a gravitational
phase transition. We quantify the distances, as a function of the theory’s coupling parameters, out to which such events may be observable with existing and upcoming GW interferometers.

Formalism and equations of motion. The action of a STT of whichever flavor [e.g., Brans-Dicke, Bergmann-Wagoner, and even \( f(R) \) theories] can be transformed into the Einstein frame

\[
S = \int \frac{\sqrt{-\tilde{g}}}{16\pi} \left( R - 2\partial_\mu\varphi\partial^\mu\varphi - 4V \right) + S_M[\Psi, A^2g_{\mu\nu}], \tag{1}
\]

for matter portion \( S_M \), metric tensor \( g \), scalar field \( \varphi \). Ricci scalar \( R \) and scalar field potential for which we take the following form \( V(\varphi) = m_s^2\varphi^2/2 \). The saddle point of \( V \) poses the boundary condition \( \varphi_0 := \varphi(r \to \infty) = 0 \) for \( \varphi \). The transition to the physical Jordan frame metric \( \tilde{g}_{\mu\nu} \) is done via a Weyl scaling \( \tilde{g}_{\mu\nu} = A(\varphi)^2g_{\mu\nu} \), where we choose the conformal factor \( A(\varphi) = \exp(\alpha_0\varphi + \beta_0\varphi^2/2) \). We adopt the spherically-symmetric Jordan frame metric ansatz, \( \tilde{g}_{\mu\nu} = \text{diag}[-\alpha^2, X^2, A(\varphi)^2r^2, A(\varphi)^2r^2\sin^2\theta] \), for which the resulting field equations are lengthy thus their explicit forms are given in the Supplemental Material.

Using the field equations and introducing the auxiliary variables \( \psi = \alpha^{-1}(\partial\varphi/\partial t) \) and \( \eta = X^{-1} (\partial\varphi/\partial r) \), we can derive the energy \( E_\varphi \) and luminosity \( L_\varphi \) of the scalar field as

\[
E_\varphi = \int \frac{r^2A(\varphi)^2}{2}(\psi^2 + \eta^2) + Vdr, \quad L_\varphi = r^2X\alpha\psi\eta, \tag{2}
\]

which defines the corresponding energy leakage as

\[
E_{(\text{scalar})}^{(\text{GW})} = \int L_\varphi dt. \tag{3}
\]

We note that no conservation law applies to the quantity \( E_\varphi - E_{(\text{GW})}^{(\text{scalar})} \), since the scalar field couples to the material energy. Instead, the conserved energy is \( M - E_{(\text{GW})}^{(\text{scalar})} \) for the (gravitational) mass \( M \) of the star; this conservation law is satisfied in our code within an error of \( \leq 10^{-6}M_\odot \).

Two additional GW modes are raised by \( \varphi \), viz. the breathing (‘B’) and longitude (‘E’) modes, which carry the same response functions up to a sign flip (see Eq. (134) of [34]). The strain of the latter mode is reduced by a factor of \((\lambda_\varphi f)^{-2}\) relative to the former, which reads \( h_\varphi = 2\alpha_0\varphi \). The strain felt by a LIGO-VIRGO-like array (two orthogonal antennas) is thus

\[
h(L, t) = h_\varphi(L, t)\{1 - [\lambda_\varphi f(L, t)]^{-2}\}/2, \tag{4}
\]

