

Classification of finite groups with small proportion of vanishing elements *

Dongfang Yang[†], Yu Zeng[‡] and Silvio Dolfi[§]

Abstract

We have proved that if the function $P_v(G)$, measuring the proportion of the elements of a finite group G that are zeros of irreducible characters of G , is less than $P_v(A_7)$, then $P_v(G) \in \{\frac{m-1}{m} \mid m = 1, 2, \dots, 6\}$. In this paper, we give a classification of finite groups G such that $P_v(G) = \frac{m-1}{m}$ for $m = 1, 2, \dots, 6$.

Keywords Character theory, zeros of irreducible characters.

2020 MR Subject Classification 20C15.

***Acknowledgement:** The first and second author gratefully acknowledge the support of China Scholarship Council (CSC).

[†]Department of Mathematics, Changshu Institute of Technology, Changshu, China. email: dfyang1228@163.com

[‡]Department of Mathematics, Changshu Institute of Technology, Changshu, China. email: yuzeng2004@163.com

[§]Dipartimento di Matematica e Informatica, Università di Firenze, Italy. email: silvio.dolfi@unifi.it

1 Introduction

We say that an element g of a finite group G is a *vanishing* element of G if there exists an irreducible character $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ such that $\chi(g) = 0$, and we denote by $V(G)$ the set of the vanishing elements of G .

A natural way to measure the relative abundance (or scarcity) of vanishing elements in a finite group G is to consider the proportion

$$P_v(G) = \frac{|V(G)|}{|G|}$$

which can be seen as the probability that a randomly chosen element of G turns out to be a vanishing element. In this setting, one can ask what are the possible values of the function $P_v(G)$, where G varies in some relevant class of finite groups, and also what implications on the structure of the group G can be deduced from specific values of $P_v(G)$. For example, as a consequence of a classical result by W. Burnside, G is abelian if and only if $P_v(G) = 0$.

Recently, A. Moretò and P.H. Tiep have proved in [12], confirming a conjecture proposed in [2], that if G is a finite group such that $P_v(G) < P_v(A_7) = \mathfrak{a} = \frac{1067}{1260} \simeq 0.846$, then G is solvable.

In [13], L. Morotti and H. Tong-Viet show that a finite group G is abelian if and only if $P_v(G) < \frac{1}{2}$, and that $P_v(G) = \frac{1}{2}$ if and only if $G/\mathbf{Z}(G)$ is a Frobenius group with Frobenius complement of order 2. They also proved ([13, Theorem 1.6]) that if $P_v(G) \leq \frac{2}{3}$, then $P_v(G) \in \{0, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{2}{3}\}$ and observed that computer calculation seems to suggest that the only values of $P_v(G)$ in the interval $[0, \mathfrak{a})$ are of the form $\frac{m-1}{m}$ for some integer $1 \leq m \leq 6$ (and these values are actually taken: see Theorem A). In [15], we confirm this conjecture. In this paper, we classify finite groups G such that $P_v(G) \in [0, \mathfrak{a})$.

Theorem A. *Let G be a finite group, $Q \in \text{Syl}_2(G)$ and $P \in \text{Syl}_3(G)$. Then $P_v(G) < P_v(A_7) = \mathfrak{a}$ if and only if either*

- (a) G is an A -group such that $[G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = m \leq 6$. In addition, if $m = 5$, then $|\pi(\mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G)) \cap \{2, 3\}| \leq 1$; or
- (b) Q is nonabelian; G has an abelian normal subgroup A such that $|G/A| = m \leq 6$ where m is a composite number; and one of the following holds:
 - (b1) $m = 4$ and $\mathbf{O}_2(A) = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$;
 - (b2) $m = 6$, $G/A \cong S_3$ where $A = \mathbf{F}(G)$; $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$; $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] = C \times C^x$, where $x \in P - \mathbf{O}_3(A)$, such that $1 < C = \mathbf{C}_{[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P]}(Q) \lesssim C_4 \times (C_2)^k$;
 - (b3) $m = 6$, $G/A \cong C_6$; $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$; $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] = C$ where $[C, Q, Q] = 1$;
 - (b4) $m = 6$, $G/A \cong C_6$; $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$; $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] = B \times C$ where C is normal in G such that $\exp([C, Q]) \leq 2$ and $[C, Q, Q] = 1$ and B is a direct product of k (> 0) copies

of cyclic G/A -module, say $B_0 = \langle b_0 \rangle^G$ where $b_0 \in B$, such that $\exp(B) > \exp(C)$; for $c \in C$, $\text{rank}(B_0) \geq \text{rank}(\langle c \rangle^G)$, and one of the following is true:

(b4.1) For a suitable generator x of P and for all $y \in Q - A$, $B_0 = \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_8)^2$ such that $b_0 b_0^y = b_0^{4x}$; $\text{rank}(\langle c \rangle^G) = 2$ and $c^y = c^{-1}$ for $c \in C$;

(b4.2) For a suitable generator x of P and for all $y \in Q - A$, $B_0 = ED$ where $E = \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_{2^n})^2$ ($n \geq 3$) and $D = [E, y] \cong (C_4)^2$ such that $b_0^{2^{n-1}} = [b_0^2, y]^x$.

The paper is organized as follows: in Section 2 and Section 3 we collect useful results and at the end of Section 4 we prove Theorem A.

Our notation is standard and for character theory it follows [8]. All groups considered in the paper will be assumed, if not otherwise mentioned, to be finite groups.

2 Preliminaries

Let G be a finite group. We write $V(G) = \{g \in G \mid \chi(g) = 0 \text{ for some } \chi \in \text{Irr}(G)\}$ and we denote by $N(G) = G - V(G)$ its complement in G .

A basic observation: given a normal subgroup N of a group G and $g \in G$, if $gN \in V(G/N)$ then $gN \subseteq V(G)$. This implies that $P_v(G/N) \leq P_v(G)$, a fact that will be used freely in the rest of the paper.

We will use the following notation: for a positive integer m , $U_m = \langle \zeta_m \rangle = \{\varepsilon \in \mathbb{C} \mid \varepsilon^m = 1\}$ is the group of complex m -th roots of unity, and $\zeta_m = e^{\frac{2\pi}{m}\sqrt{-1}}$ is a primitive m -th root of unity.

Lemma 2.1 ([10]). *Let m, n be a positive integers, $\alpha_1, \alpha_2, \dots, \alpha_n \in U_m$ and p_1, p_2, \dots, p_r the distinct prime divisors of m . Then $\alpha_1 + \dots + \alpha_n = 0$ only if $n = n_1 p_1 + \dots + n_r p_r$ for suitable integers $n_i \in \mathbb{N}$.*

Lemma 2.2 ([15]). *Let n be a positive integer and let $\varepsilon_i, \eta_i \in U_{2^n}$, for $1 \leq i \leq 3$, be roots of unity such that $(*)$: $\varepsilon_1 \varepsilon_2 \varepsilon_3 = 1$ and $\eta_1 \eta_2 \eta_3 = 1$.*

Then, writing $\Sigma = \varepsilon_1 + \varepsilon_2 + \varepsilon_3 + \eta_1 + \eta_2 + \eta_3$ and $\Delta = \{\delta_i = \overline{\varepsilon_i} \eta_i \mid 1 \leq i \leq 3\}$.

- (1) *If $\Delta \subseteq U_2$, then $\Sigma \neq 0$.*
- (2) *Assume $n \leq 2$ and fix the notation so that $o(\varepsilon_3) \leq o(\varepsilon_2) \leq o(\varepsilon_1)$ and $o(\eta_3) \leq o(\eta_2) \leq o(\eta_1) \leq o(\varepsilon_1)$. Then $\Sigma = 0$ if and only if $\{\varepsilon_1, \varepsilon_2\} = \{\zeta_4, -\zeta_4\}$ and $\eta_1 = \eta_2 = -1$. In particular, if $n \leq 2$ and $\eta_i = \overline{\varepsilon_i}$ for $i = 1, 2$, then $\Sigma \neq 0$.*
- (3) *Assume $\Delta \subseteq U_4$ and $o(\varepsilon_i) \geq 8$ for some $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$. If $\Sigma = 0$, then either $\Delta = \{\zeta_4, -1\}$ or $\Delta = \{-\zeta_4, -1\}$.*

We now collect some useful results about vanishing elements and nonvanishing elements.

