

# Normal modes of Proca fields in AdS spacetime

Tiago V. Fernandes, David Hilditch, José P. S. Lemos, and Vítor Cardoso  
*Centro de Astrofísica e Gravitação - CENTRA, Departamento de Física,  
Instituto Superior Técnico - IST, Universidade de Lisboa - UL,  
Avenida Rovisco Pais 1, 1049-001 Lisboa, Portugal*

A normal mode analysis for Proca fields in the anti-de Sitter (AdS) spacetime is given. It is found that the equations for the Proca field can be decoupled analytically. This is performed by changing the basis of the vector spherical harmonics (VSH) decomposition. The normal modes and the normal mode frequencies of the Proca equation in the AdS spacetime are then analytically determined. It is also shown that the Maxwell field can be recovered by taking the massless limit of the Proca field with care so that the nonphysical gauge modes are eliminated.

## I. INTRODUCTION

The anti-de Sitter (AdS) spacetime [1, 2] is a vacuum solution to the Einstein equations with negative cosmological constant, and has therefore negative scalar curvature. There has been substantial interest in studying AdS spacetimes for several reasons. One is that their asymptotic behavior is well controlled and permits further analytical treatment of the spacetime [3]. Another is due to the bridge between asymptotically AdS spacetimes and conformal field theories that naturally arise in string theory, a link known as the AdS/CFT conjecture [4]. In addition, since the AdS spacetime is a confined spacetime, it has been used to emulate the dynamics of fields in a cavity. In this connection, a gravitational instability of AdS spacetime has been found in [5] where, by considering the numerical evolution of the Einstein–Klein–Gordon equations, it was shown that nonlinear effects always become important at late times and lead to the formation of small black holes from a large class of arbitrary small initial amplitudes of the scalar field. Further work supports this claim by considering a complex scalar field in AdS [6]. Therefore, the AdS spacetime is unstable to certain types of initial data, although not against all classes of initial data, see, e.g., [7].

An important aspect of many spacetimes is the behavior of their quasinormal and normal modes, as these modes describe how the spacetimes respond under linear perturbations. In asymptotically AdS spacetimes, for which the oscillations are quasinormal, these modes play a role in the linear stability of the spacetimes themselves and have also proven of interest in the AdS/CFT conjecture. In the AdS spacetime, one finds that when it is linearly perturbed with reflective boundary conditions, also called box boundary conditions, it oscillates normally, rather than quasinormally, as there are no losses of the field to infinity. For the AdS spacetime, the normal modes of scalar [8], electromagnetic and gravitational perturbations [9], and massive Proca perturbations [10, 11] have been studied.

In this work, we obtain analytically the normal modes and the normal mode frequencies of the Proca field in the AdS spacetime under reflective boundary conditions. To do so we perform, in a new way, a change of the basis of

the usual vector spherical harmonics (VSH) decomposition that not only separates the Proca equations but also decouples the relevant modes, thus remarkably simplifying the calculations. The Maxwell field normal modes and normal mode frequencies can be recovered distinctly by taking with care the massless limit of the Proca field. We use some methods and results taken from [12–16].

The paper is organized as follows. In section II, we introduce the classical treatment of minimally coupled Proca field to the curvature and display the AdS line element for the fixed background. In section III, the separation and decoupling of the Proca field in AdS spacetime through the VSH method is studied. In section IV, imposing reflective boundary conditions for the Proca field, we calculate analytically the Proca normal modes and normal mode frequencies, and find also the Maxwell modes by taking the zero mass limit. In section V, we conclude. In the Appendices A and B we give formulas and perform some calculations that are useful for the main text. We use geometric units throughout the paper, so that  $G = c = 1$ .

## II. FIELD EQUATIONS FOR THE EINSTEIN-PROCA SYSTEM WITH A NEGATIVE COSMOLOGICAL CONSTANT: PROCA FIELDS IN ADS SPACETIME

### A. Proca field equations

The Einstein-Proca system is described by the action  $S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} (L_{\text{EH}} - L_{\text{P}})$ , where  $g$  is the determinant of the metric  $g_{ab}$ ,  $L_{\text{EH}} = \frac{R-2\Lambda}{16\pi}$ , is the Einstein-Hilbert Lagrangian density, with  $R_{ab}$  and  $R = R_{ab}g^{ab}$  being the Ricci tensor and the Ricci scalar, respectively, which in turn are related to the metric  $g_{ab}$  and its first and second spacetime derivatives,  $\Lambda$  is the cosmological constant,  $L_{\text{P}} = \frac{F_{ab}F^{ab}}{4} + \frac{\mu^2}{2} A_a A^a$  is the Proca Lagrangian density, with  $F_{ab} = \nabla_a A_b - \nabla_b A_a$  being the Proca field strength,  $\nabla_a$  denoting covariant derivative,  $A_a$  being the Proca vector potential, and  $\mu$  being the mass of the Proca field. The Euler-Lagrange equations for the action above yield the Einstein equation  $G_{ab} + \Lambda g_{ab} = 8\pi T_{ab}$  for the metric field, where  $T_{ab}$  is the Proca energy-momentum tensor