when the source orients optimally, where \( \lambda_\varphi \) \equiv 2\pi\hbar/m_\varphi \) is the Compton length-scale for the massive scalar field, \( r \) is the retarded time post-emission, and \( f(L, t) \) is the characteristic frequency of the signal. Low frequency modes are screened at \( r > \lambda_\varphi \), while the near-zone (\( r \ll \lambda_\varphi \)) dynamics of \( \varphi \) are to a large measure unaffected by the dispersion and reduce to the results of the massless case. On the other hand, high frequency components propagate at subluminal velocities. As a result, the dispersively-stretched waveform becomes quasi-monochromatic over a \( L \)- and \( m_\varphi \)-dependent timescale \( [21, 35] \). In contrast to the burst-like data stream, the full spectrum of the power-spectral density (PSD) \( 2\sqrt{f}\tilde{h}(f) \) will not reach the observatory simultaneously, but will arrive sequentially; therefore, there is an implicit time-dependence, encoded in the characteristic frequency, for the witness. The quasi-monochromatic feature implies that a phase-coherent search can be implemented, to which the signal-to-noise ratio (SNR), \( S/N = \int [\tilde{h}(f)]^2/S_n(f) \), can be obtained by integrating over a narrow frequency interval around \( f(t) \). In the limit \( T_f \gg 1 \), i.e., when many cycles are observed, the frequency-domain integral equates to the time-domain integral for the strain over the observation timescale (Parseval’s theorem), thus the SNR depends on the observation duration \( T \) (e.g., [36]) as well as the retarded time that is relevant to the characteristic frequency \( f(t) \) of the signal. Specifically, [21] shows that the SNR can be obtained by dividing the effective PSD resulting from the aforementioned time-domain integration,

\[
\sqrt{S_f} = \frac{\sqrt{\pi A(L, t)}}{2}\{1 - [\lambda_\varphi f(L, t)]^{-2}\}, \tag{5}
\]

by the noise spectral curve \( \sqrt{S_n(f)} \), where we assume an optimally-oriented detector. Here the amplitude is \( A(L, t) = 2\pi(f)L^{-3/2}\lambda_\varphi [f^2 - (\lambda_\varphi)^{-2}]^{3/4} \) with \( A(f) \) the Fourier component of the scalar-GW extracted at some distance \( \lambda_\varphi < r \ll L \) so that it contains the content of the wave that will later propagate to a detector at \( L \) (cf. Eq. (57) in [21]), while noting that our definition for \( A \) differs from theirs by a factor of \( L^{-1} \).

Scalarized neutron stars. In the present Letter, we adopt the APR4 EOS, and more precisely its piecewise polytropic approximation [37], which withstands constraints coming from GW 170817 [38], and supports masses which accommodate the heaviest neutron star observed to-date, viz. PSR J0740+6620 (\( M = 2.14_{-0.09}^{+0.10}M_\odot \)) [39]. In the considered STT and for large enough stellar compactness, the neutron star scalarizes, meaning it develops a strong, localized scalar field. This is demonstrated in Fig. 1 where we plot stellar equilibria for \( \alpha_0 = 10^{-2}, \beta_0 = -5 \), and \( m_\varphi = 10^{-15} \text{eV} \) (yellow and red curves; see below) as well the GR branch \((\alpha = 0)\) for comparison. This value of \( m_\varphi \) mitigates the tension with binary-pulsar constraints since radiation is suppressed over super-Compton length-scales \( r \gg \lambda_\varphi \) [4, 9, 10]. The parameters are chosen such that a picture close to the so-called mass twins in pure GR [15–18], connected to first order phase transitions in the high density matter equation of state, is observed. Thus, a phase transition (descalarization) starting from the yellow to the red branch can be realized. This is possible due to the fact that the maximal mass for the scalarized branch (2.118\(M_\odot\)) is less than that for the GR branch (2.168\(M_\odot\)). We should note that strictly speaking, in the STT we consider, the red branch will always have some small nonzero value of the scalar field due to the nonzero \( \alpha \), i.e., it will be very weakly scalarized. A phase transition from the yellow to the red branch will shed off most of scalar energy but a tiny residual scalar field will always be left. For practical purposes, however, the blue (GR) and the red branch are virtually indistinguishable at high densities and
FIG. 1. Hydrostatic equilibria for $\alpha_0 = 10^{-2}$, $\beta_0 = -5$ and $m_\varphi = 10^{-14}$ eV, for the APR4 EOS. The scalarized branch is divided in two parts, with the yellow one being strongly-scalarized and the red one possessing a very weak scalar field, which virtually coincides with the GR case ($\alpha = 0$; blue curve). The maximum mass of the blue and red sequences is $2.16 M_\odot$, while the strongly-scalarized configuration (yellow line) can only support masses up to $2.118 M_\odot$. The black star represents the initial state for the simulations.

thus with a slight abuse of language, we call the red branch of neutron star solutions descalarized ones.