Lemma 2.3 ([15]). *Let G be a group and $z \in \mathbf{Z}(G)$. Then $x \in \mathbf{V}(G)$ if and only if $zx \in \mathbf{V}(G)$. In particular, $\mathbf{Z}(G) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$.*

Lemma 2.4 ([4, Corollary 1.3]). *Let $g \in H \leq G$ be such that $G = \mathbf{C}_G(g)H$. Then $g \in \mathbf{V}(G)$ if and only if $g \in \mathbf{V}(H)$.*

Lemma 2.5. *Let A and B be normal subgroups of the group G such that $A \cap B = 1$. Then, for $a \in A$, we have $a \in \mathbf{V}(G)$ if and only if $aB \in \mathbf{V}(G/B)$.*

Proof. We refer to the proof of [15, Lemma 2.5]. □

Lemma 2.6 ([9, Theorem A]). *If P is a p -group, p a prime number, then $\mathbf{N}(P) = \mathbf{Z}(P)$ and hence $\mathbf{P}_v(P) = \frac{m-1}{m}$, where $m = [P : \mathbf{Z}(P)]$.*

Lemma 2.7 ([1]). *Let G be a finite group and let P be a Sylow p -subgroup of G , p a prime number. Then $\mathbf{Z}(P) \cap \mathbf{O}_p(G) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$.*

For a finite group G , $\mathbf{N}(G)$ is not a subgroup in general. However, it is an abelian subgroup under the assumption that $\mathbf{P}_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$.

Theorem 2.8. *If G is a finite group such that $\mathbf{P}_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$, then G has an abelian normal subgroup $A = \mathbf{N}(G)$ such that $[G : A] \leq 6$.*

Proof. See [15, Theorem A]. □

3 Auxiliary results

Let A be an abelian group and let $\hat{A} = \text{Irr}(A)$ be the dual group of A . We mention that $A \cong \hat{\hat{A}}$ and that A and $\hat{\hat{A}}$ (double dual) can be identified in a canonical way. For $B \leq A$, let $B^\perp = \{\alpha \in \hat{A} \mid \alpha(b) = 1, \forall b \in B\} \leq \hat{A}$, and for $V \leq \hat{A}$, let $V^\perp = \{a \in A \mid \lambda(a) = 1, \forall \lambda \in V\} \leq A$. Then $B^\perp \cong \widehat{A/B}$, $\hat{B} \cong \hat{A}/B^\perp$ and $B^{\perp\perp} = B$ (see for instance [6, V.6.4]). Finally, we recall that for every $x \in \text{Aut}(A)$, x acts on \hat{A} via $\alpha^x(a) = \alpha(a^{x^{-1}})$, where $\alpha \in \hat{A}$ and $a \in A$.

Lemma 3.1 ([15]). *Let A be an abelian group, $y \in \text{Aut}(A)$ such that $o(y) = 2$, and let $Q = A \rtimes \langle y \rangle$. Then*

(1) *The map $\gamma : A \rightarrow A$, defined by $\gamma(a) = [a, y]$ for $a \in A$, is a group homomorphism with $\text{Im}(\gamma) = [A, y] = Q'$ and $\ker(\gamma) = \mathbf{C}_A(y) = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$. Moreover, $A/\mathbf{C}_A(y)$ and $[A, y]$ are isomorphic $\langle y \rangle$ -modules, on which y acts as the inversion.*

(2) $[A, y]^\perp = \mathbf{C}_{\hat{A}}(y)$ and $[\hat{A}, y]^\perp = \mathbf{C}_A(y)$.

(3) $[\hat{A}, y] \cong [A, y]$.

We now state a couple of lemmas for later use.

Lemma 3.2 ([15]). *Let A be a normal subgroup of the group G and let $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$, $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ such that $[\chi_A, \alpha] \neq 0$. Then, for $a \in A$, $\chi(a) = 0$ if and only if $\alpha^G(a) = 0$.*

In the following, we denote by $c(Q)$ the nilpotency class of a nilpotent group Q and by $\mathbf{Z}_2(Q)$ the second term of the upper central series of Q . If A is an abelian p -group, p a prime, we denote by $\exp(A)$ the exponent of A (the largest order of an element of A , in this case) and we define, for $i \geq 0$, the following characteristic subgroups of A : $\Omega_i(A) = \{a \in A \mid o(a) \text{ divides } p^i\}$.

Lemma 3.3 ([15]). *Let A be an abelian normal 2-subgroup of the group G such that $[G : A] = 6$, and let $Q \in \text{Syl}_2(G)$ and $P \in \text{Syl}_3(G)$. Then*

- (1) *There exists an element $y \in \mathbf{N}_Q(P)$ such that $y \notin A$ and $y^2 \in \mathbf{C}_A(P)$.*
- (2) *If $\mathbf{C}_A(P) = 1$ and either $\exp(Q) \leq 2$ or $c(Q) \leq 2$, then $A \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$.*

Assume further that P acts nontrivially on A and that Q is nonabelian. Then

- (3) $G - A \subseteq \mathbf{V}(G)$.
- (4) *If $\mathbf{P}_v(G) \leq \mathfrak{a}$, then $\mathbf{C}_A(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$.*

Given an abelian p -group A , we denote by $\text{rank}(A)$ its *rank* (i.e. the number of factors in a decomposition of A as a direct product of cyclic groups) and, for $a \in A$, $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ and $x \in \text{Aut}(A)$, we shortly write a^{kx} instead of $(a^k)^x$.

In the rest of the section, we will address one of the most complicated cases that we have to face in the process of proving Theorem A. To avoid repetitions, we introduce the following setting, that will be used in the following results.

Setting 3.4. *Let A be an abelian normal 2-subgroup of the group G such that $[G : A] = 6$ and assume that A has a complement H in G . Let P be the Sylow 3-subgroup of H , y an involution of H and $Q = A\langle y \rangle$ a Sylow 2-subgroup of G . Assume that Q is nonabelian and that $\mathbf{C}_A(P) = 1$.*

Remark. If a cyclic group $P = \langle x \rangle$ of order 3 acts on an abelian 2-group A and $\mathbf{C}_A(P) = 1$, then $aa^xa^{x^2} = 1$ for every $a \in A$, because $aa^xa^{x^2} \in \mathbf{C}_A(P)$, (a similar result is true for every Frobenius action: see [6, V.8.9(d)]). Considering A as a module under the action of P , if B is a nontrivial P -invariant subgroup of A and $\text{rank}(B) \leq 2$, then B is an indecomposable P -module and hence B is homocyclic of rank 2. Moreover, B is uniserial P -module whose only submodules are the subgroups $\Omega_i(B)$, $i \geq 0$, and whose composition factors are all isomorphic to $C_2 \times C_2$ (see, for instance, [5]). As a consequence, for every $1 \neq a \in A$, the P -submodule A_0 generated by a is $A_0 = \langle a, a^x \rangle = \langle a \rangle \times \langle a^x \rangle$, a fact that will be used several times in the rest of the section. Finally, we observe that A , being a direct sum of indecomposable P -modules, has even rank.

For groups G satisfying Setting 3.4, part (3) of Lemma 3.3 implies that

$$P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6} \iff P_v(G) \leq \frac{5}{6} \iff A \subseteq N(G).$$

So, to classify groups G satisfying Setting 3.4 such that $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$, we sometimes use the equivalent statements instead of $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$.

Lemma 3.5 ([15]). *Assume Setting 3.4. Let $Z = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$ and $P = \langle x \rangle$. Suppose that $A \subseteq N(G)$. Then*

- (1) *If $H \cong C_6$, then $Z \trianglelefteq G$ and $\exp(A/Z) = 2^{c-1}$, where $c = c(Q) \leq 3$.*
- (2) *If $H \cong C_6$ and B is a P -invariant subgroup of A such that $\text{rank}(B) = 2$ and $A_0 = B \times B^y$ has index at most 4 in A , then $\exp(B) = 2$.*
- (3) *If $H \cong S_3$, $A = Z \times Z^x$ and $\text{rank}(A) \leq 4$, then $\exp(A) \leq 4$ and Z is not isomorphic to $(C_4)^2$.*

3.1 S_3 case

Assuming the Setting 3.4 and that $H \cong S_3$, we classify group G such that $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$ in the subsection.

