

Comment on WKB Series Of All Orders

C. V. Sukumar
Wadham College,
University of Oxford, Oxford OX1 3PN, U.K.

February 8, 2023

Abstract

The Dunham expansion for the one-dimensional two-turning-point eigenvalue problem for all orders in the WKB approximation is examined. An explicit form for all the odd order terms in the expansion which are total derivatives is given.

1 Introduction

The following discussion closely follows the work of Bender *et al* [1]. We consider the two-turning-point eigenvalue problem for the one-dimensional Schrödinger equation

$$\left[-\frac{d^2}{dx^2} + V(x) - E \right] \psi(x) = 0, \quad \psi(\pm\infty) = 0 \quad (1)$$

To construct the WKB approximation for all orders we introduce a small parameter ϵ and consider the eigenvalue problem

$$\epsilon^2 \frac{d^2}{dx^2} \psi(x) = Q(x) \psi(x), \quad Q(x) = V(x) - E \quad (2)$$

The parameter ϵ helps to organize the WKB series and we can set $\epsilon = 1$ at the end of the calculation. The WKB approximation to the wave function is

$$\psi(x) = \exp \left[\frac{1}{\epsilon} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \epsilon^n S_n(x) \right] \quad (3)$$

Substitution of this expression for ψ in to the differential equation and comparison of like powers of ϵ gives

$$[S'_0(x)]^2 = Q(x) \longrightarrow S'_0(x) = -\sqrt{Q(x)} \quad (4)$$

$$2S'_0 S'_n + \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} S'_j S'_{n-j} + S''_{n-1} = 0, \quad n \geq 1 \quad (5)$$

where the prime symbol refers to derivatives with respect to x . The recursion relation in (5) may be used to find S'_n from S'_j for $j < n$. The exact quantization formula for the eigenvalues valid for all orders of the WKB approximation, obtained by setting $\epsilon = 1$, has been shown to be

$$\frac{1}{2i} \oint_c \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} S'_n(z) dz = K\pi, \quad K = 0, 1, 2, \dots \quad (6)$$

where the integral is a complex contour integral which encircles the two turning points on the real axis. This beautiful formula was first written in this form by J.L.Dunham [2].

By direct calculation it may be shown that the first three terms of the S'_n are given by

$$S'_1 = -\frac{Q'}{4Q} = -\frac{1}{4} \frac{d}{dx} [\log Q] \quad (7)$$

$$S'_2 = \frac{5[Q']^2}{32[Q]^{\frac{5}{2}}} - \frac{Q''}{8[Q]^{\frac{3}{2}}} \quad (8)$$

$$S'_3 = \frac{-15[Q']^3}{64Q^4} + \frac{9Q'Q''}{32Q^3} - \frac{Q'''}{16Q^2} = \frac{d}{dx} \left[\frac{5[Q']^2}{64Q^3} - \frac{Q''}{16Q^2} \right] = -\frac{1}{2} \frac{d}{dx} \left[\frac{S'_2}{S'_0} \right] \quad (9)$$

The lowest order WKB approximation arises from the use of the $n = 0$ and $n = 1$ terms given in (4) and (7) in (6). The contribution of the $n = 0$ term to the integral in (6) may be found by the choosing a single-valued $Q(z)$ by the joining of the turning points x_1 and x_2 by a branch cut which gives

$$\frac{1}{2i} \oint -\sqrt{[V(z) - E]} dz = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} \sqrt{[E - V(x)]} dx \quad (10)$$

The contribution of the $n = 1$ term to the integral in (6) is

$$\frac{1}{2i} \oint -\frac{Q'(z)}{Q(z)} dz = -\frac{1}{8i} [\ln Q(z)]|_z^z \implies -\frac{1}{8i} 4\pi i = -\frac{\pi}{2} \quad (11)$$

Evaluating $\ln Q(z)$ once around the contour gives $4i\pi$ because the contour encloses two simple zeros of $Q(z)$ at x_1 and x_2 . Thus the first two terms in the expression given in (6) leads to the approximate WKB quantization rule

$$\int_{x_1}^{x_2} \sqrt{[E - V(x)]} = \left(K + \frac{1}{2} \right) \pi, \quad K = 0, 1, 2, \dots \quad (12)$$

an approximation that increases in accuracy as K increases to high values. The exact quantization formula given in (6) is a generalization of the well known WKB quantization formula.

It has been suggested (Bender *et al*) that only the even terms in the series expansion in the Dunham formula need to be considered since S'_{2n+1} , $n \geq 1$, is a total derivative of a function and hence gives a vanishing contribution to the contour integral. To understand this we note that the quantization condition (6) is a constraint on the phase of $\psi(x)$ in (3). S'_{2n+1} , $n \geq 1$, is always real because it contains no fractional powers of $(V - E)$ and therefore cannot contribute to the phase of $\psi(x)$. It is S'_{2n} which becomes imaginary as x crosses into a classically allowed region and causes the wave function to become oscillatory. It is then no surprise that S'_{2n+1} , $n \geq 1$, drops out of the quantization condition. Even though this reasoning by Bender *et al* is valid no direct construction showing that S'_{2n+1} is a total derivative has been given. It is my purpose to exhibit the explicit structure of S_{2n+1} .