Accretion dynamics. A neutron star that over-accretes beyond the peak of the scalarized curve displayed in Fig. 1 will undergo a phase transition to the GR branch. This scenario may occur either for a newborn star after a merger or collapse through fallback accretion, or a mature star in a binary undergoing Roche-lobe overflow. In the former case, debris disks containing $\lesssim 0.2 M_\odot$ worth of material [25], though potentially much more in a core-collapse [40], will form around the birth site. A sizeable fraction of it may eventually fall back onto the stellar surface [41]. Accreted masses may total $\lesssim 0.8 M_\odot$ in some X-ray binaries [42], though such amounts can accumulate only over long (potentially $\sim$ Gyr) timescales. The details of the accretion process itself are complicated however, since the neutron star may be spinning rapidly enough that material is repelled by a centrifugal barrier (‘propeller’ effect [40]), pressure gradients from nucleosynthetic heating can accelerate ejecta before it has a chance to return [43], and material will not fall isotropically onto the surface but rather may be guided onto the magnetic poles by the Lorentz force [44].

In this Letter however, our main goal is not to simulate a realistic accretion process in a STT, but rather to illustrate qualitatively how the dynamical acquisition of additional mass can trigger a descalarization. To this end, accretion is artificially simulated by superposing a radial, Gaussian bulk centred at $0.9 R_\star$, for stellar radius $R_\star$, with a width (“standard deviation”) of 1 km, every 4 ms. The process is then halted when a total (baryon) mass of $0.015 M_\odot$ has been added (after 16.01 ms). The average accretion rate is $M_\dot{\alpha} \approx 0.94 M_\odot s^{-1}$, which is marginally slower than the numerical result of $\lesssim 1 M_\odot s^{-1}$ over the first few ms of merger simulations (cf. Fig. 7 of [45]).

The (post-)descalarization dynamics described here remains the same if the bulk is accreted with longer waiting time; in particular, we see just negligible changes in the emitted energy, the duration of scalar-peeling process, and the scalar GW waveform for the double interval, viz. 8 ms, between consecutive bulks. To verify that our results are not overly sensitive to the particulars of the chosen accretion profile, a second profile, where to-be-accreted material is instead placed outside of the star, is investigated in the Supplemental material. Nevertheless, we stress that neither profile is representative of a realistic astrophysical process, though they allow us to capture the salient features of a gravitational phase transition.

Results. The left-hand plot in Fig. 2 shows the evolutionary track of a particular scalarized model, initially with gravitational mass of $\sim 2.106 M_\odot$. The strongly scalarized star undergoes a phase transition after the accretion completes, and heads to the non-scalarized branch. The descalarization lasts $\sim 4.4$ ms. We have numerically verified that the final state indeed coincides with the descalarized, equilibrium one within an error of less than 2% that decreases monotonically with increasing simulation resolution. The onset and offset of the phase transition to the scalar-free state are chosen as the moments when the last bulk has been accreted and the final state is formed, respectively. After the descalarization, the model oscillates about a certain, stable state as shown in the inset in the bottom-left panel.

The middle of Fig. 2 shows the scalar energy (top panel), the flux of the scalar radiation at some radii (middle panel), and the associated energy loss (bottom panel) as functions of retired time. The scalar energy (2) drops very close to zero after descalarization (top panel). The near zone ($r \ll \lambda_\varphi$) extraction of the luminosity at a point where its value has already saturated suggests an energy loss (blue curve in the bottom panel) $\gtrsim 40$ times less than the decrease of $E_\varphi$, indicating that most of the scalar energy transforms into gravitational binding energy since the stellar radius shrinks from 11.56 km to 10.36 km between the initial and the final states, while the (gravitational) mass increases by $\approx 0.013 M_\odot$. After the emission propagates to those distances comparable to $\lambda_\varphi$, the dispersion suppresses the low frequency component and leads to a stretching on the waveform. In the bottom panel, we see that the energy leakage to infinity in the scalar sector is $\sim 6 \times 10^{-4} M_\odot$ (green and light blue curves), which is less than the energy carried by the scalar radiation in the near zone (blue curve) by a factor of $\sim 2$ due to the dispersion.