Proposition 3.6. *Assume Setting 3.4 and that H is isomorphic to S_3 . Let $P = \langle x \rangle$. Then $A \subseteq N(G)$ if and only if $A = \mathbf{C}_A(y) \times \mathbf{C}_A(y)^x$ such that $1 < \mathbf{C}_A(y) \lesssim C_4 \times (C_2)^k$ for some positive integer k .*

Proof. Write $Z = \mathbf{C}_A(y)$. Then $Z = \mathbf{Z}(Q) > 1$ by the definition of Q . As $H = \langle y, y^x \rangle$, we have

$$Z \cap Z^x = \mathbf{C}_A(y) \cap \mathbf{C}_A(y)^x = \mathbf{C}_A(\langle y, y^x \rangle) = \mathbf{C}_A(H) \leq \mathbf{C}_A(P) = 1.$$

An application of part (1) of Lemma 3.1 to the action of y on \hat{A} yields $\mu^y = \mu^{-1}$ and $\mu^{xy} = \mu^{-x^2} \neq \mu^{-x}$ for every $\mu \in [\hat{A}, y] - \{1_A\}$, so $[\hat{A}, y] \cap [\hat{A}, y]^x = 1_A$. Since by Lemma 3.1 $[\hat{A}, y]^\perp = Z$, it follows that

$$A = (1_A)^\perp = ([\hat{A}, y] \cap [\hat{A}, y]^x)^\perp = ZZ^x = Z \times Z^x.$$

Write $Z = C \times D$ where $C = \langle c \rangle$ such that $\exp(Z) = o(c)$. Then $A = V \times W$ where $V = C \times C^x$ and $W = D \times D^x$. As $z^{xy} = z^{yx^2} = z^{x^2} = (zz^x)^{-1}$ for $z \in Z$, we have $V \trianglelefteq G$ and $W \trianglelefteq G$.

Suppose that $A \subseteq N(G)$. Take $d \in D$, and write $Z_0 = \langle c \rangle \times \langle d \rangle$. Since $o(c) = \exp(Z)$, it suffices to show that $Z_0 \lesssim C_4 \times C_2$. Let $A_0 = Z_0 \times Z_0^x$, $Q_0 = A_0 \rtimes \langle y \rangle$ and $G_0 = A_0 \rtimes H$. For every $a_0 \in A_0$, $G = \mathbf{C}_G(a_0)G_0$. So, by Lemma 2.4, $A_0 \subseteq N(G)$ if and only if $A_0 \subseteq N(G_0)$. As $A_0 \leq A \subseteq N(G)$, $A_0 \subseteq N(G_0)$. Note that $(c^x)^y = c^{yx^2} = c^{x^2}$ and that $\mathbf{C}_A(P) = 1$, and hence Q_0

is nonabelian. So, G_0 satisfies Setting 3.4. Now, an application of part (3) of Lemma 3.5 to G_0 yields that $Z_0 \lesssim C_4 \times C_2$.

Suppose that $Z \lesssim C_4 \times (C_2)^k$. We claim that $A \subseteq N(G)$. Recall that $A = V \times W$ where $V = \langle c \rangle \times \langle c^x \rangle$ with $o(c) = \exp(Z)$. So, $o(c) \leq 4$ and $\exp(W) \leq 2$. If $o(c) \leq 2$, then $\exp(A) \leq 2$, and hence part (2) of Lemma 3.3 yields $A \subseteq N(G)$. So, we may assume that $o(c) = 4$. Let $a \in A$ and $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$, and write $a = c^k c^{lx} w$, where $w \in W$, $k, l \in \mathbb{Z}$. By Lemma 3.2, it suffices to prove $\alpha^G(a) \neq 0$. Assume the contrary, i.e.

$$\alpha^G(a) = \sum_{h \in H} \alpha(a^h) = \sum_{0 \leq i \leq 2} \alpha^{x^i}(a)(1 + \alpha^{x^i}([a, y])) = 0. \quad (3.1)$$

Observe that α is a linear character of A and that $\exp(A) \leq 4$, and hence values of a conjugate of α lie in \mathbb{U}_4 . Now, an application of part (1) of Lemma 2.2 to (3.1) yields that

$$\max\{o(\alpha(a^h)) \mid h \in H\} = \max\{o(\alpha(a^{x^i}([a, y]))) \mid 0 \leq i \leq 2\} = 4.$$

As $o(\alpha^{x^i}([a, y]))$ divides $o([a, y])$, $o([a, y]) = 4$. Up to substituting α with a suitable conjugate α^h for some $h \in H$, we may assume that $o(\alpha(a)) = o(\alpha(a^x)) = \max\{o(\alpha^h(a)) \mid h \in H\} = 4$, i.e. $\alpha(a^2) = \alpha(a^{2x}) = -1$. Also, since $\alpha(a) + \alpha(a^x) + \alpha(a^{x^2}) + \alpha(a^y) + \alpha(a^{yx}) + \alpha(a^{yx^2}) = 0$ where $\alpha(a)\alpha(a^x)\alpha(a^{x^2}) = \alpha(aa^x a^{x^2}) = 1$ and $\alpha(a^y)\alpha(a^{yx})\alpha(a^{yx^2}) = \alpha(a^y a^{yx} a^{yx^2}) = 1$, part (2) of Lemma 2.2 implies that $\alpha(a^{2y}) = \alpha(a^{2yx}) = \alpha(a^{2yx^2}) = 1$. Recall that $a = c^k c^{lx} w$, and hence, as $[a, y] = [c^k c^{lx} w, y] = [c^{lx}, y][w, y] = c^{-lx} c^{lx^2} [w, y]$ and $o([w, y]) \leq 2$ (as $[w, y] \in W$), we deduce that l is odd. As $\alpha(a^2) = \alpha(a^{2x}) = -1$ and $a = c^k c^{lx} w$ with $o(w) \leq 2$ and $o(c) = o(c^l) = 4$,

$$\alpha(c^{2k} c^{2x}) = \alpha(a^2) = \alpha(c^{2kx} c^{2x^2}) = \alpha(a^{2x}) = -1.$$

Also, as $\alpha(a^{2y}) = \alpha(a^{2yx}) = \alpha(a^{2yx^2}) = 1$, $c^y = c$ and $xy = yx^2$,

$$\alpha(c^{2k} c^{2x^2}) = \alpha(a^{2y}) = \alpha(c^2 c^{2kx}) = \alpha(a^{2yx}) = \alpha(c^{2x} c^{2kx^2}) = \alpha(a^{2yx^2}) = 1.$$

Notice that $o(c) = 4$. If k is even, then we conclude a contradiction that $-1 = \alpha(c^{2x^2}) = 1$. If k is odd, then $-1 = \alpha(c^{2k} c^{2x}) = \alpha(c^2 c^{2x}) = \alpha(c^2 c^{2kx}) = 1$, a contradiction. Thus, $\alpha^G(a) \neq 0$, as desired. \square

3.2 C_6 case

Setting 3.7. Assume the Setting 3.4. Assume also that H is isomorphic to C_6 and that $c(Q) > 2$.

Assume Setting 3.7, we classify groups G such that $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$ in this subsection.

Firstly, we classify groups G satisfying Setting 3.7 such that $A (\subseteq N(G))$ is a cyclic H -module.

To accomplish that, we need the next two lemmas.

Lemma 3.8. *Assume Setting 3.7. Suppose that $\text{rank}(A) = 2$, $\text{exp}(A) = 8$. Then $A \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ if and only if for a suitable generator x of P , $aa^y = a^{4x}$ for all $a \in A$.*

Proof. We observe that $Q \trianglelefteq G$ and then both Q' and $Z = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$ are P -submodules of the uniserial P -module $A \cong C_8 \times C_8$. Since $c(Q) > 2$, Q' is not contained in Z and hence $Z = \Omega_1(A)$ and $Q' = A^2$. Since $c(A^2\langle y \rangle) = 2$, part (2) of Lemma 3.3 applied to the subgroup A^2H yields $A^2 \subseteq \mathbf{N}(A^2H)$ and hence $A^2 \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ by Lemma 2.4. Let $a_0 \in A$ be such that $o(a_0) = 8$; by the Frobenius action of $P = \langle x \rangle$ on A , we have $A = \langle a_0 \rangle \times \langle a_0^x \rangle$. Note that $a_0 a_0^y \in \mathbf{C}_A(y) = Z = \{1, a_0^4, a_0^{4x}, a_0^{4x^2}\}$.

