

The Rough Topology for Numerical Data

UĞUR YİĞİT

Department of Mathematics

Istanbul Medeniyet University

ugur.yigit@medeniyet.edu.tr

Abstract. In this paper, we give a generalization of the rough topology and the core to numerical data by classifying objects in terms of the attribute values. New approach to find the core for numerical data is discussed. Then a measurement to find whether an attribute is in the core or not is given. This new method for finding the core is used for attribute reduction. It is tested and compared by using machine learning algorithms. Finally, the algorithms and codes to convert a data to pertinent data and to find core is also provided.

Keywords: Rough Sets, Rough Topology, Core for Numerical Data, Machine Learning

Contents

1	Introduction	2
2	Preliminaries	2
3	Rough Topology	3
4	The Rough Topology for numerical data	5
5	A topological method for big numerical data	7
6	Conclusion and Future Directions	12

7 Appendix	13
7.1 Python Codes for Finding the Core	13
7.2 The Core of Example 5.4	15
7.3 The Core of Example 5.5	19

1. Introduction

Pawlak's rough set theory [1] handles the approximation of sets in terms of equivalence (indiscernibility) relations. The primary application of this theory is data analysis. In Pawlak's work [2], the indiscernibility relations arise when one considers a given set of attributes. Two object are equivalent if their values of all attributes in the data are the same. Thivagar et al.[3] introduce rough topology by means of rough sets and apply it to analyze real life problems. They find the key attributes for some diseases to decide whether a patient has a disease or not. Several applications of the theory deal with the Boolean type of data in which attributes usually takes value yes and no; or 0 and 1. A contribution of this work is to give a generalization of the rough topology and the core to numerical data by reducing a data to an usable form by using standard deviation of attributes. Also, this method provide a new model for attribute reduction for a large scale data processing.

2. Preliminaries

Let U be a non-empty set of objects called the universe. A relation R on U is a subset of the cartesian product $U \times U$. An element $(a, b) \in R$ is generally written as aRb . A relation on U is called reflexive if aRa for all $a \in U$. It is called symmetric if aRb implies bRa for all $a, b \in U$. It is called transitive if aRb and bRc then aRc for all $a, b, c \in U$. If R is reflexive, symmetric and transitive, then R is said to be an equivalence relation on U .

Let R be an equivalence relation on a set U , and let $x \in U$. The set of all elements in U that is related to x is called the equivalence class of x under R and is denoted by $[x]_R$. That is, $[x]_R = \{y \in U | xRy\}$. The set of all equivalence classes U/R of R in U gives a partition of U , which means that all equivalence classes are disjoint, and the union of them is U .

Definition 2.1. [2] Let U be a non-empty finite set and R be an equivalence relation on U . An approximation space is a pair (U, R) . Let X be a subset of U .

- (i) The lower approximation of X with respect to R is

$$R_*(X) = \cup_{x \in U} \{x | [x]_R \subset X\}.$$

- (ii) The upper approximation of X with respect to R is

$$R^*(X) = \cup_{x \in U} \{x | [x]_R \cap X \neq \emptyset\}.$$

- (iii) The boundary region of X with respect to R is

$$B_R(X) = R^*(X) - R_*(X).$$

The set X is called rough set with respect to R if $B_R(X) \neq \emptyset$.

3. Rough Topology

In this section we firstly introduce the definition of a topology and a basis for a topology. We secondly present the rough topology which is given by Thivagar et al. in [3] in terms of the lower and the upper approximations.

Definition 3.1. A topology on a set U is a collection τ of subsets of U satisfying the following properties:

(T1) $\emptyset, U \in \tau$.

(T2) The union of the elements of τ is in τ .

(T3) The intersection of the finite number of elements of τ is in τ .

The pair (U, τ) is called a topological space.

Let (U, τ) be a topological space. A basis for (U, τ) is a collection $\beta \subset \tau$ such that for each $A \in \tau$ and each $x \in A$, there exists $B \in \beta$ such that $x \in B \subset A$.

Definition 3.2. [3] Let U be a non-empty finite set and R be an equivalence relation on U . For $X \subset U$, $\tau_R = \{U, \emptyset, R_*(X), R^*(X), B_R(X)\}$ forms a topology on U , which is called a rough topology on U with respect to X .

Lemma 3.3. [3] The set $\beta_R = \{U, R_*(X), B_R(X)\}$ is a basis for the rough topology τ_R on U with respect to X .

Example 3.4. Let $U = \{1, 2, 3, 4, 5\}$ and

$$R = \{(1, 1), (2, 2), (3, 3), (4, 4), (5, 5), (1, 2), (2, 1), (3, 5), (5, 3)\}$$

be an equivalence relation on U . Then the set of equivalence classes of U by the equivalence relation R is $U/R = \{\{1, 2\}, \{3, 5\}, \{4\}\}$. For $X = \{1, 2, 3\}$, $R^*(X) = \{1, 2, 3, 5\}$, $R_*(X) = \{1, 2\}$ and $B_R(X) = \{3, 5\}$. Therefore, the rough topology $\tau_R = \{U, \emptyset, \{1, 2\}, \{1, 2, 3, 5\}, \{3, 5\}\}$. The basis for τ_R is $\beta_R = \{U, \{1, 2\}, \{3, 5\}\}$.

Definition 3.5. [3] A subset M of the set of attributes is called the core of R if $\beta_M \neq \beta_{(R-\{r\})}$ for every r in M . That is, the elements of the core cannot be removed without affecting the classification power of attributes.

Example 3.6. Consider the Table 1, which is taken from Pawlak [4].

Table 1:

Patient	Headache(H)	Muscular pain(M)	Temperature(T)	Flue
1	No	Yes	High	Yes
2	Yes	No	High	Yes
3	Yes	Yes	Very High	Yes
4	No	Yes	Normal	No
5	Yes	No	High	No
6	No	Yes	Very High	Yes

Let $U = \{1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6\}$ be the set of patients, and $X = \{1, 2, 3, 6\}$ be the set of patients having flue. Let R be an equivalence (indiscernibility) relation, in which two patients are equivalent if their values of all attributes are the same. Then the set of equivalence classes of U by the equivalence relation R is $U/R = \{\{1\}, \{2, 5\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{6\}\}$. For $X = \{1, 2, 3, 6\}$, the upper approximation $R^*(X) = \{1, 2, 3, 5, 6\}$, the lower approximation $R_*(X) = \{1, 3, 6\}$, and $B_R(X) = \{2, 5\}$. Therefore the rough topology $\tau_R = \{U, \emptyset, \{1, 3, 6\}, \{1, 2, 3, 5, 6\}, \{2, 5\}\}$. The basis for τ_R is $\beta_R = \{U, \{1, 3, 6\}, \{2, 5\}\}$.

If we remove the attribute "Headache" from the set of condition attributes, the family of equivalence classes with the resulting set of attributes is given by $U/(R - \{H\}) = \{\{1\}, \{2, 5\}, \{3, 6\}, \{4\}\}$. Then, the lower and upper approximations of X with respect to $R - \{H\}$ are given by $(R - \{H\})^*(X) = \{1, 2, 3, 5, 6\}$ and $(R - \{H\})_*(X) = \{1, 3, 6\}$, respectively. Therefore, $\tau_{R - \{H\}} = \{U, \emptyset, \{1, 3, 6\}, \{1, 2, 3, 5, 6\}, \{2, 5\}\}$. The basis for this topology $\tau_{(R - \{H\})}$ is given by $\beta_{(R - \{H\})} = \{U, \{1, 3, 6\}, \{2, 5\}\}$. Therefore, $\beta_R = \beta_{(R - \{H\})}$, which means "Headache" is not in the $Core(X)$.

If the attribute "Muscular pain" is omitted, then $U/(R - \{M\}) = \{\{1\}, \{2, 5\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{6\}\}$, which is the same with U/R . Hence, $\tau_{(R - \{M\})} = \tau_R$ and $\beta_{(R - \{M\})} = \beta_R$, which means "Muscular pain" is not in the $Core(X)$.

If we remove the attribute "Temperature" from the set of condition attributes, the family of equivalence classes with the resulting set of attributes is given by $U/(R - \{T\}) = \{\{1, 4, 6\}, \{2, 5\}, \{3\}\}$. Then, the lower and upper approximations of X with respect to $R - \{T\}$ are given by $(R - \{T\})^*(X) = \{1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6\}$ and $(R - \{T\})_*(X) = \{3\}$. Therefore, $\tau_{R - \{T\}} = \{U, \emptyset, \{3\}\}$. The basis for this topology $\tau_{(R - \{T\})}$ is given by $\beta_{(R - \{T\})} = \{U, \{3\}\}$. Therefore, $\beta_R \neq \beta_{(R - \{T\})}$, which means "Temperature" is in the $Core(X)$.

Therefore, $Core(X) = \{Temperature\}$. If we take $X = \{4, 5\}$ as the set of patients not having flue, then similarly $Core(X) = \{Temperature\}$.

Observation: We conclude that "Temperature" are the key attributes to decide whether a patient has flue or not.