given by  $T_{ab} = F_{ac}F_{bf}g^{ef} + \mu^2 A_a A_b - g_{ab}L_P$ , and the Proca equation  $\nabla_b F^{ab} + \mu^2 A^a = 0$  for the vector field  $A_a$ . There are internal equations for  $A_a$ , namely,  $\nabla_{[a}F_{bc]} = 0$ . Moreover, as a direct consequence of the action formalism, the metric field and the Proca field obey their own Bianchi identities, namely,  $\nabla_a(G^{ab} + \Lambda g^{ab}) = 0$ , which implies  $\nabla_a T^{ab} = 0$ , and  $\nabla_a A^a = 0$ , respectively. We are interested in small, first order, perturbations of a Proca vector field  $A_a$  on a fixed spacetime background with negative cosmological constant  $\Lambda$ , i.e.,  $\Lambda < 0$ .

In zeroth order in  $A_a$ , i.e., for zero Proca vector field, the Einstein equation reduces to  $G_{ab} - \frac{3}{l^2}g_{ab} = 0$ , where  $l = \sqrt{-\frac{3}{\Lambda}}$  is the spacetime characteristic length associated to the negative cosmological constant  $\Lambda$ . This Einstein equation gives as a solution the AdS spacetime, which is here considered as the fixed background metric. The AdS spacetime is spherically symmetric, has no horizons, and its line element in spherical coordinates  $(t, r, \theta, \phi)$  is given by

$$ds^2 = -f(r)dt^2 + \frac{dr^2}{f(r)} + r^2(d\theta^2 + \sin^2\theta d\phi^2),$$

$$f(r) = 1 + \frac{r^2}{l^2}. \quad (1)$$

In first order in  $A_a$ , i.e., for perturbations of the field  $A_a$  that generate small curvature perturbations compared with the curvature of the background, it is possible to perform an analytical treatment. In first order in  $A_a$ , there is a corresponding Proca energy-momentum tensor  $T_{ab}$ . This Proca energy-momentum tensor  $T_{ab}$  is second order in  $A_a$ , which means that it does not back react in first order into the vacuum Einstein equation, i.e.,  $G_{ab} + \frac{3}{l^2}g_{ab} = 0$ , in turn implying that the AdS line element of Eq. (1) still holds. It also means that the Proca  $T_{ab}$  still obeys the Bianchi identity  $\nabla_a T^{ab} = 0$ , on the fixed AdS background metric solution of Eq. (1). On the other hand, since now there is a first order Proca field  $A_a$  permeating the spacetime, the field has to obey in first order the Proca equation  $\nabla_b F^{ab} + \mu^2 A^a = 0$ . This equation can be simplified to

$$g^{cd}\nabla_c\nabla_d A^a - \left(\mu^2 - \frac{3}{l^2}\right)A^a = 0, \quad (2)$$

where the commutator property of the covariant derivative has been used, and where it was imposed the Bianchi identity for the field  $A_a$ , i.e., the divergence of the vector field  $A^a$  is zero, explicitly

$$\nabla_a A^a = 0. \quad (3)$$

The Bianchi identity is a consequence of the field equations, and as such is a condition that the field  $A_a$  necessarily obeys.

In brief, first order perturbations of the Proca field  $A_a$  in the AdS spacetime background of Eq. (1) are described by Eq. (2), with Eq. (3) as an auxiliary equation.

## B. Maxwell field equations as the zero mass limit of the Proca field

The equations for the first order perturbations of the Maxwell field in the AdS spacetime background of Eq. (1) can be taken as the zero mass limit,  $\mu = 0$ , of the Proca field equations. Thus, the massless case  $\mu = 0$  reduces Eq. (2) to the Maxwell equation for the Maxwell vector field  $A_a$ , namely

$$g^{cd}\nabla_c\nabla_d A^a + \frac{3}{l^2}A^a = 0, \quad (4)$$

and the Bianchi identity, Eq. (3), turns into the Lorenz gauge condition, i.e., the field  $A_a$  has not necessarily to obey it. In addition, when this gauge condition is imposed, the Maxwell field still has a residual gauge freedom and can be transformed as  $A^a \rightarrow A^a + \chi^{,a}$ , where  $\chi$  is a scalar field that obeys the Klein-Gordon equation, while the Maxwell equation remains unchanged.