Assume that $A \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$. We claim that $a_0 a_0^y \in \{a_0^{4x}, a_0^{4x^2}\}$. Otherwise, $a_0 a_0^y \in \{1, a_0^4\}$, so $a_0^y = a_0^k$ with $k \in \{-1, 3\}$. Let $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$ be such that $\alpha(a_0) = \zeta_8$ and $\alpha(a_0^x) = \zeta_8^5$; so, $\alpha(a_0^{x^2}) = (\alpha(a_0)\alpha(a_0^x))^{-1} = \zeta_8^2$. Hence,

$$\alpha^G(a_0) = \sum_{0 \leq i \leq 2} (\alpha^{x^i}(a_0) + \alpha^{x^i y}(a_0)) = \sum_{0 \leq i \leq 2} (\alpha^{x^i}(a_0) + \alpha^{x^i}(a_0^k)) = \sum_{j \in \{1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7\}} \zeta_8^j = 0,$$

so $a_0 \in \mathbf{V}(G)$ by Lemma 3.2, a contradiction. Hence, for a suitable generator x of P , $a_0 a_0^y = a_0^{4x}$. For every $a \in A$, $a = a_0^i a_0^{jx}$ for some integers i and j . As $xy = yx$,

$$aa^y = a_0^i a_0^{jx} (a_0^i a_0^{jx})^y = (a_0 a_0^y)^i (a_0 a_0^y)^{jx} = a_0^{4ix} a_0^{4jx^2} = a^{4x}.$$

Assume that for a suitable generator x of P , $aa^y = a^{4x}$ for every $a \in G$. In particular, $aa^y = a^{4x}$ for every $a \in A - A^2$. Let $a \in A - A^2$. As $A^2 \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$, it suffices to show that $a \in \mathbf{N}(G)$. Arguing by contradiction, by Lemma 3.2 there exists a character $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$ such that $\alpha^G(a) = 0$. Let $K = \ker(\alpha)$ and observe that $Z \not\leq K$: otherwise, writing $\overline{G} = G/Z$, $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(\overline{A})$ and $\alpha^{\overline{G}}(\overline{a}) = 0$, so $\overline{a} \in \mathbf{V}(\overline{G}) \cap \overline{A}$, against part (2) of Lemma 3.3 since $c(\overline{Q}) = 2$. Hence, as $a^4 a^{4x} a^{4x^2} = 1$ and $\{\alpha(a^{4x^i}) \mid 0 \leq i \leq 2\} = \{1, -1\}$, up to possibly exchanging α with one conjugate character α^{x^i} (observing that $\alpha^G = (\alpha^{x^i})^G$ for every i), we can assume $\alpha(a^{4x}) = 1$ and $\alpha(a^4) = \alpha(a^{4x^2}) = -1$. Recalling that $a^y = a^{4x} a^{-1}$, we have that $\alpha^{x^i}(a^y) = \alpha^{x^i}(a^{4x}) \overline{\alpha^{x^i}(a)} = \alpha(a^{4x^{1-i}}) \overline{\alpha^{x^i}(a)}$ for $0 \leq i \leq 2$ and then

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha^G(a) &= \alpha(a) + \alpha^x(a) + \alpha^{x^2}(a) + \alpha(a^y) + \alpha^x(a^y) + \alpha^{x^2}(a^y) \\ &= \alpha(a) + \alpha^x(a) + \alpha^{x^2}(a) + \overline{\alpha(a)} - \overline{\alpha^x(a)} - \overline{\alpha^{x^2}(a)} \end{aligned}$$

Hence, the assumption $\alpha^G(a) = 0$ gives

$$\alpha(a) + \overline{\alpha(a)} = \overline{\alpha^x(a)} - \alpha^x(a) + \overline{\alpha^{x^2}(a)} - \alpha^{x^2}(a).$$

Observing that the first member of the above equality is real, while the second member is purely imaginary, we deduce that $\overline{\alpha(a)} = -\alpha(a)$ and we get $\alpha(a)^4 = \alpha(a^4) = 1$, against the assumption $\alpha(a^4) = -1$. Hence, $a \in \mathbf{N}(G)$. \square

Lemma 3.9. *Assume Setting 3.7. Let $A = CD$, where C is a P -invariant subgroup of rank 2, $D = [C, y]$ and $C \cap D = D^2 = \Omega_1(D)$. If $n = \exp(A) \geq 8$, then $A \subseteq N(G)$ if and only if for a suitable generator x of P , $a^{\frac{n}{2}} = [a^2, y]^x$ for every $a \in A$.*

Proof. See [15, Lemma 3.9]. □

Corollary 3.10. *Assume Setting 3.7. If $A = \langle a_0 \rangle^G$, then $A \subseteq N(G)$ if and only if one of the following holds.*

- (1) *For a suitable generator x of P , $A = \langle a_0, a_0^x \rangle \cong (C_8)^2$ such that $aa^y = a^{4x}$ for all $a \in A$;*
- (2) *For a suitable generator x of P , $A = CD$ where $C = \langle a_0, a_0^x \rangle \cong (C_{2^n})^2$ ($n \geq 3$), $D = [C, y] \cong (C_4)^2$ such that $a^{2^{n-1}} = [a^2, y]^x$ for every $a \in A$.*

In particular, if $A \subseteq N(G)$, then $c(Q) = 3$ and $[A, y, y]$ is the minimal G -invariant subgroup in A .

Proof. Assume that either (1) or (2) holds. Then $A \subseteq N(G)$ follows directly by Lemmas 3.8 and 3.9.

Assume that $A \subseteq N(G)$. Since $c(Q) > 2$, it follows by part (1) of Lemma 3.5 that $c(Q) = 3$. Also, by Remark below Setting 3.4 $\text{rank}(A) = 2$ or 4 .

Suppose that $c(Q) = 3$ and $\text{rank}(A) = 2$. By Lemma 3.8, it suffices to show that $\exp(A) = 8$. Recall that by part (1) of Lemma 3.5, $A/\mathbf{Z}(Q) \cong Q' \cong (C_4)^2$. Since A is an uniserial H -module, $\mathbf{Z}(Q) \leq Q'$ and $\exp(A) = 8$. In particular, $[A, y, y] = \Omega_1(A)$ is the minimal G -invariant subgroup in A .

Suppose that $c(Q) = 3$ and $\text{rank}(A) = 4$. Let $C = \langle a_0, a_0^x \rangle$ and $D = [C, y]$. Then $A = CC^y = CD$. As $C \cap C^y \trianglelefteq G$, we set $\overline{G} = G/(C \cap C^y)$. Observe that $A \subseteq N(G)$, and hence $\overline{A} \subseteq N(\overline{G})$. Applying part (2) of Lemma 3.5 to

$$\overline{A} = \overline{C} \times \overline{C}^y$$

we have that $\overline{C} \cong (C_2)^2$. Observe that by Lemma 3.1 and part (1) of Lemma 3.5 $D = [A, y] \cong A/\mathbf{Z}(Q) \cong (C_4)^2$, and so $C \cap D = D^2 = \Omega_1(D)$. Clearly, $n \geq 2$ as $o(a_0) = 2^n \geq o([a_0, y]) = 4$. Assume that $n = 2$. Then $|\mathbf{Z}(Q)| = 2^2$. As $\Omega_1(D) \leq \mathbf{Z}(Q)$, $\exp(A/\mathbf{Z}(Q)) = 2$, a contradiction. So $n \geq 8$. An application of Lemma 3.9 to A yields that for a suitable generator x of P , $a^{2^{n-1}} = [a^2, y]^x$ for all $a \in A$. In particular, $[A, y, y] = D^2 = \Omega_1(C)$ is a minimal G -invariant subgroup in A . Next, we show that $\Omega_1(C)$ is the unique minimal G -invariant subgroup in A . Since minimal G -invariant subgroup in A is central in Q and is contained in $\Omega_1(A) \cong (C_2)^4$, it suffices to show that $\Omega_1(C)$ has a complement in $\Omega_1(A)$ which is not central in Q . Write $w = [a_0, y]^x$ and $e = a_0^{2^{n-2}}w$, let $E = \langle e, e^x \rangle$. So, $o(e) = 2$. Since $e = a_0^{2^{n-2}}w$ and $o(a_0) = 2^n$, $[a_0, y]^x = w = a_0^{3 \cdot 2^{n-2}}e$. Thus

$$[e, y] = [a_0^{2^{n-2}}w, y] = w^{2^{n-2}x^{-1}}[w, y] = w^{2^{n-2}x^{-1}}w^2 \neq 1,$$

where the third equality holds since y inverting $[w, y]$ and the fourth equality holds as $2^n = o(a_0) \geq 8$. Similarly, $[e^x, y] \neq 1$ and $[e^{x^2}, y] \neq 1$. So, E is not central in Q such that $\Omega_1(C) \cap E = 1$ and $\Omega_1(A) = \Omega_1(C) \times E$, as desired. \square

One has to notice that, in part (2) of Corollary 3.10, n can be any integer larger than 2.

Secondly, we start with classifying groups G satisfying Setting 3.7 such that $A (\subseteq N(G))$ is an indecomposable H -module.

Lemma 3.11. *Assume Setting 3.7. Suppose that there exists $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$ such that $\ker(\alpha^G) = 1$. If $A \subseteq N(G)$, then $A = \langle a \rangle^G$ for some $a \in A$.*

Proof. Write $K = \ker(\alpha)$. Then $K^\perp \cong \widehat{A/K} \cong A/K$ is a cyclic group of order $o(\alpha)$ and, as $\alpha \in K^\perp$, we see that $K^\perp = \langle \alpha \rangle$. It follows that, for $h \in H$, $(K^\perp)^h = (K^h)^\perp = \langle \alpha^h \rangle$.