2 Odd members of the WKB series as exact derivatives

In terms of the functions defined by $T_n \equiv S'_n$ the recursion relation arising from the WKB series may be written in the form

$$T_0 = -\sqrt{Q}, \quad T_1 = -\frac{T'_0}{2T_0}, \quad T_2 = -\frac{T'_1 + T_1^2}{2T_0} \quad (13)$$

$$T_n = -\frac{1}{2T_0} \left[T'_{n-1} + \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} T_m T_{n-m} \right], \quad n \geq 3 \quad (14)$$

Using the expression for T_1 this recursion relation may be brought to the form

$$T_n = -\frac{1}{2} \left[\frac{d}{dx} \frac{T_{n-1}}{T_0} + \frac{1}{T_0} \sum_{m=2}^{n-2} T_m T_{n-m} \right] \quad n \geq 3 \quad (15)$$

Now the even and odd members of the series can be scaled differently using

$$F_j \equiv 2T_{2j+1}, \quad G_j \equiv -\frac{T_{2j}}{T_0} \quad (16)$$

so that the recursion relation for the odd members of the WKB series becomes

$$F_n = G'_n + \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m F_{n-m} \quad (17)$$

Our aim is to prove that F_n are exact differentials for all values of n .

The first few expressions given by

$$F_1 = G'_1 \quad (18)$$

$$F_2 = G'_2 + G_1 F_1 = G'_2 + G_1 G'_1 = \frac{d}{dx} \left[G_2 + \frac{1}{2} G_1^2 \right] \quad (19)$$

$$F_3 = G'_3 + G_1 F_2 + G_2 F_1 = G'_3 + G_1 G'_2 + G_2 G'_1 + G_1^2 G'_1 \quad (20)$$

$$= \frac{d}{dx} \left[G_3 + G_1 G_2 + \frac{1}{3} G_1^3 \right] \quad (21)$$

$$F_4 = G'_4 + G_1 F_3 + G_2 F_2 + G_3 F_1 \\ = G'_4 + G_1 G'_3 + G_2 G'_2 + G_3 G'_1 + G_1^2 G'_2 + G_1 G_2 G'_1 + G_2 G_1 G'_1 + G_1^3 G'_1 \quad (22)$$

$$= \frac{d}{dx} \left[G_4 + G_1 G_3 + \frac{1}{2} G_2^2 + G_1^2 G_2 + \frac{1}{4} G_1^4 \right] \quad (23)$$

suggest a general structure. This structure may be extracted by iteration of (17). The first few

iterations

$$\begin{aligned}
F_n &= G'_n + \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m \left[G'_{n-m} + \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_j F_{n-m-j} \right] \\
&= G'_n + \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m G'_{n-m} + \sum_{m=1}^{n-2} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_m G_j \left[G'_{n-m-j} + \sum_{k=1}^{n-m-j-1} G_k F_{n-m-j-k} \right] \\
&= G'_n + \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m G'_{n-m} + \sum_{m=1}^{n-2} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_m G_j G'_{n-m-j} \\
&\quad + \sum_{m=1}^{n-3} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} \sum_{k=1}^{n-m-j-1} G_m G_j G_k F_{n-m-j-k}
\end{aligned} \tag{24}$$

show that the solution for F_n may be given in the form

$$\begin{aligned}
F_n &= G'_n + \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m G'_{n-m} + \sum_{m=1}^{n-2} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_m G_j G'_{n-m-j} \\
&\quad + \sum_{m=1}^{n-3} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} \sum_{k=1}^{n-j-m-1} G_m G_j G_k G'_{n-m-j-k} + \dots + G_1^{n-1} G'_1
\end{aligned} \tag{25}$$

It can be shown that this expression for F_n is an exact differential. This can be accomplished by noting that each of the terms in the groupings of term in the expression for F_n is an exact differential because of the indexes in the summations. For example

$$\sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G'_m G_{n-m} = \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m G'_{n-m} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{d}{dx} \left[\sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m G_{n-m} \right] \tag{26}$$

$$\sum_{m=1}^{n-2} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_m G_j G'_{n-j-m} = \frac{1}{3} \frac{d}{dx} \left[\sum_{m=1}^{n-2} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_m G_j G_{n-j-m} \right] \tag{27}$$

Hence

$$\begin{aligned}
F_n &= \frac{d}{dx} \left[G_n + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} G_m G_{n-m} + \frac{1}{3} \sum_{m=1}^{n-2} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} G_m G_j G_{n-m-j} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{1}{4} \sum_{m=1}^{n-3} \sum_{j=1}^{n-m-1} \sum_{k=1}^{n-j-m-1} G_m G_j G_k G_{n-m-j-k} + \dots + \frac{1}{n} G_1^n \right]
\end{aligned} \tag{28}$$

which explicitly demonstrates the exact differential character of F_n .

References

- [1] Bender C.M, Olaussen K., Wang P.S, Phys. Rev. **D 16** (1977) 1710.
- [2] Dunham J.L., Phys. Rev. **41** (1932) 713.