## III. PROCA FIELD PERTURBATIONS IN ADS SPACETIME

### A. Perturbations in the Proca field and separation of variables

The Proca equations (2) in AdS spacetime may be separated using the VSH method which has been used in several other instances [12–14]. The VSH method can be formulated by the sum of a spin  $s = 1$  with the angular momentum  $\ell$  as is well known from quantum mechanics [15]. And so, the following ansatz can be assumed for the field  $A_a$ ,

$$A_a = \frac{1}{r} \sum_{i=0}^3 \sum_{lm} q_{(i)}(t, r) Q_{(i)a}^{\ell m}(r, \theta, \phi), \quad (5)$$

where the  $Q_{(i)a}^{\ell m}$  are given by

$$\begin{aligned} Q_{(0)a}^{\ell m} &= (1, 0, 0, 0) Y^{\ell m}, \\ Q_{(1)a}^{\ell m} &= \frac{1}{\ell} \left( 0, \frac{\ell}{rf}, \partial_\theta, \partial_\phi \right) Y^{\ell m}, \\ Q_{(2)a}^{\ell m} &= \frac{1}{\ell+1} \left( 0, \frac{\ell+1}{rf}, -\partial_\theta, -\partial_\phi \right) Y^{\ell m}, \\ Q_{(3)a}^{\ell m} &= \frac{r}{\sqrt{\ell(\ell+1)}} \left( 0, 0, \frac{\partial_\phi}{\sin\theta}, -\sin\theta\partial_\theta \right) Y^{\ell m}, \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

$Y^{\ell m}$  are the spherical harmonics,  $\ell$  is the angular momentum number,  $m$  is the azimuthal number, and the  $q_{(i)}(t, r)$  should have been written as  $q_{(i)}^{\ell m}(t, r)$ ,  $q_{(i)}(t, r) \equiv q_{(i)}^{\ell m}(t, r)$ , but to not overcrowd the notation we dropped the indices  $\ell$  and  $m$  here. For aspects on the notation see Appendix A.

Let us define the radius  $r_*$  by  $\frac{dr_*}{dr} = \frac{1}{f}$  and the family of operators  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_p$  by

$$\hat{\mathcal{D}}_p = -\partial_t^2 + \partial_{r_*}^2 - f \left[ \frac{p(p+1)}{r^2} + \mu^2 \right], \quad (7)$$

for a certain parameter  $p$ . Then, by inserting the ansatz given in Eq. (5) into the Proca equations (2), one obtains after rearrangements the following system of equations for the functions  $q_{(i)}$

$$\hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell q_{(0)} + (\partial_r f)(\dot{q}_{(1)} + \dot{q}_{(2)} - q'_{(0)}) = 0, \quad (8)$$

$$\hat{\mathcal{D}}_{j_1} q_{(1)} = 0, \quad (9)$$

$$\hat{\mathcal{D}}_{j_2} q_{(2)} = 0, \quad (10)$$

$$\hat{\mathcal{D}}_{j_3} q_{(3)} = 0, \quad (11)$$

where  $j_1 = \ell - 1$ ,  $j_2 = \ell + 1$ ,  $j_3 = \ell$ ,  $\dot{q}_{(i)} = \frac{\partial q_{(i)}}{\partial t}$ , and  $q'_{(i)} = \frac{\partial q_{(i)}}{\partial r_*}$ . The functions  $q_{(0)}$ ,  $q_{(1)}$  and  $q_{(2)}$  describe the electric modes and  $q_{(3)}$  describes the magnetic modes. These definitions come from the fact that the  $Q_{(0)a}^{\ell m}$ ,  $Q_{(1)a}^{\ell m}$ , and  $Q_{(2)a}^{\ell m}$ , gain a factor of  $(-1)^\ell$ , and the  $Q_{(3)a}^{\ell m}$  gain a factor of  $(-1)^{\ell+1}$ , under parity transformation. It must be also noted that the subscript of the operator  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_p$  in Eq. (7) determines the value of the term appearing in  $\frac{f}{r^2}$ , e.g.,  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell = -\partial_t^2 + \partial_{r_*}^2 - f \left[ \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} + \mu^2 \right]$ .