Let $P = \langle x \rangle$. As $\mathbf{C}_A(x) = 1$, by Brauer's permutation lemma $\mathbf{C}_{\hat{A}}(x) = 1_A$ and hence $\lambda \lambda^x \lambda^{x^2} = 1_A$ for all $\lambda \in \hat{A}$. So, $K^{x^2} \geq K \cap K^x$ and then

$$K \cap K^x \cap K^y \cap K^{xy} = K_G = \ker(\alpha^G) = 1.$$

Set $B = K \cap K^x$; so, B is P -invariant and $B \cap B^y = 1$. By [6, V.6.4] we have that $B^\perp = K^\perp (K^x)^\perp = \langle \alpha, \alpha^x \rangle$ has rank at most 2, so $B^\perp = \langle \alpha \rangle \times \langle \alpha^x \rangle$, as $\mathbf{C}_{\hat{A}}(P) = 1_A$. Moreover,

$$\hat{A} = 1^\perp = (B \cap B^y)^\perp = B^\perp B^{\perp y} = \langle \alpha, \alpha^x \rangle \langle \alpha^y, \alpha^{xy} \rangle = \langle \alpha, \alpha^x \rangle \langle [\alpha, y], [\alpha^x, y] \rangle = B^\perp [\hat{A}, y].$$

In particular, $\text{rank}(A) = \text{rank}(\hat{A}) \leq 4$ and $\exp(A) = \exp(\hat{A}) = o(\alpha)$. Write $e = \exp(A)$. If $\text{rank}(A) = 2$, then $A = \langle a \rangle \times \langle a^x \rangle = \langle a \rangle^G$, and we are done. So, we may assume that $\text{rank}(A) = 4$ by Remark.

Note that $H \cong C_6$. So, $Q \trianglelefteq G$ and, setting $Z = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$, by part (1) of Lemma 3.5 and part (2) of Lemma 3.3 we have $\exp(A/Z) = 4$ and $c(Q) = 3$. Hence, $e \geq 4$. By Lemma 3.1, $[\hat{A}, y] \cong [A, y] \cong A/Z$ and, as $\hat{A} = B^\perp B^{\perp y}$, we see that $[\hat{A}, y] = [B^\perp, y][B^{\perp y}, y] = [B^\perp, y] = \langle [\alpha, y], [\alpha, y]^x \rangle$ has rank two. Since it is a nontrivial $\langle x \rangle$ -module, we conclude that $Q' = [A, y] \cong [\hat{A}, y] \cong (C_4)^2 \cong A/Z$.

Since $\hat{A} = B^\perp [\hat{A}, y]$ where $B^\perp \cong (C_e)^2$ for $e \geq 4$ and $\text{rank}(\hat{A}) = 4$, $B^\perp \cap [\hat{A}, y] < [\hat{A}, y]$. As $B^\perp \cap [\hat{A}, y]$ is P -invariant, $B^\perp \cap [\hat{A}, y]$ is either trivial or isomorphic to $(C_2)^2$.

Assume that $B^\perp \cap [\hat{A}, y] = 1_A$. Then $\hat{A} = B^\perp \times [\hat{A}, y]$. Observe that by Lemma 3.1 $[\hat{A}, y]^\perp = Z$, and hence $A = B \times Z$ where $B \cong \hat{A}/B^\perp \cong [\hat{A}, y] \cong (C_4)^2$ and $Z \cong \hat{A}/[\hat{A}, y] \cong B^\perp \cong (C_e)^2$ where $e \geq 4$. So, $B \times B^y \leq A \subseteq N(G)$, we get a contradiction by part (2) of Lemma 3.5.

So, $B^\perp \cap [\hat{A}, y] \cong (C_2)^2$. Let ω

As $[\hat{A}, y] = \langle [\alpha, y], [\alpha, y]^x \rangle$, $B^\perp \cap [\hat{A}, y] = \langle [\alpha, y]^2, [\alpha, y]^{2x} \rangle$. Write $\omega = [\alpha, y]^x$.

\square

Usually, indecomposable module is not necessarily cyclic. However, for a group G satisfying Setting 3.7 such that $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$, if A is an indecomposable H -module, then A must be a cyclic H -module. The next result is also the key to classify finite groups G such that $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$.

Proposition 3.12. *Assume Setting 3.7 and that A is an indecomposable H -module. If $A \subseteq N(G)$, then A is a cyclic H -module.*

Proof. By part (1) of Lemma 3.5, $c(Q) = 3$. Since

$$Q \lesssim \bigtimes_{\lambda \in \text{Irr}(A) - \{1_A\}} Q / \ker(\lambda^G),$$

there exists a nonprincipal $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$ such that $c(Q/K) = 3$ where $K = \ker(\alpha^G)$. As $A \subseteq N(G)$, $A/K \subseteq N(G/K)$. By Lemma 3.11, $A/K = \langle a \rangle^G K/K$, and so $A = \langle a \rangle^G K$. Clearly, by part (1) of Lemma 3.5 $c(\langle a \rangle^G \langle y \rangle) = 3$. Write $N = [\langle a \rangle^G \langle y \rangle]$. So, an application of Corollary 3.10 to $G_0 = \langle a \rangle^G \rtimes H$ yields that N is the minimal G_0 -invariant subgroup in $\langle a \rangle^G$, and hence N is also the minimal G -invariant subgroup in $\langle a \rangle^G$ (as A is abelian). Recall that $c(Q/K) = 3$, i.e. $[A/K, y, y] > 1$. Observe that

$$N/(N \cap K) \cong NK/K = [\langle a \rangle^G K/K, y, y] = [A/K, y, y] > 1,$$

and hence $N \cap K = 1$. As N is the minimal G -invariant subgroup in $\langle a \rangle^G$, $\langle a \rangle^G \cap K = 1$, and so $A = \langle a \rangle^G \times K$. Since A is H -indecomposable, $K = 1$ and $A = \langle a \rangle^G$. \square

Finally, we deal with groups G satisfying Setting 3.7 such that $P_v(G) = \frac{5}{6}$.

Lemma 3.13. *Assume Setting 3.7. Let $Y = \langle y \rangle$. Suppose that $A = B \times C$ where $B = \langle b \rangle^G$ and $C = \langle c \rangle^G$. Write $D = \langle bc \rangle^G$. If $A \subseteq N(G)$, then*

- (1) $c(DY) = c(Q) = \max\{c(BY), c(CY)\}$ and $\exp(D) = \max\{\exp(B), \exp(C)\}$.
- (2) $\exp(B) \geq \exp(C)$ if and only if $c(BY) \geq c(CY)$. In particular, $\exp(B) = \exp(C)$ if and only if $c(BY) = c(CY)$.
- (3) $\text{rank}(D) = \max\{\text{rank}(B), \text{rank}(C)\}$.

Proof. Observe that $A \subseteq N(G)$ and that $c(Q) > 2$, and hence an application of part (1) of Lemma 3.5 to G yields that $c(Q) = 3$.

- (1) As $A = B \times C$ where B, C are G -invariant subgroup of A and $Q = AY$ where $Y = \langle y \rangle$,

$$\gamma_{i+1}(Q) = [A, \underbrace{Y, \dots, Y}_i] = [B, \underbrace{Y, \dots, Y}_i] \times [C, \underbrace{Y, \dots, Y}_i]$$

for $i \geq 0$. Therefore, $\max\{c(BY), c(CY)\} = c(AY) = c(Q) = 3$. Without loss of generality, we may assume that $c(BY) = 3$. To show that $c(DY) = 3$, since $c(DY) \leq c(Q) = 3$, it suffices to

show that $[D, Y, Y] \neq 1$. As $[bc, y, y] \in [D, Y, Y]$, it remains to show that $[bc, y, y] \neq 1$. Observe that $Q = AY$ where A is an abelian maximal subgroup of Q , and hence an application of part (1) of Lemma 3.1 yields $[bc, y, y] = [b, y, y][c, y, y]$ where $[b, y, y] \in B$ and $[c, y, y] \in C$. Also, as $A \subseteq N(G)$, $B \subseteq N(BH)$ by Lemma 2.4. Applying Corollary 3.10 to BH , we have that $[b, y, y] \neq 1$. Therefore, $[bc, y, y] \neq 1$ as $BC = B \times C$. Observe that $o(b) = \exp(B)$ and $o(c) = \exp(C)$ and that $A = B \times C$, and hence $\exp(D) = o(bc) = \max\{o(b), o(c)\} = \max\{\exp(B), \exp(C)\}$.

(2) Set $e = \max\{\exp(B), \exp(C)\}$. As $B = \langle b \rangle^G$ and $C = \langle c \rangle^G$ are 2-groups such that $B \cap C = 1$, $o(b) = \exp(B)$, $o(c) = \exp(C)$ and $o(bc) = \max\{o(b), o(c)\} = e$. Also, by (1) $c(DY) = c(Q) = 3$. Observe that by part (1) of Lemma 3.1?? $c(BY) = 3$ if and only if $[b, y]^2 \neq 1$.