4. The Rough Topology for numerical data

The rough topology and the core can be used to analyze many real life problems like diseases, electrical transmission lines, making decision problems, etc. in the literature [5, 6, 7]. However, the values of attributes are like "yes or no"; or "high, normal, very high". In this section, we give a generalization of the method to analyze numerical data by converting them to pertinent data by means of standard deviations of the attributes. We also provide algorithms and python codes to find equivalence classes, the lower and the upper approximations, topologies, bases, and the core.

Let (U, R) be an approximation space with indiscernibility (equivalence) relation R . Two objects are equivalent if and only if their values of all attributes are the same. However, most of the values are different from each other in the numerical data. One need a method for converting numerical data into formats that help you analyze by using the rough topology and the core. We use standard deviations of attributes to do this. We assume that two objects takes the same value if they are close each other as near as the standard deviation of the attribute. The algorithm of the procedure is as follows:

Algorithm 1:

Step 1: Given a data table, columns of which are attributes, rows of which are objects, and entries of the table are attribute values, pick one of the attributes.

Step 2: Take the maksimum (Max) and the standard deviation (St) of the chosen attribute.

Step 3: Assign 1 to the values between (Max) and ($Max - St$) and discard these rows. Find the next maximum after discarding rows assigned as 1. Assign 2 to the values between the new (Max) and new ($Max - St$) and discard them. Repeat this process until every values assigned to a new value.

Step 4: Repeat Step 2 and Step 3 for every attributes.

Step 5: Generate the new data table.

(see Appendix 7.1 for Python codes).

Example 4.1. Consider the Table 2, which is taken from Järvinen [8].

Table 2:

Patient	Temperature(T)	Blood Pressure(BP)	Hemoglobin(HB)	Results
1	39.3	103/65	125	No
2	39.1	97/60	116	No
3	39.2	109/71	132	No

Continued on next page

Table 2 – Continued from previous page

Patient	Temperature(T)	Blood Pressure(BP)	Hemoglobin(HB)	Results
4	37.1	150/96	139	Yes
5	37.3	145/93	130	Yes
6	37.8	143/95	121	Yes
7	36.7	138/83	130	No

By applying the algorithm 1 to Table 2, we get the following:

Table 3:

Patient	Temperature(T)	Blood Pressure(BP)	Hemoglobin(HB)	Results
1	1	2	2	No
2	1	1	3	No
3	1	2	1	No
4	2	2	1	Yes
5	2	2	2	Yes
6	2	3	3	Yes
7	3	1	2	No

Let $U = \{1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7\}$ be the set of patients, and $X = \{4, 5, 6\}$ be the set of patient having a positive result. Let R be an equivalence (indiscernibility) relation, in which two patients are equivalent if their values of all attributes are the same. Then the set of equivalence classes of U by the equivalence relation R is $U/R = \{\{1\}, \{2\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{5\}, \{6\}, \{7\}\}$. For $X = \{4, 5, 6\}$, the upper approximation $R^*(X) = \{4, 5, 6\}$, the lower approximation $R_*(X) = \{4, 5, 6\}$, and $B_R(X) = \emptyset$. Therefore the rough topology $\tau_R = \{U, \emptyset, \{4, 5, 6\}\}$. The basis for τ_R is $\beta_R = \{U, \{4, 5, 6\}\}$.

If we remove the attribute "Temperature" from the set of condition attributes, the family of equivalence classes with the resulting set of attributes is given by $U/(R - \{T\}) = \{\{1,5\}, \{2\}, \{3,4\}, \{6\}, \{7\}\}$. Then, the lower and the upper approximations, and boundary of X with respect to $R - \{T\}$ are given by $(R - \{T\})^*(X) = \{1, 3, 4, 5, 6\}$ and $(R - \{T\})_*(X) = \{6\}$, and $B_{(R - \{T\})}(X) = \{1, 3, 4, 5\}$, respectively. Therefore, $\tau_{R - \{T\}} = \{U, \emptyset, \{1, 3, 4, 5, 6\}, \{6\}, \{1, 3, 4, 5\}\}$. The basis for this topology $\tau_{(R - \{T\})}$ is given by $\beta_{(R - \{T\})} = \{U, \{1, 3, 4, 5\}, \{6\}\}$. Therefore, $\beta_R \neq \beta_{(R - \{T\})}$, which means "Temperature" is in the *Core*(X).

If the attribute "Blood Pressure" is omitted, then $U/(R - \{BP\}) = \{\{1\}, \{2\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{5\}, \{6\}, \{7\}\}$, which is the same with U/R . Hence, $\tau_{(R - \{BP\})} = \tau_R$ and $\beta_{(R - \{BP\})} = \beta_R$, which means

”Blood Pressure” is not in the $Core(R)$.

If we remove the attribute ”Hemoglobin” from the set of condition attributes, the family of equivalence classes with the resulting set of attributes is given by $U/(R - \{HB\}) = \{\{1,3\}, \{2\}, \{4,5\}, \{6\}, \{7\}\}$. Then, the lower and upper approximations of X with respect to $R - \{HB\}$ are given by $(R - \{HB\})^*(X) = \{4, 5, 6\}$ and $(R - \{HB\})_*(X) = \{4, 5, 6\}$, respectively. Hence, $\tau_{(R - \{HB\})} = \tau_R$ and $\beta_{(R - \{HB\})} = \beta_R$, which means ”Hemoglobin” is not in the $Core(R)$.

Therefore, $Core(X) = \{\text{Temperature}\}$. If we take $X = \{1, 2, 3, 7\}$ as the set of patients having a negative result, then similarly $Core(X) = \{\text{Temperature}\}$.

Observation: We conclude that ”Temperature” are the key attributes to decide whether a patient has a positive result or not.

5. A topological method for big numerical data

For big numerical data, the rough topology is restrictive since the topology could be changed by only one object (row). In other words, even if only one object (row) in the boundary and the lower approximation is different from the boundary or lower approximation for the equivalence relation which is omitted one attribute, then topologies are different. As a result, most attributes are in the core for big data. However, we can give a measurement for this change (see definition 5.2). For example, let’s consider the data with 1000 objects. If only 10 objects change the boundary and the lower approximation, these differences are possibly insignificant, so it could be tolerated for big data.

Definition 5.1. Let (U, R) be an approximation space and M be the set of attributes. For $r \in M$ and $X \subset U$, the accuracy of an attribute and the accuracy of the core with respect to X are defined respectively by

$$\mu_r(X) = \frac{|B_R(X)|}{|B_{(R-r)}(X)|}$$

$$\mu_{RT}(X) = \text{Sup}_{r \in M} \left\{ \frac{|B_R(X)|}{|B_{(R-r)}(X)|} \right\}.$$

Definition 5.2. Let (U, R) be an approximation space and M be the set of attributes. For $r \in M$ and $X \subset U$, the accuracy of the boundary for r with respect to X are defined by

$$\nu_r(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-r)}(X)|$$

Remark 5.3. $\mu_{RT}(X) = \mu_{RT}(U - X)$ and $\nu_r(X) = \nu_r(U - X)$ for any $r \in M$.

Obviously, $\mu_{RT}(X) \leq 1$. $\nu_r(X)$ is a measuring tool used to layout insignificant objects which can be tolerated. For example, if $\nu_r(X) \leq 10$, then one can consider that an attribute r is not in the core because it could be tolerated for the data with 1000 objects.

Example 5.4. The dataset were obtained from UCI Machine Learning Repository. This dataset contains information about wart treatment results of 90 patients using cryotherapy [9]. Seven attributes are sex, age, time, number of warts, type, area, and result of treatment.

Table 4:

Objects	Sex	Age	Time	Number of Warts	Type	Area	Results
1	1	35	12	5	1	100	0
2	1	29	7	5	1	96	1
3	1	50	8	1	3	132	0
4	1	32	11.75	7	3	750	0
5	1	67	9.25	1	1	42	0
6	1	41	8	2	2	20	1
7	1	36	11	2	1	8	0
8	1	59	3.5	3	3	20	0
9	1	20	4.5	12	1	6	1
10	2	34	11.25	3	3	150	0
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮

By applying the algorithm 1 to Table 4, we get the following:

Table 5:

Objects	Sex	Age	Time	Number of Warts	Type	Area	Results
1	2	3	1	2	3	2	0
2	2	3	2	2	2	2	1
3	2	2	2	3	1	2	0
4	2	3	1	2	1	1	0
5	2	1	1	3	3	2	0
6	2	2	2	3	2	3	1
7	2	3	1	3	3	3	0
8	2	1	3	3	1	3	0
9	2	4	3	1	3	3	1
10	1	3	1	3	1	2	0

Continued on next page

Table 5 – Continued from previous page

Objects	Sex	Age	Time	Number of Warts	Type	Area	Results
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮

Let $U = \{1, 2, 3, \dots, 88, 89, 90\}$ be the set of objects, and X and Y be the set of objects having result 0 and 1, respectively. Let R be an equivalence (indiscernibility) relation, in which two objects are equivalent if their values of all attributes are the same. If attributes which have $\nu_r(X) \leq 2$ are eliminated, then the $Core(X) = \{\text{time, number of warts, area}\}$ (See Appendix 7.2). Similarly, $Core(U - X) = Core(Y) = \{\text{time, number of warts, area}\}$.