The Bianchi identity Eq. (3),  $\nabla^a A_a = 0$ , with the ansatz given by Eq. (5), can be written as

$$\frac{1}{rf} \left[ -\dot{q}_{(0)} + q'_{(1)} + q'_{(2)} + \frac{f}{r} (-\ell q_{(1)} + (\ell+1)q_{(2)}) \right] = 0, \quad (12)$$

which was used to find Eqs. (9) and (10). Indeed, by placing the ansatz Eq. (5) into Eq. (2), one obtains directly  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell q_{(1)} + \hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell q_{(2)} + (\partial_r f)(\dot{q}_{(0)} - q'_{(1)} - q'_{(2)}) + \frac{2f^2}{r^2}(\ell q_{(1)} - (\ell+1)q_{(2)}) = 0$  and  $(\ell+1)\hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell q_{(1)} - \ell\hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell q_{(2)} + \frac{2f\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2}(q_{(1)} + q_{(2)}) = 0$ . Substituting  $\dot{q}_{(0)}$  in the two equations above by Eq. (12) and further rearranging them, Eqs. (9) and (10) can be obtained. Equation (11) is obtained directly from the Proca equation (2) with the ansatz Eq. (5). Thus, the system consisting of second order partial differential equations given in Eqs. (8)-(11) determine the solution of the Proca field under our ansatz. We can use the Bianchi identity equation (12) to help in the determination of the solution, as it is a first order partial differential equation.

To deal with  $q_{(0)}$  we can split every  $q_{(i)}$ ,  $i = 0, 1, 2, 3$ , into a static part  $q_{(i)s}(r)$  and a dynamic part  $q_{(i)d}(r, t)$ , i.e.  $q_{(i)} = q_{(i)s}(r) + q_{(i)d}(t, r)$ . Here, we are interested only on the dynamic solutions of the system. Thus, we can use the Bianchi identity given in Eq. (12) in the form  $\dot{q}_{(0)d} = q'_{(1)} + q'_{(2)} + \frac{f}{r}(-\ell q_{(1)} + (\ell+1)q_{(2)})$ , to determine the dynamic part of  $q_{(0)}$ . Dealing with  $q_{(1)}$ ,  $q_{(2)}$ , and  $q_{(3)}$  is simpler, since the corresponding equations of the system are completely decoupled. To each  $q_{(i)}$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , there is a  $j_i$ , the total angular

momentum, i.e., the angular momentum plus the spin of the vector. The  $j_1$  cannot be negative,  $j_1 \geq 0$ , and moreover,  $j_2, j_3 \geq 1$ . For the monopole case,  $\ell = 0$ , the only function that is relevant is  $q_{(2)}$ .

## B. Perturbations in the Maxwell field as the zero mass limit of the Proca field

In the massless  $\mu = 0$  case, one has that the Proca field equation for  $A_a$  given in Eq. (2) turns into the Maxwell field equation for  $A_a$  given in Eq. (4). Moreover, in this case Eq. (3) turns from a Bianchi identity equation into the Lorenz gauge condition. But even imposing  $\nabla_a A^a = 0$  as a gauge in the massless case, there is still a further gauge freedom. This means that the vector potential  $A^a$  includes in this case degrees of freedom that are nonphysical. Thus, it is useful in this situation to work with the Maxwell tensor  $F_{ab}$  rather than  $A_a$ . Then, the vector field will have two physical degrees of freedom corresponding to the two transversal polarizations that will be described by

$$q_{(12)}(r) = -f \left[ \frac{\partial_\theta(\sin(\theta)F_{r\theta})}{\sin(\theta)} + \frac{1}{\sin^2(\theta)}\partial_\phi F_{r\phi} \right], \quad (13)$$

$$q_{(3)}(r) = -\frac{F_{\theta\phi}}{\sin(\theta)Y^{\ell m}}, \quad (14)$$

where  $q_{(12)}(r) = -\ell q'_{(1)} + (\ell+1)q'_{(2)} - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r}(q_{(1)} + q_{(2)})$ . The equation for  $q_{(12)}(r)$  can be found as  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_\ell q_{(12)}(r) = 0$  by using Eqs. (9) and (10), thus  $q_{(12)}(r)$  will obey the same equation for  $q_{(3)}$  with  $\mu = 0$ , see Eq. (11). The equation for  $q_{(3)}$  will be Eq. (11) with  $\mu = 0$ .

## IV. NORMAL MODES OF PROCA FIELDS IN ADS SPACETIME

### A. Normal modes of the Proca field

The normal modes of the Proca field in an AdS spacetime are described by the solutions of Eqs. (8)-(11) that satisfy boundary conditions at  $r = 0$  and  $r = \infty$ . At  $r = 0$  one imposes the regularity condition that the  $q_{(i)}(0)$ ,  $i = 0, 1, 2, 3$ , are finite. At  $r = \infty$  one imposes a reflective boundary condition, i.e., the  $q_{(i)}$  are zero,  $q_{(i)}(\infty) \rightarrow 0$ .