Assume that $\exp(B) \geq \exp(C)$ and $c(BY) < c(CY) = 3$. Since $[bc, y]^2 = [b, y]^2[c, y]^2$ where $[c, y]^2 \neq 1$ (as $c(CY) = 3$),

$$(bc)^{\frac{e}{2}} = b^{\frac{e}{2}}c^{\frac{e}{2}} \notin \langle [c, y]^2, [c, y]^{2x} \rangle = \langle [bc, y]^2, [bc, y]^{2x} \rangle.$$

Applying Corollary 3.10 to HD , we have that $bc \in V(HD)$, and hence $bc \in V(G)$ by Lemma 2.4, a contradiction.

Assume that $3 = c(BY) \geq c(CY)$ and $\exp(B) < \exp(C)$. Since $[bc, y]^2 = [b, y]^2[c, y]^2$ where $[b, y]^2 \neq 1$ (as $c(BY) = 3$),

$$(bc)^{\frac{e}{2}} = b^{\frac{e}{2}}c^{\frac{e}{2}} = c^{\frac{e}{2}} \notin \langle [bc, y]^2, [bc, y]^{2x} \rangle$$

which also implies $bc \in V(G)$ by a similar argument, a contradiction.

(3) We first show that $\text{rank}(D) = 4$ provided that one of B and C has rank 4. To see this, we may assume that $\text{rank}(B) = 4$. If $\text{rank}(D) = 2$, then

$$[b, y][c, y] = [bc, y] = (bc)^i(bc)^{jx} = b^i b^{jx} (c^i c^{jx}).$$

As $A = B \times C$ where B and C are G -invariant subgroups of A , $[b, y] = b^i b^{jx}$ and $[c, y] = c^i c^{jx}$, a contradiction to $\text{rank}(B) = 4$.

We next show that $\text{rank}(D) = 2$ provided that both B and C have rank 2. Otherwise, by Remark $\text{rank}(D) = 4$. Without loss of generality, we may also assume that $c(CY) \leq c(BY) = 3$. Hence, by (2), $\exp(B) \geq \exp(C)$. As $A \subseteq N(G)$, an application of Lemma 2.4 to both HB and HC yields that $B \subseteq N(HB)$ and $C \subseteq N(HC)$. Since $\text{rank}(B) = 2$, it follows by Corollary 3.10 that $bb^y = b^{4x}$ (for a suitable generator x of P) and $o(b) = \exp(B) = 8$. As $o(c) = \exp(C) \leq \exp(B) = o(b) = 8$, $o(bc) = \exp(D) = 8$. Now, applying Lemma 2.4 to HD , we have that $D \subseteq N(HD)$. Since $\text{rank}(D) = 4$, it follows by Corollary 3.10 that $[(bc)^2, y] = (bc)^{4x^i}$ where $i = 1$ or -1 . Observe that

$$[b^2, y][c^2, y] = [(bc)^2, y] = (bc)^{4x^i} = b^{4x^i} c^{4x^i}$$

and that $A = B \times C$ where B and C are G -invariant, and hence $b^{-2}(b^2)^y = [b^2, y] = b^{4x^i}$. As

$bb^y = b^{4x}$, $b^2(b^2)^y = (bb^y)^2 = b^{8x} = 1$ where the last equality holds as $o(b) = 8$. Thus,

$$(b^4)^y = b^{-2}(b^2)^y b^2(b^2)^y = (b^4)^{x^i}$$

where $i = 1$ or -1 , against that $[b^4, y] = 1$. □

Let a finite group H act via automorphisms on abelian groups V and W . If V and W are isomorphic as H -modules, then we call V and W are H -isomorphic, and we write $V \cong_H W$.

Lemma 3.14. *Assume Setting 3.7. Let $Y = \langle y \rangle$. Suppose that $A = B \times C$ where $B = \langle b \rangle^G$ and $C = \langle c \rangle^G$ such that $\exp(B) \geq \exp(C)$. If $A \subseteq N(G)$, then one of the following happens.*

- (1) $c(BY) = c(CY) = 3$ and $B \cong_H C$ is one of the groups described in Corollary 3.10.
- (2) $c(BY) = 3 > c(CY)$, $\text{rank}(B) \geq \text{rank}(C)$, $\exp(B) > \exp(C)$ and B is one of the groups described in Corollary 3.10. In addition, if $\text{rank}(B) = \text{rank}(C) = 2$, then $c^y = c^{-1}$.

Proof. Set $D = \langle bc \rangle^G$ and $e = \exp(B)$. Observe that $A \subseteq N(G)$ and that $c(Q) > 2$, and hence $c(Q) = 3$ by part (1) of Lemma 3.5. Also, since $A \subseteq N(G)$, an application of Lemma 2.4 to HB , HC and HD yields that $B \subseteq N(HB)$, $C \subseteq N(HC)$ and $D \subseteq N(HD)$. Observe that $\exp(B) \geq \exp(C)$, and hence $\exp(A) = e$ and also it follows by Lemma 3.13 that $3 = c(DY) = c(BY) \geq c(CY)$, $\exp(D) = e$ and $\text{rank}(D) = \max\{\text{rank}(B), \text{rank}(C)\}$.

We claim first that: if $c(BY) = 3$, then $[b^2, y] = b^{\frac{e}{2}x}$ and $bb^y = b^{\frac{e}{2}x^i}$ for $i \in \{-1, 1\}$ cannot occur together. Otherwise, $\text{rank}(B) = 2$ as $bb^y = b^{\frac{e}{2}x^i}$. As BY satisfies Setting 3.7 such that $B = \langle b \rangle^G \subseteq N(HB)$, Corollary 3.10 implies $e = 8$ and then

$$b^4 = b^2 b^{2y} [b^2, y]^{-1} = (b^{4x^i})^2 b^{-4x} = b^{4x},$$

a contradiction to $\mathbf{C}_A(P) = 1$.

(1) Suppose that $c(BY) = c(CY) = 3$. Recall that $c(DY) = 3$, $\text{rank}(D) = \max\{\text{rank}(B), \text{rank}(C)\}$ and $\exp(D) = \exp(C) = \exp(B) = e$. We claim now $\text{rank}(B) = \text{rank}(C)$. Suppose not, and we may assume that $\text{rank}(B) = 4 > \text{rank}(C) = 2$. Then $\text{rank}(D) = 4$. Also, $o(bc) = \exp(D) = e$. Observe that $D \subseteq N(HD)$ and $C \subseteq N(HC)$. Now, applying Corollary 3.10 to both HD and HC , we have that for a suitable generator x of P , $[(bc)^2, y] = (bc)^{\frac{e}{2}x}$ and $cc^y = c^{\frac{e}{2}x^i}$ for $i \in \{-1, 1\}$. Therefore, $[c^2, y] = c^{\frac{e}{2}x}$ and $cc^y = c^{\frac{e}{2}x^i}$ for $i \in \{-1, 1\}$, a contradiction.

Next, we show that $B \cong_H C$. Assume that $\text{rank}(B) = \text{rank}(C) = 2$. Then $\text{rank}(D) = 2$. Since $D \subseteq N(HD)$, an application of Corollary 3.10 to HD yields that $e = 8$ and, for a suitable generator x of P , we may assume that $(bc)(bc)^y = (bc)^{4x}$. Thus, $bb^y = b^{4x}$ and $cc^y = c^{4x}$. Define an abelian group isomorphism $\varphi : B \rightarrow C$ such that $\varphi(b) = c$, $\varphi(b^x) = c^x$. Then it is routine to check that φ is an H -isomorphism.

Assume that $\text{rank}(B) = \text{rank}(C) = 4$. Then $\text{rank}(D) = 4$. Since $D \subseteq N(HD)$, an application of Corollary 3.10 to HD yields that for a suitable generator x of P , we may assume that $[(bc)^2, y] = (bc)^{\frac{e}{2}x}$. Hence, $[b^2, y] = b^{\frac{e}{2}x}$ and $[c^2, y] = c^{\frac{e}{2}x}$. Write $b_0 = wb^{\frac{e}{4}x}$ where $w = [b, y]$. Then $o(b_0) = 2$.