As a result, key attributes to decide the result of the treatment are time, number of warts, and area.

In this part, we apply 4 different machine learning algorithms (LR, GNB, KNN, and SVM) to the data by using all attributes and attributes in the core, respectively. Then, the results are compared for each method and each class. Looking at average classification accuracy, we get better results by using the core.

Table 6: Before Optimization (Unspecified HP's are default)

Method	Use all attributes	Use the core
GNB	Accuracy:0.821 Precision:0.882 Recall:0.833 F1:0.857	Accuracy:0.893 Precision:0.895 Recall:0.944 F1:0.919
KNN	Accuracy:0.821 Precision:0.882 Recall:0.833 F1:0.857	Accuracy:0.857 Precision:0.882 Recall:0.833 F1:0.857
L-SVM	Accuracy:0.964 Precision:1.0 Recall:0.944 F1:0.971	Accuracy:0.821 Precision:0.882 Recall:0.833 F1:0.857
LR	Accuracy:0.929 Precision:0.944 Recall:0.944 F1:0.944	Accuracy:0.893 Precision:0.895 Recall:0.944 F1:0.919

Table 7: After Optimization (Unspecified HP's are default)

Method	Use all attributes	Use the core	HP
GNB	Accuracy:0.714 Precision:0.708 Recall:0.944 F1:0.81	Accuracy:0.714 Precision:0.708 Recall:0.944 F1:0.81	Smoothing: 0.1
KNN	Accuracy:0.929 Precision:0.944 Recall:0.944 F1:0.944	Accuracy:0.964 Precision:1.0 Recall:0.944 F1:0.971	NofNeighbors: 1
P-SVM	Accuracy:0.786 Precision:0.773 Recall:0.944 F1:0.85	Accuracy:0.857 Precision:0.889 Recall:0.889 F1:0.889	C: 0.1 Degree: 3 Gamma: Auto
PCA (KNN)	Accuracy:0.821 Precision:0.933 Recall:0.778 F1:0.848	Accuracy:0.893 Precision:895 Recall:0.944 F1:0.919	NofNeighbors: 3 Metric: Cosine

It can also be applied to data with that a decision attribute takes more than two values. One can get better classification results by using the core rather than using all attributes by applying machine learning algorithms to most numerical data.

Example 5.5. The dataset were obtained from UCI Machine learning Repository about measurements of geometrical properties of three different type of wheat kernels: Kama, Rosa and Canadian, 70 objects each [10]. In the data, seven attributes of wheat kernels were measured:

- A: area,
- B: perimeter,
- C: compactness,

D: length of kernel,

E: width of kernel,

F: asymmetry coefficient,

G: length of kernel groove,

Result: kernel type.

Table 8:

Objects	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	Results
1	15.26	14.84	0.871	5.763	3.312	2.221	5.22	1
2	14.88	14.57	0.8811	5.554	3.333	1.018	4.956	1
3	14.29	14.09	0.905	5.291	3.337	2.699	4.825	1
4	13.84	13.94	0.8955	5.324	3.379	2.259	4.805	1
5	16.14	14.99	0.9034	5.658	3.562	1.355	5.175	1
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮
71	17.63	15.98	0.8673	6.191	3.561	4.076	6.06	2
72	16.84	15.67	0.8623	5.998	3.484	4.675	5.877	2
73	17.26	15.73	0.8763	5.978	3.594	4.539	5.791	2
74	19.11	16.26	0.9081	6.154	3.93	2.936	6.079	2
75	16.82	15.51	0.8786	6.017	3.486	4.004	5.841	2
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮
141	13.07	13.92	0.848	5.472	2.994	5.304	5.395	3
142	13.32	13.94	0.8613	5.541	3.073	7.035	5.44	3
143	13.34	13.95	0.862	5.389	3.074	5.995	5.307	3
144	12.22	13.32	0.8652	5.224	2.967	5.469	5.221	3
145	11.82	13.4	0.8274	5.314	2.777	4.471	5.178	3
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮

By applying the algorithm 1 to the Table 8, we get the following:

Table 9:

Objects	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	Results
1	2	2	2	3	2	4	3	1
2	3	3	2	3	2	5	4	1
3	3	3	1	4	2	4	4	1
4	3	3	1	4	2	4	4	1
5	2	2	1	3	2	5	3	1
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮
71	2	1	3	2	2	3	1	2
72	2	2	3	2	2	3	2	2
73	2	2	2	2	2	3	2	2
74	1	1	1	2	1	4	1	2
75	2	2	2	2	2	3	2	2
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮
141	3	3	3	3	3	2	3	3
142	3	3	3	3	3	1	3	3
143	3	3	3	3	3	2	3	3
144	3	3	3	4	3	2	3	3
145	4	3	4	4	4	3	3	3
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮

Let $U = \{1, 2, 3, \dots, 208, 209, 210\}$ be the set of objects, and $X = \{1, 2, 3, \dots, 68, 69, 70\}$, $Y = \{71, 72, 73, \dots, 138, 139, 140\}$ and $Z = \{141, 142, 143, \dots, 208, 209, 210\}$ be the set of objects having result 1, 2, and 3, respectively. Let R be an equivalence (indiscernibility) relation, in which two objects are equivalent if their values of all attributes are the same. If attributes which have $\nu_r(X) \leq 5$ are eliminated, then the $Core(X) = \{C, F, G\}$ (See Appendix 7.3). Similarly, $Core(U - X) = Core(Y) = Core(U - Y) = Core(Z) = Core(U - Z) = \{C, F, G\}$.

As a result, key attributes to decide the type of seeds are C , F , and G columns.

6. Conclusion and Future Directions

In this work, we give the rough topology and core for numerical data. This method could be applied to big numerical data for future selection problems as future research. We will use this method to make a price forecasting for big energy dataset. By using the core, one can also get better results by using

less attributes (attributes in the core) for machine learning algorithms. As a result, the rough topology is a useful model for attribute reductions for numerical data.

Another project is to apply the rough topology for solution of missing values problem in incomplete numerical information tables. The rough topological method for numerical data could be given like Salama's work for Boolean Type of data [11, 12].

Finally, this new rough topological method can be given for expansions of rough sets in incomplete information systems by taking tolerance relations rather than indiscernibility relations to apply missing value problems for numerical data [13, 12].

7. Appendix

7.1. Python Codes for Finding the Core

```
def transform(df):
    import statistics
    import numpy as np
    from sklearn import preprocessing
    le = preprocessing.LabelEncoder()
    if type(df.iloc[0][-1])==str:
        df.iloc[:, -1]=le.fit_transform(df.iloc[:, -1])
    for i in range(1,df.shape[1]-1):
        c=statistics.stdev(df.iloc[:,i]) d="1"
        while True: try:
            v=round(np.max([t for t in df.iloc[:,i]
                if type(t)!=str])-c,3)
            for j,k in enumerate(df.iloc[:,i]):
                if type(k)!=str and k>=v:
                    df.iloc[j,i]=d
            d=str(int(d)+1)
        except: break
    df.iloc[:,i]=[int(k) for t,k in enumerate(df.iloc[:,i])
        if type(k)!=str] return df
```

```
def BD(df,shine_res=[0]):
    import numpy as np
    X=set()
    for i in range(int(df.iloc[0,0])-1,int(df.iloc[-1,0])):
        if int(df.iloc[:, -1][i]) in shine_res:
            X.add(df.iloc[:,0][i])
    U=df.iloc[:,0].values
    T=[]
    BD_sd=[]
    for i in range(df.shape[1]-1):
        cl_1=[i for i in range(1,df.shape[1]-1)]
        try:
            cl_1.remove(i)
```

```

    print(f"{df.columns[1:-1][i-1]} column is omitted")
except:
    print("Use all columns")
##Equivalence Classes
pre_U_R=[]
k=1
for i in range(df.shape[0]):
    for j in range(k,df.shape[0]):
        if np.array_equal(df.iloc[i,c1_1].values,df.iloc[j,c1_1].values):
            pre_U_R.append([df.iloc[i,0],df.iloc[j,0]])
        k+=1
U_R=[]
for i in pre_U_R:
    t=set()
    for i in [j for j,t in enumerate([not set(i).isdisjoint(set(k))
    for k in pre_U_R ])] if t==1]:
        t=t.union(pre_U_R[i])
    if t not in U_R:
        U_R.append(t)
for i in U:
    if np.array_equal([set([i]).issubset(j)
    for j in U_R],np.zeros(len(U_R))):
        U_R.append(set([i]))
##Equivalence Classes
##Lower Approximation - Upper Approximation
Rla=[]
Rua=[]
for i in U_R:
    if i.issubset(X):
        [Rla.append(U[i]) for i,j in enumerate([not i.isdisjoint(set([j]))
        for j in U]) if (j==True) and (U[i] not in Rla)]
    if not i.isdisjoint(X):
        [Rua.append(U[i]) for i,j in enumerate([not i.isdisjoint(set([j]))
        for j in U]) if (j==True) and (U[i] not in Rua)]
##Lower Approximation - Upper Approximation
#Boundary
RLA=set(Rla)
RUA=set(Rua)
B=RUA.difference(RLA)
#Boundary
print("Equivalence Classes",U_R)
print("Lower Approximation",Rla)
print("Upper Approximation",Rua)
print("Boundary",B)
print("*"*75)
T.append(B)
for i in range(1,len(T)):
    bd=T[i].symmetric_difference(T[0])

```

```
print(f"v_{df.columns[1:-1][i-1]}:
{bd} - v_{df.columns[1:-1][i-1]}= {len(bd)}")
```

```
import pandas as pd
from BD_finder import BD
from transformDF import transform

file_path="InputFile.xlsx"
df=transform(pd.read_excel(file_path))
print(df)

#If your data is not have ID column please run this part before BD.
"""
df.insert(loc=0, column="ID", value=[i for i in range(1,df.shape[0]+1)])
"""
BD(df, [1])
```

7.2. The Core of Example 5.4

Let $X=\{2, 6, 9, 12, 13, 14, 16, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 27, 30, 31, 32, 36, 39, 42, 43, 44, 46, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 55, 57, 59, 60, 61, 66, 69, 72, 73, 74, 76, 79, 80, 81, 82, 83, 85, 87, 89, 90\}$ be the set of objects having result 1.