The solution for  $q_{(0)}$  follows either from Eq. (8) or from the Bianchi identity Eq. (12) once one knows the solutions for  $q_{(1)}$  and  $q_{(2)}$ . Thus, in this sense, one needs only to find the solutions for  $q_{(1)}$ ,  $q_{(2)}$ , and  $q_{(3)}$ , and then  $q_{(0)}$  is directly found from  $q_{(1)}$  and  $q_{(2)}$ . For  $i = 1, 2, 3$  we can write concisely Eqs. (9)-(11) as  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_{j_i} q_{(i)} = 0$ , where again  $j_1 = \ell - 1$ ,  $j_2 = \ell + 1$ ,  $j_3 = \ell$ , and  $\mathcal{D}_{j_i}$  is defined in Eq. (7). The solutions of Eqs. (9)-(11), i.e., of  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_{j_i} q_{(i)} = 0$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , can be expressed analytically, as we shall see. For that we assume that the time dependence of the  $q_{(i)}$  is  $e^{-i\omega t}$ , where  $\omega$  is the frequency.

Now, making the change of variables  $r_* = l \arctan\left(\frac{r}{l}\right)$ , one finds that  $\hat{\mathcal{D}}_{j_i} q_{(i)} = 0$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , becomes

$$q_{(i)}'' + \left[ \omega^2 - \frac{j_i(j_i + 1)}{l^2 \sin^2\left(\frac{r_*}{l}\right)} - \frac{\mu^2}{\cos^2\left(\frac{r_*}{l}\right)} \right] q_{(i)} = 0. \quad (15)$$

The solution of Eq. (15) can be worked out, see Appendix B, to give that the normal mode eigenfunctions  $q_{(i)}$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , have the form

$$q_{(i)} = A_{(i)} \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^{j_i+1} \left(1 + \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2\right)^{n - \frac{\omega_i l}{2}} \times {}_2F_1 \left[ \omega_i l - n, -n, j_i + \frac{3}{2}; \frac{\left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2}{1 + \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2} \right], \quad (16)$$

where  ${}_2F_1$  is the Gaussian hypergeometric function, and the frequencies  $\omega_i$  corresponding to each  $q_{(i)}$  must obey

$$\omega_i l = 2n + j_i + \frac{3}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sqrt{1 + 4\mu^2 l^2}. \quad (17)$$

These are the frequencies for the normal modes of the Proca field in AdS. Note the lowest frequency corresponds to  $j_1 = 0$ , i.e.,  $\ell = 1$  for  $q_{(1)}$ . The frequencies corresponding to the monopole case  $\ell = 0$  are  $\omega_2 l$  with  $j_2 = 1$ .

The normal modes in [10], Eq. (44), for the monopole case  $\ell = 0$  do not agree with our expression. We think this has to do with a discrepancy between our expression of  $\beta$  and the corresponding expression given in [10]. Additional evidence for the correctness of the present form of the expression is given by the numerical calculations we have performed to verify the analytical expression.

The expression of the normal mode frequencies of the Proca field in AdS given in Eq. (17) differs from the expression given in [11] in the case of  $j_1 = 0$ , where their Eq. (24) has an additional term  $+1$  compared with our Eq. (17), which is perhaps simply a typo. Note that the method used in [11] is completely different from the VSH method we use. Additional evidence for the correctness of our result is given by the numerical calculations we have performed to verify the analytical expression. These numerical calculations were done by using *Mathematica*. In particular, we used the function *NDEigenvalues* to obtain the eigenfrequencies of Eq. (15).

### B. Normal modes of the Maxwell field as the zero mass limit of the Proca field

The functions and the frequencies of the normal modes for the Maxwell field can be taken with care by setting  $\mu = 0$  in Eqs. (16) and (17). In fact, due to the gauge freedom, one has that the physical functions are  $q_{(12)}$  and  $q_{(3)}$  as stated in Eqs. (13) and (14) and both have the same normal mode frequency  $\omega$ , i.e.,  $\omega \equiv \omega_{(12)} = \omega_{(3)}$ . The function  $q_{(12)}$  has a complicated form and we do not

show it. The function  $q_{(3)}$ , let us denote simply by  $q$  in the Maxwell case, has the form

$$q = A \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^{\ell+1} \left(1 + \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2\right)^{n - \frac{\omega l}{2}} \times {}_2F_1 \left[ \omega l - n, -n, \ell + \frac{3}{2}; \frac{\left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2}{1 + \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2} \right], \quad (18)$$

and the frequencies  $\omega$  corresponding to  $q$  must obey

$$\omega l = 2n + \ell + 2. \quad (19)$$

The expression of the normal mode frequencies of the Maxwell field in AdS given in Eq. (17) is the same as that given in [9]. Additional evidence for the correctness of the result is again given by the numerical calculations we have performed to verify the analytical expression.