Assuming an observation duration of $T \sim 2$ months for the GW, over which the signal is slowly evolving for $m_\varphi = 10^{-14}$ eV [21], we present the numerical result of the signal amplitude (5) for scalar GW with the retarded time spanning from 1 to $10^3$ years in the right panel of Fig. 2. The $k$-th notch, starting from the right, plotted over the signal (black) curve stands for $t = 10^k (k-1)$ years. Together with the results for models with smaller $\alpha$, though not shown here, we find a fitting to the effective PSD, in units of Hz$^{-1/2}$, as

$$\sqrt{S_f} \approx 3 \left( \frac{\alpha_0}{10^{-2}} \right) \frac{T}{5 \times 10^6 \mathrm{s}} \left( \frac{10 \mathrm{kpc}}{L} \right) \left( \frac{f}{300 \mathrm{Hz}} \right)^{0.34} (6)$$

with the frequency of the signal approximated as $f(L, t) \approx 2.42(t + L)/\sqrt{t(t + 2L)} \ Hz$ (cf. Eq. (53) in [21]). We note
that larger $T$ may be used for greater retarded times since the
 timescale for the frequency evolution, $f \dot{f}$, scales as $t$, thus
 opening the possibility for much larger effective PSD. In par-
 ticular, since the signal (6) is quasi-continuous, an extended
 narrow-band search could be carried out if one knew when the
 system descalarized, as the dispersion relation directly equates
 the relative delay with a frequency. Furthermore, multiple sen-
 sors can act to ‘fuse’ data together in a way that improves the
 overall signal-to-noise ratio beyond that inferred from equa-
 tion (6) (see Sec. IV. E. of [46] for a detailed comparison of
 achievable sensitivities with different networks).

**Connection to matter phase transitions.** The phase transi-
 tions from scalarized to non-scalarized states considered here
 bear striking similarities to the material phase transitions
 from confined hadronic to deconfined quark matter. In both cases,
 there can be stars of equal mass but different radii, that are
 separated by a range of central energy densities where the
 stable solution space is empty (i.e., twin stars [15–18]). The
 astrophysical implications of matter phase transitions, and es-
 pecially the GW signatures, have attracted considerable at-
 tention recently (see, e.g., [27–32]). In each case there will be
 a descalarization analogue, with the main difference being an
 additional channel for energy loss – the scalar radiation. Thus
 the degeneracy between effects coming from a modification of
 gravity and from EOS uncertainty goes far beyond the stand-
 ard paradigm, demonstrating once again the importance of
 searching for strategies to break this degeneracy.

Although we concentrate on accretion in this Letter, some
 interesting examples of such analogues can be found also in
 cases without accretion. For a hot, newborn neutron star with
 an EOS that permits negatively charged, non-leptonic particles
 (e.g., hyperons or quarks), the hydrostatic support available to
 the star will reduce when neutrinos diffuse out of the core as
 the system cools [47]. This can lead to a delayed phase transi-
tion with a number of interesting observational signatures [29].
 Naturally, a descalarization analogue of this delayed transition
 will exist: depending on the chemical composition and the-
 ory parameters, the scalarized star may migrate to a non- or
 weakly-scalarized branch when the temperature drops below a
 critical threshold (cf. superfluid phase transitions also [48]).
 A similar picture exists for the case of differential rotation, which
 is likely to be damped out (or at least reduced to a Ferraro pro-
 file) in a few tens of ms post-formation due to the magnetically-
 driven, turbulent viscosity [49]. Studying these processes in
detail lies beyond the scope of the present paper since it re-
 quires a nonlinear evolution of a hot and differentially-rotating,
scalarized neutron star. It is clear, though, that complementing
the scalar-flavour phase transition to the studies of neutron star
 mergers in STT will offer rich phenomenology as concerns
the evolutionary track of neutron stars (see also below). This
will be on one hand due to the additional channel of energy
loss that, even if not detectable, will alter the merger remnant
evolution. On the other hand, some properties of the post-
merger remnant, such as its oscillations frequencies, can be
very different compared to GR, due to the change in the stellar
structure for scalarized neutron stars [30].