All attributes are used

Equivalence classes: $\{1, 62\}, \{32, 2\}, \{8, 38\}, \{73, 9\}, \{10, 26, 86\}, \{41, 11, 30, 71\}, \{16, 12, 20\}, \{19, 13\}, \{18, 67\}, \{21, 46\}, \{25, 23\}, \{28, 47\}, \{43, 69, 39\}, \{40, 56, 70\}, \{42, 60\}, \{48, 59, 78\}, \{50, 87\}, \{82, 52\}, \{83, 53\}, \{88, 58\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{5\}, \{6\}, \{7\}, \{14\}, \{15\}, \{17\}, \{22\}, \{24\}, \{27\}, \{29\}, \{31\}, \{33\}, \{34\}, \{35\}, \{36\}, \{37\}, \{44\}, \{45\}, \{49\}, \{51\}, \{54\}, \{55\}, \{57\}, \{61\}, \{63\}, \{64\}, \{65\}, \{66\}, \{68\}, \{72\}, \{74\}, \{75\}, \{76\}, \{77\}, \{79\}, \{80\}, \{81\}, \{84\}, \{85\}, \{89\}, \{90\}$

The lower approximation: $\{2, 32, 9, 73, 12, 16, 20, 13, 19, 21, 46, 23, 25, 39, 43, 69, 42, 60, 50, 87, 52, 82, 53, 83, 6, 14, 22, 27, 31, 36, 44, 49, 51, 55, 57, 61, 66, 72, 74, 76, 79, 80, 81, 85, 89, 90\}$

The upper approximation: $\{2, 32, 9, 73, 11, 30, 41, 71, 12, 16, 20, 13, 19, 21, 46, 23, 25, 39, 43, 69, 42, 60, 48, 59, 78, 50, 87, 52, 82, 53, 83, 6, 14, 22, 27, 31, 36, 44, 49, 51, 55, 57, 61, 66, 72, 74, 76, 79, 80, 81, 85, 89, 90\}$

The Boundary: $\{71, 41, 11, 78, 48, 59, 30\}$

Sex is omitted

Equivalence Classes: $\{1, 62\}, \{32, 2\}, \{18, 67, 7\}, \{8, 38\}, \{73, 9\}, \{56, 26, 70, 86, 40, 10\},$
 $\{41, 11, 30, 71\}, \{16, 20, 21, 12, 46\}, \{19, 69, 39, 43, 13\}, \{45, 15\}, \{25, 23\}, \{28, 77, 47\}, \{48, 59,$
 $37, 78\}, \{42, 60, 76\}, \{50, 87\}, \{57, 51\}, \{82, 52\}, \{83, 53\}, \{88, 58\}, \{80, 81\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{5\}, \{6\},$
 $\{14\}, \{17\}, \{22\}, \{24\}, \{27\}, \{29\}, \{31\}, \{33\}, \{34\}, \{35\}, \{36\}, \{44\}, \{49\}, \{54\}, \{55\}, \{61\},$
 $\{63\}, \{64\}, \{65\}, \{66\}, \{68\}, \{72\}, \{74\}, \{75\}, \{79\}, \{84\}, \{85\}, \{89\}, \{90\}$

The Lower approximation: $\{2, 32, 9, 73, 12, 16, 20, 21, 46, 13, 19, 39, 43, 69, 23, 25, 42, 60,$
 $76, 50, 87, 51, 57, 52, 82, 53, 83, 80, 81, 6, 14, 22, 27, 31, 36, 44, 49, 55, 61, 66, 72, 74, 79, 85, 89,$
 $90\}$

The upper approximation: $\{2, 32, 9, 73, 11, 30, 41, 71, 12, 16, 20, 21, 46, 13, 19, 39, 43, 69,$
 $23, 25, 37, 48, 59, 78, 42, 60, 76, 50, 87, 51, 57, 52, 82, 53, 83, 80, 81, 6, 14, 22, 27, 31, 36, 44, 49,$
 $55, 61, 66, 72, 74, 79, 85, 89, 90\}$

The Boundary: $\{37, 71, 41, 11, 78, 48, 59, 30\}$

$$\nu_{\text{sex}}(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{\text{sex}\})}(X)| = |\{37\}| = 1.$$

Age is omitted

Equivalence Classes: $\{65, 1, 62\}, \{32, 2, 90\}, \{45, 7\}, \{8, 38\}, \{73, 9\}, \{10, 26, 86, 63\}, \{41,$
 $11, 30, 71\}, \{16, 12, 20\}, \{19, 13\}, \{18, 67, 15\}, \{17, 35\}, \{61, 21, 46\}, \{80, 25, 23\}, \{28, 47\}, \{72,$
 $31\}, \{43, 69, 39\}, \{40, 56, 70\}, \{42, 60\}, \{48, 59, 78\}, \{50, 87\}, \{83, 51, 53\}, \{82, 52\}, \{88, 58\},$
 $\{89, 75\}, \{3\}, \{4\}, \{5\}, \{6\}, \{14\}, \{22\}, \{24\}, \{27\}, \{29\}, \{33\}, \{34\}, \{36\}, \{37\}, \{44\}, \{49\},$
 $\{54\}, \{55\}, \{57\}, \{64\}, \{66\}, \{68\}, \{74\}, \{76\}, \{77\}, \{79\}, \{81\}, \{84\}, \{85\}$

The Lower approximation: $\{2, 32, 90, 9, 73, 12, 16, 20, 13, 19, 21, 46, 61, 23, 25, 80, 31, 72,$
 $39, 43, 69, 42, 60, 50, 87, 51, 53, 83, 52, 82, 6, 14, 22, 27, 36, 44, 49, 55, 57, 66, 74, 76, 79, 81, 85\}$

The upper approximation: $\{2, 32, 90, 9, 73, 11, 30, 41, 71, 12, 16, 20, 13, 19, 21, 46, 61, 23,$
 $25, 80, 31, 72, 39, 43, 69, 42, 60, 48, 59, 78, 50, 87, 51, 53, 83, 52, 82, 75, 89, 6, 14, 22, 27, 36, 44,$
 $49, 55, 57, 66, 74, 76, 79, 81, 85\}$

The Boundary: $\{71, 41, 11, 75, 78, 48, 89, 59, 30\}$

$$\nu_{\text{age}}(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{\text{age}\})}(X)| = |\{89, 75\}| = 2.$$

Time is omitted

Equivalence Classes: {32, 1, 2, 62}, {8, 38}, {73, 9, 75}, {10, 26, 86}, {50, 87, 71, 41, 11, 30}, {16, 81, 12, 20}, {19, 13, 15}, {18, 67}, {80, 27, 21, 46}, {25, 61, 23}, {55, 88, 58, 28, 47}, {85, 31}, {43, 69, 45, 39}, {40, 56, 70}, {42, 51, 60}, {74, 44}, {48, 59, 78}, {49, 79}, {82, 52}, {83, 53}, {72, 57, 76}, {3}, {4}, {5}, {6}, {7}, {14}, {17}, {22}, {24}, {29}, {33}, {34}, {35}, {36}, {37}, {54}, {63}, {64}, {65}, {66}, {68}, {77}, {84}, {89}, {90}

The lower approximation: {12, 16, 20, 81, 21, 27, 46, 80, 23, 25, 61, 31, 85, 42, 51, 60, 44, 74, 49, 79, 52, 82, 53, 83, 57, 72, 76, 6, 14, 22, 36, 66, 89, 90}

The upper approximation: {1, 2, 32, 62, 9, 73, 75, 11, 30, 41, 50, 71, 87, 12, 16, 20, 81, 13, 15, 19, 21, 27, 46, 80, 23, 25, 61, 28, 47, 55, 58, 88, 31, 85, 39, 43, 45, 69, 42, 51, 60, 44, 74, 48, 59, 78, 49, 79, 52, 82, 53, 83, 57, 72, 76, 6, 14, 22, 36, 66, 89, 90}