## V. CONCLUSIONS

In this work, the normal modes of the Proca field were obtained analytically for the AdS spacetime using a different and new manner, specifically, implementing a VSH decomposition in a basis that the decoupling of the equations is direct. The normal mode frequencies in the monopole case calculated by us differ from those found in [10]. The normal mode frequencies we found coincide with the energy levels calculated in [11], except for the single case of  $j_1 = 0$ . The normal modes of the Maxwell field, as the zero mass limit of the Proca field, were obtained analytically. It was shown that this limit has to be taken with care in order that one gets rid of the nonphysical gauge modes.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported through the European Research Council Consolidator Grant 647839, the Portuguese Science Foundation FCT Project IF/00577/2015, the FCT Project PTDC/MAT-APL/30043/2017, the FCT Project No. UIDB/00099/2020, and the FCT Project No. UIDP/00099/2020. This work has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement No. 101007855. The authors would like to acknowledge networking support by the GWverse COST Action CA16104, "Black holes, gravitational waves and fundamental physics."

### Appendix A: Notation

The ansatz used here to decouple and separate the Proca equations, see Eqs. (5) and (6), can be turned into the notation of [13]. In [13]  $A_a$  is expanded as

$$A_a = \frac{1}{r} \sum_{i=0}^3 \sum_{lm} c_i u_{(i)}(t, r) Z_{(i)a}^{\ell m}(r, \theta, \phi), \quad (\text{A1})$$

where  $c_0 =$ ,  $c_1 = 1$ ,  $c_2 = (\ell(\ell+1))^{-\frac{1}{2}}$ ,  $c_3 = (\ell(\ell+1))^{-\frac{1}{2}}$ , and the  $Z_a^{(i)\ell m}$  are given by

$$\begin{aligned} Z_{(0)a}^{\ell m} &= (1, 0, 0, 0) Y^{\ell m}, \\ Z_{(1)a}^{\ell m} &= (0, \frac{1}{f}, 0, 0) Y^{\ell m}, \\ Z_{(2)a}^{\ell m} &= \frac{r}{\sqrt{\ell(\ell+1)}} (0, 0, \partial_\theta, \partial_\phi) Y^{\ell m}, \\ Z_{(3)a}^{\ell m} &= \frac{r}{\sqrt{\ell(\ell+1)}} \left( 0, 0, \frac{\partial_\phi}{\sin\theta}, -\sin\theta \partial_\theta \right) Y^{\ell m}. \end{aligned} \quad (\text{A2})$$

The functions  $u_{(i)}$  should be written as  $u_{(i)}^{\ell m}$  but to avoid overcrowding the notation we have dropped the indices  $\ell m$ . The  $u_{(i)}$  have the following correspondence with the  $q_{(i)}$

$$u_{(0)} = q_{(0)}, \quad (\text{A3})$$

$$u_{(1)} = q_{(1)} + q_{(2)}, \quad (\text{A4})$$

$$u_{(2)} = (\ell+1)q_{(2)} - \ell q_{(1)}, \quad (\text{A5})$$

$$u_{(3)} = q_{(3)}. \quad (\text{A6})$$

The Proca equations with the ansatz Eq. (A1) for the Proca field  $A_a$  become

$$\hat{D}_\ell u_{(0)} + (\partial_r f)(\dot{u}_{(1)} - u'_{(0)}) = 0, \quad (\text{A7})$$

$$\hat{D}_\ell u_{(1)} + \frac{2f}{r^2}(u_{(2)} - u_{(1)}) = 0, \quad (\text{A8})$$

$$\hat{D}_\ell u_{(2)} + \left[ \frac{2f\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} u_{(1)} \right] = 0, \quad (\text{A9})$$

$$\hat{D}_\ell u_{(3)} = 0, \quad (\text{A10})$$

and the Bianchi identity becomes

$$\frac{1}{rf} \left[ u'_{(1)} - \dot{u}_{(0)} + \frac{f}{r}(u_{(1)} - u_{(2)}) \right] = 0, \quad (\text{A11})$$

which was used to find Eq. (A8). Indeed, by putting the ansatz Eq. (A1) onto Eq. (2), one obtains directly

$$\hat{D}_\ell u_{(1)} + (\partial_r f)(\dot{u}_{(0)} - u'_{(1)}) + \frac{2f^2}{r^2}(u_{(2)} - u_{(1)}) = 0 \quad (\text{A12})$$

which upon using Eq. (A11) gives Eq. (A8). Note the Eqs. (A8) and (A9) can be decoupled with the correspondence in Eqs. (A4) and (A5), obtaining Eqs. (9)-(11).