We next claim that $B = \langle b, b^x \rangle \times \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle$ such that $[b, y] = b^{-\frac{e}{4}x}b_0$ and $[b_0, y] = b^{-\frac{e}{2}x}b^{-\frac{e^2}{16}x^{-1}}$. As $b_0 = wb^{\frac{e}{4}x}$ where $w = [b, y]$, $[b, y] = b^{-\frac{e}{4}x}b_0$. Also,

$$[b_0, y] = [wb^{\frac{e}{4}x}, y] = [w, y][b^{\frac{e}{4}x}, y] = w^2w^{\frac{e}{4}x} = b^{-\frac{e}{2}x}b^{-\frac{e^2}{16}x^2}.$$

where the third equality holds as $[w, y] = w^{-2}$ and $o(w) = 4$ and the last equality holds as $e \geq 8$ and $o(b_0) = 2$. Obviously, $[b_0, y] \neq 1$. Since $\langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_2)^2$ and $\langle b, b^x \rangle$ are P -invariant, it remains now to show that $\langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cap \Omega_1(\langle b, b^x \rangle) = 1$. As $\Omega_1(\langle b, b^x \rangle) = \langle w^2, w^{2x} \rangle$, $[\Omega_1(\langle b, b^x \rangle), y] = 1$ by part (1) of Lemma 3.1. Observe that $[b_0, y] \neq 1$ and that $\langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle$ is minimal P -invariant, and hence $\langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cap \Omega_1(\langle b, b^x \rangle) = 1$. Similarly, $C = \langle c, c^x \rangle \times \langle c_0, c_0^x \rangle$ such that $[c, y] = c^{-\frac{e}{4}x}c_0$ and $[c_0, y] = c^{-\frac{e}{2}x}c^{-\frac{e^2}{16}x^{-1}}$ where $c_0 = [c, y]c^{\frac{e}{4}x}$. Define an abelian group isomorphism $\varphi : B \rightarrow C$ such that $\varphi(b) = c$, $\varphi(b^x) = c^x$, $\varphi(b_0) = c_0$ and $\varphi(b_0^x) = c_0^x$. Then it is routine to check that φ is an H -isomorphism.

(2) Suppose $c(BY) = 3 > c(CY)$. Then $e = \exp(D) = \exp(B) > \exp(C)$ and $c(DY) = 3$. Now, since HB satisfies Setting 3.7 such that $B = \langle b \rangle^G \subseteq N(HB)$, it follows by Corollary 3.10 that B is one of the groups described in Corollary 3.10. We now show that $\text{rank}(B) \geq \text{rank}(C)$. Otherwise, $\text{rank}(B) = 2$ and $\text{rank}(C) = 4$. Hence, $\text{rank}(D) = 4$. Also, since HD satisfies Setting 3.7 such that $D = \langle bc \rangle^G \subseteq N(HD)$, it follows by Corollary 3.10 that for a suitable generator x of P , $[(bc)^2, y] = (bc)^{\frac{e}{2}x}$. Similarly, applying Corollary 3.10 to HB , we have that $bb^y = b^{\frac{e}{2}x^i}$ for $i \in \{-1, 1\}$. So, $[b^2, y] = b^{\frac{e}{2}x}$ and $bb^y = b^{\frac{e}{2}x^i}$ for $i \in \{-1, 1\}$, a contradiction.

Suppose that $\text{rank}(B) = \text{rank}(C) = 2$. Then $\text{rank}(D) = 2$. Observe now that HD satisfies Setting 3.7 such that $D = \langle bc \rangle^G \subseteq N(HD)$, and hence by Corollary 3.10 that for a suitable generator x of P , $o(bc) = 8$ and

$$bc(bc)^y = (bc)^{4x}.$$

Thus, $c^y = c^{-1}$ as $o(c) < o(b) = 8$. □

Proposition 3.15. *Assume Setting 3.7. Then $A \subseteq N(G)$ if and only if $A = B \times C$ where C is normal in G such that $\exp([C, y]) \leq 2$ and $[C, y, y] = 1$ and B is a direct product of k (> 0) copies of cyclic H -module, say $B_0 = \langle b_0 \rangle^G$ where $b_0 \in B$, such that $\exp(B) > \exp(C)$; for $c \in C$, $\text{rank}(B_0) \geq \text{rank}(\langle c \rangle^G)$, and one of the following is true:*

- (1) *For a suitable generator x of P , $B_0 = \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_8)^2$ such that $b_0b_0^y = b^{4x}$; $\text{rank}(\langle c \rangle^G) = 2$ and $c^y = c^{-1}$ for $c \in C$;*
- (2) *For a suitable generator x of P , $B_0 = ED$ where $E = \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_{2^n})^2$ ($n \geq 3$) and $D = [E, y] \cong (C_4)^2$ such that $b_0^{2^{n-1}} = [b_0^2, y]^x$.*

Proof. Write $A = B \times C$ where B is a direct product of k H -indecomposable modules, say B_i , such that $c(B_i \langle y \rangle) > 2$ for $1 \leq i \leq k$ and $C \trianglelefteq G$ such that $[C, y, y] = 1$.

Suppose that $A \subseteq N(G)$. For $i \in \{2, \dots, k\}$ and $c \in C$, set $S = H(B_1 \times B_i)$ and $R = H(B_1 \times \langle c \rangle^G)$. Observe that $G = \mathbf{C}_G(B_1 \times B_i)S$, and hence an application of Lemma 2.4 yields $B_1 \times B_i \subseteq N(S)$. Also, S satisfies Setting 3.7 and B_1 and B_i are H -indecomposable modules. It follows by Proposition 3.12, Lemma 3.14 and Corollary 3.10 that $B_j = \langle b_j \rangle^G$ are H -modules whose structure is described in (1) or (2). Notice that $[\langle c \rangle^G, y, y] \leq [C, y, y] = 1$, and hence $c(\langle c \rangle^G \langle y \rangle) \leq 2$. Applying similar arguments to R , we have the rest desired results.

Now, we show the other implication. Let $a \in A$, $A_0 = \langle a \rangle^G$ and $T = A_0 \rtimes H$. Write $a = bc$ where $b \in B$ and $c \in C$ and set $B_0 = \langle b \rangle^G$, $C_0 = \langle c \rangle^G$. Therefore, $A_0 \leq B_0 \times C_0$. By Lemma 2.4, it suffices to show $a \in N(T)$. We may also assume that $c(A_0 \langle y \rangle) = 3$ by part (2) of Lemma 3.3. Observe that $c(C_0 \langle y \rangle) \leq c(C \langle y \rangle) \leq 2$, and hence by Lemma 3.13 $c(B_0 \langle y \rangle) = 3$. Write $B = \times_{i=1}^k B_i$ where $B_i = \langle b_i \rangle^G$.

Suppose that $B_1 = \langle b_1 \rangle^G$ is the cyclic module in (1) and assume that $b_1 b_1^y = b_1^{4x}$. Then $gg^y = g^{4x}$ for all $g \in B_i$. Write $b = \prod_{i=1}^k g_i$ where $g_i \in B_i$. Then

$$bb^y = \prod_{i=1}^k g_i \left(\prod_{i=1}^k g_i \right)^y = \prod_{i=1}^k (g_i g_i^y) = \prod_{i=1}^k g_i^{4x} = \left(\prod_{i=1}^k g_i \right)^{4x} = b^{4x},$$

that is $\text{rank}(B_0) = 2$ and $bb^y = b^{4x}$. Also, since $c(B_0 \langle y \rangle) = 3$ and $o(b) \leq \exp(B) = 8$, $o(b) = 8$. As $c^y = c^{-1}$,

$$aa^y = bc(bc)^y = (bb^y)(cc^y) = b^{4x} = b^{4x} c^{4x} = (bc)^{4x} = a^{4x}.$$

So $\text{rank}(A_0) = 2$, $aa^y = a^{4x}$. As $o(b) = \exp(B) > \exp(C) \geq o(c)$ and $\langle b \rangle \cap \langle c \rangle = 1$, $o(a) = o(b) = 8$. An application Corollary 3.10 to T yields $a \in N(T)$, as desired.

Suppose that that $B_1 = \langle b_1 \rangle^G$ is the cyclic module in (2) and assume that $b_1^{2^n-1} = [b_1^2, y]^x$ where $2^n = \exp(B) \geq 8$. Then $g^{2^n-1} = [g^2, y]^x$ for all $g \in B_i$. Write $b = \prod_{i=1}^k g_i$ where $g_i \in B_i$. Observe that $o(c) < \exp(B) = 2^n$ and $o([c, y]) \leq \exp([C, y]) \leq 2$, and so

$$[a^2, y] = [(c \prod_{i=1}^k g_i)^2, y] = [c^2, y] \prod_{i=1}^k [g_i^2, y] = \prod_{i=1}^k g_i^{2^{n-1}x} = c^{2^{n-1}x} \left(\prod_{i=1}^k g_i \right)^{2^{n-1}x} = a^{2^{n-1}x}. \quad (3.2)$$

Observe that by part (1) of Lemma 3.1 y acts as the inversion on $[A_0, y] = \langle [a, y], [a, y]^x \rangle$ and that $c(A_0 \langle y \rangle) = 3$, and hence $[A_0, y] \cong (C_4)^2$. Applying $[A_0, y] \cong (C_4)^2$ to (3.2), we have that $\exp(A_0) = o(a) = 2^n$.