The boundary: {1, 2, 9, 11, 13, 15, 19, 28, 30, 32, 39, 41, 43, 45, 47, 48, 50, 55, 58, 59, 62, 69, 71, 73, 75, 78, 87, 88}

$\nu_{\text{time}}(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{\text{time}\})}(X)| = |\{1, 2, 69, 9, 73, 75, 13, 15, 19, 87, 88, 28, 32, 39, 43, 45, 47, 50, 55, 58, 62\}| = 21.$

Number of warts is omitted

Equivalence classes: {1, 62, 31}, {32, 2, 61}, {65, 5}, {48, 7, 89, 59, 78}, {8, 68, 38}, {73, 49, 69, 39, 9, 43}, {17, 26, 86, 10, 28, 47}, {41, 11, 30, 71}, {16, 20, 42, 12, 60}, {19, 13}, {74, 14}, {18, 67, 37}, {90, 76, 21, 46}, {25, 23}, {24, 54}, {64, 34}, {40, 56, 77, 70}, {75, 45}, {81, 50, 51, 87}, {82, 52}, {83, 53}, {80, 57}, {88, 58}, {3}, {4}, {6}, {15}, {22}, {27}, {29}, {33}, {35}, {36}, {44}, {55}, {63}, {66}, {72}, {79}, {84}, {85}

The lower approximation: {2, 32, 61, 9, 39, 43, 49, 69, 73, 12, 16, 20, 42, 60, 13, 19, 14, 74, 21, 46, 76, 90, 23, 25, 50, 51, 81, 87, 52, 82, 53, 83, 57, 80, 6, 22, 27, 36, 44, 55, 66, 72, 79, 85}

The upper approximation: {1, 31, 62, 2, 32, 61, 7, 48, 59, 78, 89, 9, 39, 43, 49, 69, 73, 11, 30, 41, 71, 12, 16, 20, 42, 60, 13, 19, 14, 74, 21, 46, 76, 90, 23, 25, 50, 51, 81, 87, 52, 82, 53, 83, 57, 80, 6, 22, 27, 36, 44, 55, 66, 72, 79, 85}

The boundary: {1, 7, 71, 41, 11, 78, 48, 62, 89, 59, 30, 31}

$\nu_{\text{warts}}(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{\text{warts}\})}(X)| = |\{1, 7, 89, 31, 62\}| = 5.$

Type is omitted

Equivalence Classes: {1, 77, 62}, {32, 2}, {8, 38}, {73, 9}, {10, 26, 86}, {41, 11, 30, 71}, {16, 12, 20, 22}, {19, 13}, {81, 14}, {18, 67, 29}, {21, 46}, {25, 23}, {24, 63}, {28, 47}, {33, 84}, {43, 69, 39}, {40, 56, 70}, {42, 60}, {48, 59, 78}, {50, 87}, {74, 51}, {82, 52}, {83, 53}, {88, 58}, {3}, {4}, {5}, {6}, {7}, {15}, {17}, {27}, {31}, {34}, {35}, {36}, {37}, {44}, {45}, {49}, {54}, {55}, {57}, {61}, {64}, {65}, {66}, {68}, {72}, {75}, {76}, {79}, {80}, {85}, {89}, {90}

The lower approximation: {2, 32, 9, 73, 12, 16, 20, 22, 13, 19, 14, 81, 21, 46, 23, 25, 39, 43, 69, 42, 60, 50, 87, 51, 74, 52, 82, 53, 83, 6, 27, 31, 36, 44, 49, 55, 57, 61, 66, 72, 76, 79, 80, 85, 89, 90}

The upper approximation: {2, 32, 9, 73, 11, 30, 41, 71, 12, 16, 20, 22, 13, 19, 14, 81, 21, 46, 23, 25, 39, 43, 69, 42, 60, 48, 59, 78, 50, 87, 51, 74, 52, 82, 53, 83, 6, 27, 31, 36, 44, 49, 55, 57, 61, 66, 72, 76, 79, 80, 85, 89, 90}

The boundary: {71, 41, 11, 78, 48, 59, 30}

$$\nu_{\text{type}}(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{\text{type}\})}(X)| = |\{ \} | = 0.$$

Area is omitted

Equivalence classes: {48, 1, 62, 59, 78}, {32, 2}, {4, 77}, {8, 38}, {73, 9, 57}, {34, 26, 86, 10, 29}, {41, 11, 30, 71}, {16, 12, 20}, {81, 19, 13}, {64, 17}, {18, 67}, {21, 46}, {25, 23}, {24, 36}, {28, 47}, {89, 31}, {80, 43, 69, 39}, {40, 56, 70}, {42, 60}, {50, 87}, {82, 52}, {83, 53}, {88, 58}, {72, 75}, {90, 79}, {3}, {5}, {6}, {7}, {14}, {15}, {22}, {27}, {33}, {35}, {37}, {44}, {45}, {49}, {51}, {54}, {55}, {61}, {63}, {65}, {66}, {68}, {74}, {76}, {84}, {85}

The lower approximation: {2, 32, 9, 57, 73, 12, 16, 20, 13, 19, 81, 21, 46, 23, 25, 31, 89, 39, 43, 69, 80, 42, 60, 50, 87, 52, 82, 53, 83, 79, 90, 6, 14, 22, 27, 44, 49, 51, 55, 61, 66, 74, 76, 85}

The upper approximation: {1, 48, 59, 62, 78, 2, 32, 9, 57, 73, 11, 30, 41, 71, 12, 16, 20, 13, 19, 81, 21, 46, 23, 25, 24, 36, 31, 89, 39, 43, 69, 80, 42, 60, 50, 87, 52, 82, 53, 83, 72, 75, 79, 90, 6, 14, 22, 27, 44, 49, 51, 55, 61, 66, 74, 76, 85}

The boundary: {1, 36, 71, 72, 41, 11, 75, 78, 48, 24, 62, 59, 30}

$$\nu_{\text{area}}(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{\text{area}\})}(X)| = |\{1, 72, 75, 24, 36, 62\}| = 6.$$

If attributes which have $\nu_r(X) \leq 2$ are eliminated, then the $Core(X) = \{\text{time, number of warts, area}\}$.

7.3. The Core of Example 5.5

Let $X = \{1, 2, \dots, 70\}$ be the set of objects having result 1.

All attributes are used

Equivalence classes: $\{32, 1\}$, $\{3, 4\}$, $\{18, 5, 23\}$, $\{54, 7, 22, 41, 42\}$, $\{10, 26\}$, $\{34, 12, 46\}$, $\{29, 14, 15\}$, $\{148, 20, 205\}$, $\{68, 21, 149, 199, 30\}$, $\{27, 28\}$, $\{55, 31\}$, $\{64, 33, 164\}$, $\{136, 36, 125\}$, $\{48, 49, 57, 39\}$, $\{200, 202, 43\}$, $\{59, 47\}$, $\{56, 50\}$, $\{61, 157\}$, $\{67, 69\}$, $\{161, 70\}$, $\{72, 76, 77, 134\}$, $\{73, 75, 108, 140\}$, $\{74, 107\}$, $\{115, 83, 78\}$, $\{80, 137\}$, $\{82, 94\}$, $\{129, 91, 84\}$, $\{97, 104, 105, 109, 116, 85, 118, 120\}$, $\{124, 92, 119\}$, $\{112, 93\}$, $\{96, 139\}$, $\{101, 135\}$, $\{117, 126, 103\}$, $\{106, 132, 111\}$, $\{185, 141, 143\}$, $\{144, 201, 210\}$, $\{145, 163\}$, $\{146, 171, 150\}$, $\{170, 147\}$, $\{176, 184, 151\}$, $\{169, 194, 155\}$, $\{160, 177, 156, 174, 191\}$, $\{186, 187, 158, 159\}$, $\{193, 166\}$, $\{178, 188, 173\}$, $\{192, 181, 203, 190, 207\}$, $\{2\}$, $\{6\}$, $\{8\}$, $\{9\}$, $\{11\}$, $\{13\}$, $\{16\}$, $\{17\}$, $\{19\}$, $\{24\}$, $\{25\}$, $\{35\}$, $\{37\}$, $\{38\}$, $\{40\}$, $\{44\}$, $\{45\}$, $\{51\}$, $\{52\}$, $\{53\}$, $\{58\}$, $\{60\}$, $\{62\}$, $\{63\}$, $\{65\}$, $\{66\}$, $\{71\}$, $\{79\}$, $\{81\}$, $\{86\}$, $\{87\}$, $\{88\}$, $\{89\}$, $\{90\}$, $\{95\}$, $\{98\}$, $\{99\}$, $\{100\}$, $\{102\}$, $\{110\}$, $\{113\}$, $\{114\}$, $\{121\}$, $\{122\}$, $\{123\}$, $\{127\}$, $\{128\}$, $\{130\}$, $\{131\}$, $\{133\}$, $\{138\}$, $\{142\}$, $\{152\}$, $\{153\}$, $\{154\}$, $\{162\}$, $\{165\}$, $\{167\}$, $\{168\}$, $\{172\}$, $\{175\}$, $\{179\}$, $\{180\}$, $\{182\}$, $\{183\}$, $\{189\}$, $\{195\}$, $\{196\}$, $\{197\}$, $\{198\}$, $\{204\}$, $\{206\}$, $\{208\}$, $\{209\}$.