### Appendix B: Derivation of the normal mode eigenfunctions and the normal mode frequencies of the Proca field in AdS spacetime of Sec. IV

For completeness we repeat here the normal mode equation for the Proca field eigenfunctions  $q_{(i)}$  in AdS spacetime, i.e., Eq. (15) of the main text,

$$q_{(i)}'' + \left[ \omega^2 - \frac{j_i(j_i+1)}{l^2 \sin^2\left(\frac{r_*}{l}\right)} - \frac{\mu^2}{\cos^2\left(\frac{r_*}{l}\right)} \right] q_{(i)} = 0, \quad (\text{B1})$$

where all quantities have been previously defined. We perform the transformation  $z = \sin^2 \frac{r_*}{l}$ , recalling that  $r_*$  is defined by  $\frac{dr_*}{dr} = \frac{1}{f}$  with  $f(r) = 1 + \frac{r^2}{l^2}$ . We also make an ansatz in the variable  $z$  of the type

$$q_{(i)} = z^\alpha (1-z)^\beta \psi_{(i)}, \quad (\text{B2})$$

for some new  $\psi_{(i)}$ , with  $\alpha = \frac{1}{2}(j_i+1)$ , and  $\beta = \frac{1}{4} \left[ 1 + \sqrt{1 + 4\mu^2 l^2} \right]$ . Then, from Eqs. (B1) and (B2) we find that  $\psi_{(i)}$  satisfies a hypergeometric differential equation, namely,

$$z(1-z)\partial_z^2 \psi_{(i)} + [c - (a+b+1)z]\partial_z \psi_{(i)} - ab\psi_{(i)} = 0, \quad (\text{B3})$$

with  $a = \alpha + \beta + \frac{\omega l}{2}$ ,  $b = \alpha + \beta - \frac{\omega l}{2}$ , and  $c = \frac{1}{2} + 2\alpha$ . The solutions of Eq. (B3) are described by the hypergeometric function  ${}_2F_1$ , specifically,

$$\psi_{(i)} = A_{(i)} {}_2F_1[a, b, c; z] + B_{(i)} z^{\frac{1}{2}-2\alpha} \times {}_2F_1[d-c, e-c, 2-c; z], \quad (\text{B4})$$

where  $A_{(i)}$  and  $B_{(i)}$  are constants of integration, and  $d = 1+a$  and  $e = 1+b$ . Thus, from Eqs. (B2) and (B4) we obtain that each  $q_{(i)}$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , is given by

$$\begin{aligned} q_{(i)} &= A_{(i)} z^\alpha (1-z)^\beta {}_2F_1[a, b, c; z] + \\ &B_{(i)} z^{\frac{1}{2}-\alpha} (1-z)^\beta {}_2F_1[d-c, e-c, 2-c; z], \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B5})$$

The first boundary condition states that the  $q_{(i)}$  must be regular at  $r = 0$ , i.e., at  $z \rightarrow 0$ . The hypergeometric function assumes the value of unity when  $z = 0$ . Since  $\alpha \geq \frac{1}{2}$  and  $\beta \geq \frac{1}{2}$ , the second part of the solution explodes at  $z = 0$ , thus  $B_{(i)}$  in Eq. (B5) must be set to 0. In brief, the first boundary condition for the Proca field eigenfunctions  $q_{(i)}$ , which is imposed at the center of AdS spacetime,  $r = 0$  or  $z = 0$ , yields

$$B_{(i)} = 0. \quad (\text{B6})$$

The second boundary condition is a reflective boundary condition, it states that at infinity,  $r = \infty$ , the  $q_{(i)}$  must be zero. Following [16], at  $r = \infty$ , i.e.,  $z = 1$ , one has that  ${}_2F_1[a, b, c; 1] = \frac{\Gamma(c)\Gamma(w)}{\Gamma(c-a)\Gamma(c-b)}$ , where  $\Gamma$  is the gamma function,  $w = c - a - b$ , and  $v = a + b - c$ , if  $a, b$ , and

$c$  are positive. The solution explodes at  $z = 1$  since  $w = \frac{1}{2} - 2\beta \leq 0$ . The only way that  $q_{(i)}$  vanishes at infinity is if either  $a$  or  $b$  is a negative integer, say  $-n$ . Now,  $a$  cannot be negative because we require that the frequency must be positive, by definition. Hence, the boundary condition at infinity,  $r = \infty$ , imposes that  $b = -n$ . In brief, the second boundary condition for the Proca field eigenfunctions  $q_{(i)}$ , which is imposed at the infinity of AdS spacetime,  $r = \infty$  or  $z = \infty$ , yields with the help of the previous definitions the result

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha &= \frac{1}{2}(j_i + 1), & \beta &= \frac{\omega_i l}{2} - n - \frac{1}{2}(j_i + 1), \\ a &= \omega_i l - n, & b &= -n, & c &= j_i + \frac{3}{2}. \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B7})$$