**Discussion and observational prospects.** While a detection
of scalar GWs of the form shown in Fig. 2 could be used to un-
ambiguously identify that a descalarization took place, (mas-
 sive) STTs may already leave traces in the events that lead up
to the transition. In particular, a promising avenue for the for-
mation of scalarized stars, which are then particular prone to
over-accretion and descalarization, comes from binary merg-
ers. The scalar field associated with the binary constituents
may become excited during the late stages of inspiral, leaving
a clear imprint on the GW signal by accelerating the coales-
cence and reducing the number of orbital cycles [30] (see also
[51–53]). Despite progress though, certain key effects, such as
rotation, are still missing from numerical simulations of mergers in STTs. This means that direct waveform comparisons with observed inspirals cannot be achieved yet. On the electromagnetic side, however, binary neutron-star merger events are also the progenitors for short GRBs, which offer avenues for indirectly observing a descalarization.

Many GRBs exhibit extended emissions at short-wavelengths following the main burst. Emission profiles that display a prominent and long-lived X-ray ‘plateau’ are especially suggestive of persistent energy injections from a massive, newborn neutron star [24, 25]. Suppose that tensorial GWs were coincidentally observed with a short GRB (as occurred for GW170817 [54]), followed by a plateau-like X-ray afterglow. The detection of a scalar GW afterglow some time after the main event, which may persist for ~ centuries, would clearly indicate that the remnant peeled its scalar hair. Note in particular that the time at which the descalarization occurred can be determined from the radiation frequency given a field mass $m_{\phi}$; see Fig. 2. Even without such a detection, the nature of the afterglow will be affected by a scalar shedding as the star compactifies. The spin-down power associated with magnetic dipole braking scales as $L_{\text{dip}} \propto R_\star^6$ (e.g., [25]), for example, and so a decrease in $R_\star$ by ~ 5% may then lead to a drop in the X-ray flux by ~ 30% over the descalarization timescale (~ 5 ms). Afterglow light-curves in this case may appear as ‘broken plateaux’, such as observed in GRB 170714A [55]. Conservation of angular momentum however implies that the star should spin-up as a result of descalarization, and thus the drop may be less pronounced because $L_{\text{dip}} \propto \Omega^5$. Likewise, the temperature of the star should increase from the compactification. Magnetohydrodynamic processes involving magnetic field reorganization may also take place, extending the dip timescale and enriching the phenomenology.

Modelling magnetized, rotating stars with hot EOS is much more challenging than for static, cold ones, and studying such cases lies beyond our current computational tools. This would be worth investigating in future though, as a number of possibilities arise. For example, the star’s centrifugal barrier may activate, halting further accretion after descalarization, which may carry its own brand of signatures [40]. Furthermore, a descalarization-induced compactification may itself instigate a nuclear phase transition (e.g., quark deconfinement) due to the sudden increase in the core density [29, 47]. If consecutive transitions like this occurred in a massive STT, the tensorial GWs from the nuclear transition would be expected to arrive at the detectors before the scalar mode(s) because of dispersion.