The Lower Approximation: $\{1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 29, 27, 28, 31, 55, 39, 48, 49, 57, 47, 59, 50, 56, 67, 69, 2, 6, 8, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 53, 58, 60, 62, 63, 65, 66\}$.

The Upper Approximation: $\{1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 29, 20, 148, 205, 21, 30, 68, 149, 199, 27, 28, 31, 55, 33, 64, 164, 36, 125, 136, 39, 48, 49, 57, 43, 200, 202, 47, 59, 50, 56, 61, 157, 67, 69, 70, 161, 2, 6, 8, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 53, 58, 60, 62, 63, 65, 66\}$.

The Boundary: $\{136, 20, 21, 148, 149, 157, 30, 33, 161, 36, 164, 43, 61, 64, 68, 70, 199, 200, 202, 205, 125\}$.

A is omitted

Equivalence classes: $\{32, 1\}$, $\{3, 4\}$, $\{18, 5, 23\}$, $\{54, 7, 22, 41, 42\}$, $\{10, 26\}$, $\{11, 53\}$, $\{34, 12, 46\}$, $\{29, 14, 15\}$, $\{148, 20, 205\}$, $\{68, 21, 149, 199, 30\}$, $\{27, 28\}$, $\{55, 31\}$, $\{64, 33, 164\}$, $\{59, 35, 47\}$, $\{136, 36, 125\}$, $\{48, 49, 57, 39\}$, $\{200, 202, 43\}$, $\{56, 50\}$, $\{61, 157\}$, $\{206, 63\}$, $\{67, 69\}$, $\{168, 161, 70\}$, $\{72, 76, 77, 134\}$, $\{73, 75, 108, 140\}$, $\{74, 107\}$, $\{115, 83, 78\}$, $\{80, 137\}$, $\{82, 94\}$, $\{129, 91, 84\}$, $\{97, 104, 105, 109, 116, 85, 118, 120\}$, $\{124, 92, 119\}$, $\{112, 93\}$, $\{96, 139\}$, $\{101, 135\}$, $\{117, 126, 103\}$, $\{106, 132, 111\}$, $\{128, 131\}$, $\{185, 141, 143\}$, $\{144, 201, 210\}$, $\{145, 163\}$, $\{146, 171, 150\}$, $\{170, 147\}$, $\{176, 184, 151\}$, $\{169, 194, 155\}$, $\{160, 177, 156, 174, 191\}$, $\{186,$

187, 158, 159}, {193, 166}, {178, 188, 173}, {192, 181, 203, 190, 207}, {182, 183}, {2}, {6}, {8}, {9}, {13}, {16}, {17}, {19}, {24}, {25}, {37}, {38}, {40}, {44}, {45}, {51}, {52}, {58}, {60}, {62}, {65}, {66}, {71}, {79}, {81}, {86}, {87}, {88}, {89}, {90}, {95}, {98}, {99}, {100}, {102}, {110}, {113}, {114}, {121}, {122}, {123}, {127}, {130}, {133}, {138}, {142}, {152}, {153}, {154}, {162}, {165}, {167}, {172}, {175}, {179}, {180}, {189}, {195}, {196}, {197}, {198}, {204}, {208}, {209}.

The Lower Approximation: {1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 11, 53, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 29, 27, 28, 31, 55, 35, 47, 59, 39, 48, 49, 57, 50, 56, 67, 69, 2, 6, 8, 9, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 58, 60, 62, 65, 66}.

The Upper Approximation: {1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 11, 53, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 29, 20, 148, 205, 21, 30, 68, 149, 199, 27, 28, 31, 55, 33, 64, 164, 35, 47, 59, 36, 125, 136, 39, 48, 49, 57, 43, 200, 202, 50, 56, 61, 157, 63, 206, 67, 69, 70, 161, 168, 2, 6, 8, 9, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 58, 60, 62, 65, 66}.

The Boundary: {136, 20, 21, 148, 149, 157, 30, 33, 161, 36, 164, 168, 43, 61, 63, 64, 68, 70, 199, 200, 202, 205, 206, 125}.

$$\nu_A(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{A\})}(X)| = |\{206, 168, 63\}| = 3.$$

B is omitted

Equivalence classes: {32, 1}, {3, 4}, {18, 5, 23}, {54, 7, 22, 41, 42}, {10, 26}, {34, 12, 46}, {29, 14, 15}, {148, 20, 205}, {68, 21, 149, 199, 30}, {27, 28}, {56, 50, 55, 31}, {64, 33, 164, 53}, {136, 36, 125}, {48, 49, 57, 39}, {200, 202, 43}, {59, 47}, {61, 157}, {66, 63}, {67, 69}, {161, 70}, {72, 76, 77, 134}, {73, 75, 108, 140}, {74, 107}, {115, 83, 78}, {80, 137, 122}, {82, 94}, {129, 91, 84}, {97, 104, 105, 109, 116, 85, 118, 120}, {124, 131, 92, 119}, {112, 93}, {96, 139}, {101, 135}, {117, 126, 103}, {106, 132, 111}, {185, 141, 143}, {144, 201, 210}, {145, 194, 163, 169, 155}, {146, 171, 150}, {170, 147}, {176, 184, 151}, {160, 177, 156, 174, 191}, {186, 187, 158, 159}, {193, 166}, {178, 188, 173}, {192, 181, 203, 190, 207}, {2}, {6}, {8}, {9}, {11}, {13}, {16}, {17}, {19}, {24}, {25}, {35}, {37}, {38}, {40}, {44}, {45}, {51}, {52}, {58}, {60}, {62}, {65}, {71}, {79}, {81}, {86}, {87}, {88}, {89}, {90}, {95}, {98}, {99}, {100}, {102}, {110}, {113}, {114}, {121}, {123}, {127}, {128}, {130}, {133}, {138}, {142}, {152}, {153}, {154}, {162}, {165}, {167}, {168}, {172}, {175}, {179}, {180}, {182}, {183}, {189}, {195}, {196}, {197}, {198}, {204}, {206}, {208}, {209}.

The Lower Approximation: {1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 29, 27, 28, 31, 50, 55, 56, 39, 48, 49, 57, 47, 59, 63, 66, 67, 69, 2, 6, 8, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 58, 60, 62, 65}.

The Upper Approximation: {1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 29, 20, 148, 205, 21, 30, 68, 149, 199, 27, 28, 31, 50, 55, 56, 33, 53, 64, 164, 36, 125, 136, 39, 48, 49, 57, 43, 200, 202, 47, 59, 61, 157, 63, 66, 67, 69, 70, 161, 2, 6, 8, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 58, 60, 62, 65}.

The Boundary: {136, 20, 21, 148, 149, 157, 30, 33, 161, 36, 164, 43, 53, 61, 64, 68, 70, 199, 200, 202, 205, 125}.

$$\nu_B(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{B\})}(X)| = |\{53\}| = 1.$$

C is omitted

Equivalence classes: {32, 1, 36, 136, 125}, {3, 4}, {18, 5, 23, 59, 47}, {8, 6}, {68, 7, 199, 41, 42, 21, 22, 54, 149, 30}, {10, 26}, {34, 12, 46}, {27, 28, 29, 14, 15}, {148, 196, 20, 205}, {67, 69, 55, 31}, {64, 33, 51, 164}, {48, 49, 39, 57, 45}, {200, 202, 66, 43}, {56, 50}, {154, 61, 62, 157}, {161, 70}, {134, 72, 73, 75, 108, 140, 76, 77}, {74, 107}, {115, 90, 83, 78}, {127, 95, 79}, {80, 137, 139, 96}, {82, 94}, {129, 91, 84}, {97, 104, 105, 109, 116, 85, 118, 88, 120}, {100, 87}, {89, 121}, {124, 132, 119, 106, 92, 111}, {112, 93}, {123, 101, 135}, {117, 126, 103}, {113, 110}, {185, 141, 143}, {144, 201, 210}, {145, 163}, {160, 165, 171, 174, 177, 146, 150, 156, 191}, {209, 170, 147}, {176, 194, 151, 184, 169, 155, 175}, {162, 186, 187, 158, 159}, {193, 166}, {198, 182, 167}, {179, 172}, {192, 203, 173, 207, 178, 181, 188, 190}, {2}, {9}, {11}, {13}, {16}, {17}, {19}, {24}, {25}, {35}, {37}, {38}, {40}, {44}, {52}, {53}, {58}, {60}, {63}, {65}, {71}, {81}, {86}, {98}, {99}, {102}, {114}, {122}, {128}, {130}, {131}, {133}, {138}, {142}, {152}, {153}, {168}, {180}, {183}, {189}, {195}, {197}, {204}, {206}, {208}.

The Lower Approximation: {3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 47, 59, 6, 8, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 27, 28, 29, 31, 55, 67, 69, 39, 45, 48, 49, 57, 50, 56, 2, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 52, 53, 58, 60, 63, 65}.