Collecting all the results, namely, using Eqs. (B5)-(B7), and recalling that  $z = \sin^2 \frac{r_*}{l}$ , and  $r_*$  is defined by  $\frac{dr_*}{dr} =$

$\frac{1}{f}$  with  $f(r) = 1 + \frac{r^2}{l^2}$ , we have that the normal mode eigenfunctions  $q_{(i)}$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , have the form

$$\begin{aligned} q_{(i)} &= A_{(i)} \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^{j_i+1} \left(1 + \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2\right)^{n - \frac{\omega_i l}{2}} \times \\ & {}_2F_1 \left[ \omega_i l - n, -n, j_i + \frac{3}{2}; \frac{\left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2}{1 + \left(\frac{r}{l}\right)^2} \right]. \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B8})$$

and the frequencies  $\omega_i$  corresponding to each  $q_{(i)}$  must obey

$$\omega_i l = 2n + j_i + \frac{3}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sqrt{1 + 4\mu^2 l^2}. \quad (\text{B9})$$

These are the frequencies for the normal modes of the Proca field in AdS. Note the lowest frequency corresponds to  $j_1 = 0$ , i.e.,  $\ell = 1$  for  $q_{(1)}$ . Note that Eqs. (B8) and (B9) are Eqs. (16) and (17) of the main text.

- 
- [1] R. Penrose, “The structure of space-time”, in *Battelle Rencontres 1967 Lectures in Mathematical Physics*, eds B. DeWitt, J. A. Wheeler (Benjamin, New York, 1968), p. 121.
- [2] S. W. Hawking and G. F. R. Ellis, *The Large Scale Structure of Space-Time* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1973).
- [3] S. J. Avis, C. J. Isham, and D. Storey, “Quantum field theory in anti-de Sitter space-time”, *Phys. Rev. D* **18**, 3565 (1978).
- [4] J. M. Maldacena, “The Large N limit of superconformal field theories and supergravity”, *Adv. Theor. Math. Phys.* **2**, 231 (1998); arXiv:hep-th/9711200.
- [5] P. Bizoń and A. Rostworowski, “On weakly turbulent instability of anti-de Sitter space”, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **107**, 031102 (2011); arXiv:1104.3702 [gr-qc].
- [6] A. Buchel, L. Lehner, and S. L. Liebling, “Scalar collapse in AdS spacetimes”, *Phys. Rev. D* **86**, 123011 (2012); arXiv:1210.0890 [gr-qc].
- [7] R. Masachs and B. Way, “New islands of stability with double-trace deformations”, *Phys. Rev. D* **100**, 10 (2019); arXiv:1908.02296 [hep-th].
- [8] C. P. Burgess and C. A. Lutken, “Propagators and effective potentials in anti-de Sitter space”, *Phys. Lett. B* **153**, 137 (1985).
- [9] V. Cardoso, R. Konoplya, and J. P. S. Lemos, “Quasinormal frequencies of Schwarzschild black holes in anti-de Sitter spacetimes: A complete study on the asymptotic behavior”, *Phys. Rev. D* **68**, 044024 (2003); arXiv:gr-qc/0305037.
- [10] R. A. Konoplya, “Massive vector field perturbations in the Schwarzschild background: stability and quasinormal spectrum”, *Phys. Rev. D* **73**, 024009 (2006); arXiv:gr-qc/0509026.
- [11] E. M. Ovsyuk and V. M. Red'kov, “Spherical waves of spin 1 particle in anti de Sitter space-time”, *Acta Phys. Pol. B* **41** 6, 1247 (2011); arXiv:1109.0387 [math-ph].
- [12] R. Ruffini, J. Tiomno, and C. V. Vishveshwara, “Electromagnetic field of a particle moving in a spherically symmetric black hole background”, *Lettere al Nuovo Cimento* **3**, 211 (1972).
- [13] J. G. Rosa and S. R. Dolan, “Massive vector fields on the Schwarzschild spacetime: Quasinormal modes and bound states”, *Phys. Rev. D* **85**, 044043 (2012); arXiv:1110.4494 [hep-th].
- [14] T. V. Fernandes, D. Hilditch, J. P. S. Lemos, and V. Cardoso “Quasinormal modes of Proca fields in Schwarzschild-AdS spacetime”, *Phys. Rev. D* **104**, 010101 (2021); arXiv:2111.0000 [gr-qc].
- [15] J. J. Sakurai and J. Napolitano, *Modern Quantum Mechanics*, 2nd edition (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2017).
- [16] M. Abramowitz and I. A. Stegun, *Handbook of Mathematical Functions: with Formulas, Graphs, and Mathematical Tables* (Dover, New York, 1964).