It is also worth pointing out that a descalarization event could also occur in the collapse of a scalarized neutron star to a hairless black hole. From a scalar-GW perspective, these events would be indistinguishable [22], though they can be told apart via the nature of the X-ray afterglow. If the plateau persisted after the scalar radiation was emitted, a gravitational phase-transition would be the favoured scenario since black hole formation, which would effectively terminate the stellar wind that is providing the radiation energy, should instead manifest as a sharp drop in the flux (as is often observed [26]). The closest GRBs that have thus far been observed are GRBs 980425 and 170817A at distances of ~ 40 Mpc [54, 56]. This distance is a factor ~ 4000 times larger than that plotted in Fig. 2. As such, unless $\alpha_0$ takes a value larger than that which we have used by a factor $\geq 10$ and year-long ($T \gsim \text{yr}$) searches are carried out, we are unlikely to observe this scenario in its full capacity even with Cosmic Explorer (CE) [57] or Einstein Telescope (ET) [58, 59] – ET-D in particular [60], given the $L^{-3/2}$ dependence in the effective PSD (6), should such stars exist. Other multi-messenger possibilities for identifying a neutron star post-descalarization come from neutrino bursts (from Urca cooling or shocks triggered by compactification; cf. [61]) or indeed a burst of GWs (if the now descalarized star collapses) at some later time, either of which again would be hard to explain with a black hole remnant. It is also not necessarily the case that a neutron star must descalarize shortly after birth. Mature stars residing in the disks of active galactic nuclei or in high-mass X-ray binaries [62] are particularly disposed to over-accretion, with accretion-induced collapse rates reaching anything up to $\lesssim 20 \mathrm{Gpc}^{-3} \text{yr}^{-1}$ from the former channel [63]. Overall, however, in the absence of a detection of scalar GWs, one may not be able to tell whether a phase transition was of a nuclear or gravitational nature. This exemplifies further the degeneracy between modifications of gravity and EOS uncertainty.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

We are grateful to Professor Jürgen Schaffner-Bielich for carefully reading the manuscript and providing valuable advice which improved the quality of this Letter. DD acknowledges financial support via an Emmy Noether Research Group funded by the German Research Foundation (DFG) under grant no. DO 1771/1-1. SY would like to thank the University of Tübingen for the financial support. The partial support by the Bulgarian NSF Grant KP-06-H28/7 is acknowledged.

* hao-ju.i.kuan@uni-tuebingen.de


**SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL**

**REDUCED FIELD EQUATIONS**

For the spherically-symmetric Jordan frame metric ansatz adopted here, viz.

\[ \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} = \text{diag}[-\alpha^2, X^2, A(\varphi)^2 r^2, A(\varphi)^2 r^2 \sin^2 \theta], \]

the conformally-related, Einstein-frame metric reads

\[ g_{\mu\nu} = \text{diag}[-A(\varphi)^{-2} \alpha^2, A(\varphi)^{-2} X^2, r^2, r^2 \sin^2 \theta] \]

\[ := \text{diag}[-e^{2\Phi}, e^{2\Lambda}, r^2, r^2 \sin^2 \theta], \]

where the local mass \( m(r) \) is related to the metric potential \( \Lambda \) via

\[ e^{2\Lambda} = \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1}. \]

The corresponding ‘Einstein’ equations then read (see also Eqs. (2.21)-(2.23) in [64]) together with Eq. (6) in [35])

\[ m' = 4\pi r^2 A(\varphi)^4 \left(\frac{\rho h}{1-v^2} - P\right) + r^2 \left[A(\varphi)^2 \left(\psi^2 + \eta^2\right)^2 + V\right], \]

\[ \bar{m} = r^2 \alpha X \left[A(\varphi)^2 \psi \eta - 4\pi A(\varphi)^4 \left(\frac{\rho hv}{1-v^2}\right)\right], \]

and

\[ \Phi' = X^2 \left[\frac{m}{r^2} - rV\right] A(\varphi)^{-2} + 4\pi r^2 A(\varphi)^2 \left(\frac{\rho hv^2}{1-v^2} + P\right) + \frac{r}{2} \left(\psi^2 + \eta^2\right), \]