The Upper Approximation: {1, 32, 36, 125, 136, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 47, 59, 6, 8, 7, 21, 22, 30, 41, 42, 54, 68, 149, 199, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 14, 15, 27, 28, 29, 20, 148, 196, 205, 31, 55, 67, 69, 33, 51, 64, 164, 39, 45, 48, 49, 57, 43, 66, 200, 202, 50, 56, 61, 62, 154, 157, 70, 161, 2, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 52, 53, 58, 60, 63, 65}.

The Boundary: {1, 7, 136, 20, 21, 22, 148, 149, 154, 157, 30, 32, 33, 161, 36, 164, 41, 42, 43, 51, 54, 61, 62, 64, 66, 68, 196, 70, 199, 200, 202, 205, 125}.

$$\nu_C(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{C\})}(X)| = |\{1, 66, 196, 7, 22, 154, 32, 41, 42, 51, 54, 62\}| = 12.$$

D is omitted

Equivalence classes: $\{32, 1, 37\}, \{3, 4, 6\}, \{18, 5, 23\}, \{54, 7, 22, 41, 42\}, \{59, 10, 26, 47\}, \{65, 34, 12, 46\}, \{196, 13\}, \{66, 29, 14, 15\}, \{148, 20, 205\}, \{68, 21, 149, 199, 30\}, \{27, 28\}, \{55, 31\}, \{64, 33, 164, 182\}, \{136, 36, 125\}, \{48, 49, 57, 39\}, \{200, 202, 43\}, \{56, 50\}, \{51, 198\}, \{61, 157\}, \{67, 69\}, \{161, 70\}, \{134, 72, 123, 76, 77\}, \{140, 101, 135, 73, 75, 108\}, \{74, 107\}, \{115, 83, 78\}, \{80, 137\}, \{82, 94\}, \{100, 129, 91, 84\}, \{97, 104, 105, 109, 116, 85, 118, 120\}, \{124, 92, 119\}, \{112, 132, 106, 93, 111\}, \{96, 139\}, \{117, 126, 103\}, \{144, 210, 185, 201, 141, 143\}, \{145, 163\}, \{146, 171, 150\}, \{170, 147\}, \{176, 184, 151\}, \{169, 194, 155\}, \{160, 177, 156, 174, 191\}, \{186, 187, 158, 159\}, \{193, 166\}, \{178, 188, 173\}, \{192, 181, 203, 190, 207\}, \{2\}, \{8\}, \{9\}, \{11\}, \{16\}, \{17\}, \{19\}, \{24\}, \{25\}, \{35\}, \{38\}, \{40\}, \{44\}, \{45\}, \{52\}, \{53\}, \{58\}, \{60\}, \{62\}, \{63\}, \{71\}, \{79\}, \{81\}, \{86\}, \{87\}, \{88\}, \{89\}, \{90\}, \{95\}, \{98\}, \{99\}, \{102\}, \{110\}, \{113\}, \{114\}, \{121\}, \{122\}, \{127\}, \{128\}, \{130\}, \{131\}, \{133\}, \{138\}, \{142\}, \{152\}, \{153\}, \{154\}, \{162\}, \{165\}, \{167\}, \{168\}, \{172\}, \{175\}, \{179\}, \{180\}, \{183\}, \{189\}, \{195\}, \{197\}, \{204\}, \{206\}, \{208\}, \{209\}.$

The Lower Approximation: $\{1, 32, 37, 3, 4, 6, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 47, 59, 12, 34, 46, 65, 14, 15, 29, 66, 27, 28, 31, 55, 39, 48, 49, 57, 50, 56, 67, 69, 2, 8, 9, 11, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 38, 40, 44, 45, 52, 53, 58, 60, 62, 63\}.$

The Upper Approximation: $\{1, 32, 37, 3, 4, 6, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 41, 42, 54, 10, 26, 47, 59, 12, 34, 46, 65, 13, 196, 14, 15, 29, 66, 20, 148, 205, 21, 30, 68, 149, 199, 27, 28, 31, 55, 33, 64, 164, 182, 36, 125, 136, 39, 48, 49, 57, 43, 200, 202, 50, 56, 51, 198, 61, 157, 67, 69, 70, 161, 2, 8, 9, 11, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 38, 40, 44, 45, 52, 53, 58, 60, 62, 63\}.$

The Boundary: $\{136, 13, 20, 21, 148, 149, 157, 30, 33, 161, 36, 164, 43, 51, 182, 61, 64, 68, 196, 70, 198, 199, 200, 202, 205, 125\}.$

$$\nu_D(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{D\})}(X)| = |\{196, 198, 13, 51, 182\}| = 5.$$

E is omitted

Equivalence classes: $\{32, 1\}, \{2, 12, 34, 46\}, \{3, 4, 200, 202, 43\}, \{18, 5, 23\}, \{7, 39, 41, 42, 48, 49, 22, 54, 57\}, \{8, 29, 14, 15\}, \{10, 26\}, \{148, 20, 205\}, \{68, 21, 149, 199, 30\}, \{27, 28\}, \{55, 31\}, \{64, 33, 164\}, \{136, 36, 125\}, \{59, 47\}, \{56, 50\}, \{61, 157\}, \{206, 62\}, \{67, 69\}, \{161, 70\}, \{133, 134, 72, 76, 77\}, \{73, 75, 108, 140\}, \{74, 107\}, \{115, 83, 78, 79\}, \{80, 137\}, \{82, 94\}, \{129, 91, 84\}, \{97, 104, 105, 109, 116, 85, 118, 120\}, \{124, 92, 119\}, \{112, 93\}, \{96, 138, 139\}, \{101, 135\}, \{117, 126, 103\}, \{106, 132, 111\}, \{185, 141, 143\}, \{144, 201, 210\}, \{145, 163\}, \{146, 171, 150\}, \{170, 147\}, \{176, 184, 151\}, \{169, 194, 155\}, \{160, 177, 156, 174, 191\}, \{186, 187, 158, 159\}, \{193, 166\}, \{178, 188, 173\}, \{192, 195, 181, 203, 190, 207\}, \{6\}, \{9\}, \{11\}, \{13\}, \{16\}, \{17\}, \{19\}, \{24\}, \{25\}, \{35\}, \{37\}, \{38\}, \{40\}, \{44\}, \{45\}, \{51\}, \{52\}, \{53\}, \{58\}, \{60\}, \{63\}, \{65\}, \{66\}, \{71\}, \{81\}, \{86\}, \{87\}, \{88\}, \{89\}, \{90\}, \{95\}, \{98\}, \{99\}, \{100\}, \{102\}, \{110\},$

{113}, {114}, {121}, {122}, {123}, {127}, {128}, {130}, {131}, {142}, {152}, {153}, {154}, {162}, {165}, {167}, {168}, {172}, {175}, {179}, {180}, {182}, {183}, {189}, {196}, {197}, {198}, {204}, {208}, {209}.

The Lower Approximation: {1, 32, 2, 12, 34, 46, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 39, 41, 42, 48, 49, 54, 57, 8, 14, 15, 29, 10, 26, 27, 28, 31, 55, 47, 59, 50, 56, 67, 69, 6, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 53, 58, 60, 63, 65, 66}.

The Upper Approximation: {1, 32, 2, 12, 34, 46, 3, 4, 43, 200, 202, 5, 18, 23, 7, 22, 39, 41, 42, 48, 49, 54, 57, 8, 14, 15, 29, 10, 26, 20, 148, 205, 21, 30, 68, 149, 199, 27, 28, 31, 55, 33, 64, 164, 36, 125, 136, 47, 59, 50, 56, 61, 157, 62, 206, 67, 69, 70, 161, 6, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 45, 51, 52, 53, 58, 60, 63, 65, 66}.

The Boundary: {3, 4, 136, 20, 21, 148, 149, 157, 30, 33, 161, 36, 164, 43, 61, 62, 64, 68, 70, 199, 200, 202, 205, 206, 125}.

$$\nu_E(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{E\})}(X)| = |\{3, 4, 206, 62\}| = 4.$$

F is omitted

Equivalence classes: {32, 1, 52, 59, 47}, {8, 2, 40}, {19, 17, 3, 4}, {18, 36, 5, 23, 136, 125}, {16, 6}, {67, 69, 7, 41, 42, 51, 22, 54}, {137, 73, 75, 140, 108, 9, 80, 81}, {10, 26, 44, 37}, {29, 34, 46, 12, 13, 14, 15}, {148, 20, 205}, {64, 33, 68, 164, 199, 141, 142, 143, 21, 149, 55, 185, 30, 31}, {24, 195}, {27, 28}, {48, 49, 57, 39}, {200, 202, 43}, {58, 45}, {56, 50, 53}, {192, 203, 207, 179, 61, 181, 189, 157, 190}, {65, 66, 196, 197, 204}, {153, 161, 180, 70}, {96, 134, 72, 139, 76, 77}, {74, 107, 87}, {97, 129, 104, 105, 109, 78, 83, 84, 85, 115, 116, 118, 121, 91, 120}, {103, 92, 113, 82, 117, 119, 126, 124, 94}, {89, 90}, {112, 114, 93}, {98, 127}, {101, 135}, {128, 130, 102}, {106, 132, 110, 111}, {138, 133}, {144, 201, 210, 182}, {145, 163}, {146, 171, 150, 175}, {160, 194, 169, 170, 174, 177, 147, 155, 156, 191}, {176, 209, 165, 151, 184}, {152, 168}, {178, 188, 154, 172, 173}, {186, 187, 158, 159}, {193, 166}, {208, 198}, {11}, {25}, {35}, {38}, {60}, {62}, {63}, {71}, {79}, {86}, {88}, {95}, {99}, {100}, {122}, {123}, {131}, {162}, {167}, {183}, {206}.