(10c)
for density $\rho$, pressure $P$, enthalpy $h$, and the 4-velocity

$$u^\mu = \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 - v^2}}(\alpha^{-1}, \nu X^{-1}, 0, 0).$$  \tag{11}$$

The enthalpy comprises energy density $\epsilon$ and pressure, given by

$$h = \epsilon + P.$$  \tag{12}$$

For cold EOS, $\epsilon$ and $P$ are functions of $\rho$; in particular, the piecewise polytropic approximation of EOS, which is adopted in this Letter for the APR4 EOS (see below), gives the relations $\epsilon(\rho)$ and $P(\rho)$ as Eqs. (4.4) and (4.5) of [37]. The gravitational mass of the star is defined as the the value of $m(r)$ at infinity. In addition, $\psi$ and $\eta$ are defined as

$$\psi = \frac{1}{\alpha} \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial \xi}, \quad \eta = \frac{1}{X} \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial r},$$  \tag{13}$$

which help decompose the equation for $\varphi$,

$$\Box \varphi = -4\pi \frac{d \ln A}{d \varphi} T + \frac{dV}{d\varphi} = -4\pi (\alpha_0 + \beta_0 \varphi) T + m_\varphi^2 \varphi$$

$$\quad := m_{\text{eff}}^2 \varphi,$$  \tag{14}$$

to a set of first-order hyperbolic differential equations in a conservative-flux form for the variables $\{\varphi, \eta, \psi\}$; the hydrodynamic equations,

$$0 = \nabla_\mu T^{\mu \nu} - \frac{d \ln A}{d \varphi} \nabla_\nu \varphi,$$  \tag{15}$$
can also be written as a system of hyperbolic conservation laws. The equations are long though, and we can instead refer the reader to Eqs. (21)-(29) in [21].

**RESULTS FOR TYPE II ACCRETION**

Here we will discuss the evolution of a scalarized star undergoing a second type (‘Type II’) of accretion, that is where a Gaussian bulk is introduced out of but close to the surface of the neutron star every 4 ms, which is centred at $1.2 R_\star$ with standard deviation width of 1 km, and terminates when a total (baryon) mass of 0.014$M_\odot$ has been added (after 16.1 ms). The idea is to demonstrate that the basic conclusions we have made in paper are generic, weakly dependent on the particular accretion type. We find again $M_\text{acc} \approx 0.87M_\odot s^{-1}$, but the descalarization lasts $\approx 8.54$ ms.

In Fig. 3, we plot the evolution track of the star undergoing Type II accretion (top panel), and the scalar emission during the descalarization (bottom panel), while the GW strain caused by the emanating scalar field is presented in Fig. 4. We see that the process is both qualitatively and quantitatively similar to that of the accretion in the main text, which indicates that for the two distinct types of accretion we get practically the same results thus strengthening the confidence that the process is more or less independent of the initial setup.

[FIG. 3. top panel: Evolutionary track of a near-critical scalarized star under Type II accretion. bottom panel: Evolution of scalar energy under Type II accretion. Here $E_{\varphi,-3}$ and $E_{\text{scalar},-3}$ are given in the unit of $10^{-3}M_\odot$.]

It is natural also to ask whether the change of some theory parameters, namely $\alpha_0$ and $m_\varphi$, will influence significantly our results. The equilibrium with a fixed mass would not change much for sufficiently small $\alpha_0$ (cf. Fig. 2 of [65]) and $m_\varphi$ (cf. Fig. 1 of [9]); therefore, the scalar-shedding processes for a range of $\alpha_0$ and $m_\varphi$ would be different but similar to each other. Of course, what scales with $\alpha_0$ is the effective powerspectral density (PSD) of the resulting scalar radiation that is discussed in the main text of the letter.
FIG. 4. PSD of the scalar-induced GW mode [Eq. (5)] for Type II accretion, extracted at $L = 10$ kpc for retarded time ranging for 1 to $10^3$ years. The $k$-th notch from the right on the curve denotes $10^{(k-1)}$ years.