The Lower Approximation: {1, 32, 47, 52, 59, 2, 8, 40, 3, 4, 17, 19, 6, 16, 7, 22, 41, 42, 51, 54, 67, 69, 10, 26, 37, 44, 12, 13, 14, 15, 29, 34, 46, 27, 28, 39, 48, 49, 57, 45, 58, 50, 53, 56, 11, 25, 35, 38, 60, 62, 63}.

The Upper Approximation: {1, 32, 47, 52, 59, 2, 8, 40, 3, 4, 17, 19, 5, 18, 23, 36, 125, 136, 6, 16, 7, 22, 41, 42, 51, 54, 67, 69, 9, 73, 75, 80, 81, 108, 137, 140, 10, 26, 37, 44, 12, 13, 14, 15, 29, 34, 46, 20, 148, 205, 21, 30, 31, 33, 55, 64, 68, 141, 142, 143, 149, 164, 185, 199, 24, 195, 27, 28, 39, 48, 49, 57, 43, 200, 202, 45, 58, 50, 53, 56, 61, 157, 179, 181, 189, 190, 192, 203, 207, 65, 66, 196, 197, 204, 70, 153, 161, 180, 11, 25, 35, 38, 60, 62, 63}.

The Boundary: {5, 136, 9, 137, 140, 141, 142, 143, 18, 20, 21, 148, 23, 24, 149, 153, 157, 30, 31, 33, 161, 36, 164, 43, 179, 180, 181, 55, 185, 61, 189, 190, 64, 65, 66, 192, 68, 195, 70, 196, 197, 73, 199, 75, 200, 202, 203, 204, 80, 81, 205, 207, 108, 125}.

$\nu_F(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{F\})}(X)| = |\{5, 9, 137, 140, 141, 142, 143, 18, 23, 24, 153, 31, 179, 180, 181, 55, 185, 189, 190, 192, 65, 66, 195, 196, 197, 73, 75, 203, 204, 207, 80, 81, 108\}| = 33.$

G is omitted

Equivalence classes: {32, 1}, {3, 4}, {18, 5, 23}, {45, 6}, {7, 41, 42, 14, 15, 22, 54, 29}, {48, 49, 39, 8, 57}, {9, 10, 26}, {34, 67, 69, 12, 46}, {51, 13}, {148, 20, 205, 182}, {68, 21, 149, 199, 27, 28, 30}, {55, 31}, {64, 33, 164}, {136, 36, 125}, {80, 137, 37}, {128, 38}, {200, 202, 43}, {140, 73, 75, 108, 44}, {59, 47}, {56, 50}, {209, 61, 157}, {161, 70}, {72, 76, 77, 134}, {124, 119, 74, 107, 92}, {115, 83, 78}, {82, 94}, {129, 91, 84}, {97, 104, 105, 109, 112, 116, 85, 118, 120, 93}, {113, 87}, {96, 139}, {100, 110}, {101, 135}, {117, 126, 103}, {106, 132, 111}, {121, 114}, {185, 141, 143}, {144, 201, 210}, {145, 163}, {146, 171, 150}, {170, 154, 147}, {192, 203, 207, 176, 181, 151, 184, 190}, {178, 194, 169, 155, 188, 173}, {160, 177, 156, 172, 174, 191}, {186, 187, 158, 159}, {179, 165}, {193, 206, 166}, {196, 198}, {208, 204}, {2}, {11}, {16}, {17}, {19}, {24}, {25}, {35}, {40}, {52}, {53}, {58}, {60}, {62}, {63}, {65}, {66}, {71}, {79}, {81}, {86}, {88}, {89}, {90}, {95}, {98}, {99}, {102}, {122}, {123}, {127}, {130}, {131}, {133}, {138}, {142}, {152}, {153}, {162}, {167}, {168}, {175}, {180}, {183}, {189}, {195}, {197}.

The Lower Approximation: {1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 6, 45, 7, 14, 15, 22, 29, 41, 42, 54, 8, 39, 48, 49, 57, 9, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 67, 69, 13, 51, 31, 55, 47, 59, 50, 56, 2, 11, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 40, 52, 53, 58, 60, 62, 63, 65, 66}.

The Upper Approximation: {1, 32, 3, 4, 5, 18, 23, 6, 45, 7, 14, 15, 22, 29, 41, 42, 54, 8, 39, 48, 49, 57, 9, 10, 26, 12, 34, 46, 67, 69, 13, 51, 20, 148, 182, 205, 21, 27, 28, 30, 68, 149, 199, 31, 55, 33, 64, 164, 36, 125, 136, 37, 80, 137, 38, 128, 43, 200, 202, 44, 73, 75, 108, 140, 47, 59, 50, 56, 61, 157, 209, 70, 161, 2, 11, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 35, 40, 52, 53, 58, 60, 62, 63, 65, 66}.

The Boundary: {128, 136, 137, 140, 20, 21, 148, 149, 27, 28, 157, 30, 33, 161, 36, 37, 38, 164, 43, 44, 182, 61, 64, 68, 70, 199, 200, 73, 202, 75, 205, 80, 209, 108, 125}.

$\nu_G(X) = |B_R(X) - B_{(R-\{G\})}(X)| = |\{128, 73, 137, 140, 75, 80, 209, 27, 28, 37, 38, 44, 108, 182\}| = 14.$

If attributes which have $\nu_r(X) \leq 5$ are eliminated, then the $Core(X) = \{C, F, G\}$.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Ali Dinler for encouraging me to generalize the rough topology to numerical data to apply it feature selection problems for energy data. Lastly, I would like to thank Kenan Evren Boyabatlı for helping me to write python codes.

References

- [1] Pawlak Z. Rough Sets. *International Journal of Computer and Information Sciences*, 1982. **11**:341–356. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01001956>.
- [2] Pawlak Z. Rough set theory and its applications. *Journal of Telecommunications and Information Technology*, 2002. **3**:7–10.
- [3] Thivagar ML, Richard C, Paul N. Mathematical Innovations of a Modern Topology in Medical Events. *International Journal of Information Science*, 2012. **2**:33–36. doi:10.5923/j.ijis.20120204.01.
- [4] Pawlak Z. Some Issues on Rough Sets. *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, 2004. **3100**. doi:10.1007/978-3-540-27794-1_1.
- [5] Sayed ME, Safty MAE, El-Bably MK. Topological approach for decision-making of COVID-19 infection via a nano-topology model. *AIMS Mathematics*, 2021. **6**(7):7872–7894. doi:10.3934/math.2021457. URL <https://www.aimspress.com/article/doi/10.3934/math.2021457>.
- [6] Atik A, El-Bably M. Soft β -rough sets and its application to determine COVID-19. *Turkish Journal of Mathematics*, 2021. **45**. doi:10.3906/MAT-2008-93.
- [7] Nasef AA, Shokry M, Mukhtar SOM. Some methods to reduction on electrical transmission lines by using rough concepts. *Filomat*, 2020. **34**:111–128.
- [8] Järinen J. Approximations and Rough Sets Based on Tolerances. In: Ziarko W, Yao Y (eds.), *Rough Sets and Current Trends in Computing*. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, Berlin, Heidelberg. ISBN 978-3-540-45554-7, 2001 pp. 182–189. doi:10.1007/3-540-45554-X_21.
- [9] Khozeimeh F, Alizadehsani R, Roshanzamir M, Khosravi A, Layegh P, Nahavandi S. An expert system for selecting wart treatment method. *Computers in Biology and Medicine*, 2017. **81**:167–175. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compbiomed.2017.01.001>. URL <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S001048251730001X>.
- [10] Charytanowicz M, Niewczas J, Kulczycki P, Kowalski PA, Łukasik S, Żak S. Complete Gradient Clustering Algorithm for Features Analysis of X-Ray Images, volume 69, pp. 15–24. Springer. ISBN 978-3-642-13104-2, 2010. doi:10.1007/978-3-642-13105-9_2.
- [11] Salama A. Topological Solution of Missing Attribute Values Problem in Incomplete Information Tables. *Information Sciences*, 2010. **180**:631–639. doi:10.1016/j.ins.2009.11.010.
- [12] Yang X, Yang J. Incomplete information system and rough set theory. Models and attribute reductions. Springer Berlin, Heidelberg, 2013. ISBN 978-3-642-25934-0. doi:10.1007/978-3-642-25935-7.
- [13] Kryszkiewicz M. Rough Set Approach to Incomplete Information Systems. *Inf. Sci.*, 1998. **112**:39–49.