We next show that $[a, y] \notin \langle a, a^x \rangle$. Otherwise, $A_0 = \langle a \rangle^G = \langle a, a^x \rangle$ is a uniserial H -module. As $c(A_0 \langle y \rangle) = 3$ and both $\mathbf{C}_{A_0}(y)$ and $[A_0, y]$ are H -invariant, $\mathbf{C}_{A_0}(y) \leq [A_0, y]$. Observe that by Lemma 3.1 $A_0/\mathbf{C}_{A_0}(y) \cong [A_0, y]$, and hence $A_0 \cong (C_8)^2$. So, $n = 3$ and $[a^2, y] = a^{4x}$. Also, observe that $A = (\times_{i=1}^k B_i) \times C$ and that $[a, y] \in \langle a, a^x \rangle$, and so $[g_i, y] \in \langle g_i, g_i^x \rangle$ for $1 \leq i \leq k$.

As $c(A_0\langle y \rangle) = 3$, there exists $1 \leq i_0 \leq k$ such that $c(\langle g_{i_0} \rangle^G \langle y \rangle) = 3$ by part (1) of Lemma 3.13. Write $G_{i_0} = \langle g_{i_0} \rangle^G$. Since $c(G_{i_0}\langle y \rangle) = 3$ and $\text{rank}(G_{i_0}) = 2$, an application of similar arguments (to A_0) to G_{i_0} yields that $G_{i_0} \cong (C_8)^2$ and $[G_{i_0}, y] \cong (C_4)^2$. As G_{i_0} is a maximal G -invariant subgroup of $B_{i_0} = \langle b_{i_0} \rangle^G$, $B_{i_0} = G_{i_0}\langle b_{i_0}, b_{i_0}^x \rangle$. Compare the order of the groups in last equation, we have that $G_{i_0} \cap \langle b_{i_0}, b_{i_0}^x \rangle$ is a P -invariant subgroup of G_{i_0} of order 16, and hence $G_{i_0} \cap \langle b_{i_0}, b_{i_0}^x \rangle = [G_{i_0}, y] \cong (C_4)^2$. However, as $[G_{i_0}, y] \leq [B_{i_0}, y] \cong (C_4)^2$, $[B_{i_0}, y] \leq \langle b_{i_0}, b_{i_0}^x \rangle$, against the definition of B_{i_0} (see (2)).

Thus, $A_0 = \langle a, a^x \rangle \langle [a, y], [a, y]^x \rangle$ such that $\langle a, a^x \rangle \cap \langle [a, y], [a, y]^x \rangle = \Omega_1(\langle [a, y], [a, y]^x \rangle)$ and $[a, y]^2 = a^{2^{n-1}x}$. Consequently, we conclude from Corollary 3.10 that $a \in N(T)$. \square

4 Proof of the main theorem

Given a prime number p , an element g of a finite group G can be uniquely written in the form $g = g_p g_{p'}$ where g_p is a p -element, $g_{p'}$ is a p' -element and g_p and $g_{p'}$ commute. This follows by considering the decomposition of the cyclic group $\langle g \rangle$ as the direct product of its Sylow p -subgroup and p -complement.

Lemma 4.1. *Let A be an abelian normal subgroup of the group G such that $[G : A] \leq 6$ and $[G : A] \neq 5$. For $a \in A$:*

- (1) *if $[G : A] \neq 3$ and G has abelian Sylow 3-subgroups, then $a \in V(G)$ if and only if $a_2 \in V(G)$;*
- (2) *if $[G : A] = 3$, then $a \in V(G)$ if and only if $a_3 \in V(G)$.*

Proof. See [15, Lemma ??]. \square

Lemma 4.2. *Let G be a finite group. Suppose $P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$. Then Sylow p -subgroup of G is abelian for each odd prime p .*

Proof. Since $P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$, by Theorem 2.8 G has an abelian normal subgroup $A = N(G)$ such that $[G : A] = m \leq 6$. So we may assume that $1 < m \leq 6$ and $p \in \pi(m)$. Let $Q \in \text{Syl}_2(G)$, $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$ and K a p -complement of A . If $m \leq 5$, then $P \cong G/K$, and hence $P_v(P) = P_v(G/K) \leq P_v(G) = \frac{m-1}{m}$. Observe that $p > 2$, and so P is abelian. Suppose now that $m = 6$. Then $p = 3$. Assuming that P is nonabelian, we consider the factor group $\overline{G} = G/K$, and we observe that $\overline{G} = \overline{P} \rtimes \overline{Q}$, $P \cong \overline{P}$ and $|\overline{Q}| = 2$. If $[\overline{Q}, \overline{P}] = 1$, then \overline{G} has a factor group isomorphic to \overline{P} and by Lemma 2.6 we get the contradiction $P_v(G) \geq P_v(\overline{G}) \geq \frac{8}{9}$. Thus $\overline{P} = \mathbf{F}(\overline{G})$ and hence $\overline{G} - \overline{P} \subseteq V(\overline{G})$. As $P_v(\overline{G}) \leq P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$, it suffices to show that $P_v(\overline{G}) \geq \mathfrak{a}$ to get a contradiction. Substituting G by a suitable quotient, we may assume that $K = 1$, P' is minimal normal subgroup of G and $G = P \rtimes Q$ where $Q \cong C_2$ and $P = \mathbf{F}(G)$. Then P' is an irreducible Q -module, and so $|P'| = 3$.

Therefore, there exists a $\theta \in \text{Irr}(P)$ such that $\theta(1)^2 = [P : \mathbf{Z}(P)]$ by Problem 2.13 of [8]. Now, an application of Problem 6.3 of [8] to P yields that θ vanishes on $P - \mathbf{Z}(P)$. Observe that $\mathbf{Z}(P) \trianglelefteq G$, and hence χ vanishes on $P - \mathbf{Z}(P)$ for every $\chi \in \text{Irr}(G)$ lying above θ . As $G - P \subseteq V(G)$, $P_v(G) \geq \frac{|G| - |\mathbf{Z}(P)|}{|G|} \geq \frac{17}{18}$, a contradiction. \square

Lemma 4.3 ([15]). *Let U and V be noncentral minimal normal subgroups of the group G . Assume that U is a 2-group, V is a 3-group and that $|G/UV| = 5$. Then $N(G) = U \cup V$ and $P_v(G) = \frac{133}{135}$.*

Lemma 4.4. *Let finite group G have an abelian normal subgroup A with index 6, and let K be a 2-complement of A and $P \in \text{Syl}_3(G)$. Set $L = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \times K$. If $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$, then $L \trianglelefteq G$ and $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \cong_{G/A} A/L$.*

Proof. As $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$, $L \trianglelefteq G$. Set $\overline{G} = G/L$ and $N = [\mathbf{O}_2(A), P]$. Observe that

$$A = \mathbf{O}_2(A) \times K = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \times [\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \times K = N \times L,$$

and hence $[\overline{A}, \overline{P}] = [\overline{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}, \overline{P}] = [\overline{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}, \overline{P}] = \overline{N}$. Set $\tilde{G} = G/K$. As $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$, $\tilde{L} \leq \mathbf{Z}(\tilde{G})$. Observe that

$$\mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}/\tilde{L}}(\tilde{P}\tilde{L}/\tilde{L}) = \mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}}(\tilde{P}\tilde{L})\tilde{L}/\tilde{L} = \mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}}(\tilde{P})\tilde{L}/\tilde{L}$$

where the last equality holds as $\tilde{L} \leq \mathbf{Z}(\tilde{G})$ and that

$$\mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}}(\tilde{P}) = \mathbf{C}_{A/K}(PK/K) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)K/K}(PK/K) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P)K/K$$

as $2 \nmid |K|$, and hence

$$\mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}}(\tilde{P}) \cong \mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}/\tilde{L}}(\tilde{P}\tilde{L}/\tilde{L}) \cong \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P)L/L = 1,$$

i.e. $\overline{A} = [\overline{A}, \overline{P}]$ (as $\overline{A} = \mathbf{C}_{\tilde{A}}(\tilde{P}) \times [\overline{A}, \overline{P}]$). Also, since $L \trianglelefteq G$, G/A acts naturally on \overline{N} . So, it suffices to show that $N \cong_{G/A} \overline{N}$. Let φ be the natural epimorphism from N to \overline{N} such that $\varphi(x) = \overline{x}$ for all $x \in N$. For all $gA \in G/A$, since $x^{gA} = x^g$ and $\overline{x}^{gA} = \overline{x^g}$ for all $x \in N$ and $\ker(\varphi) = N \cap L = 1$, we conclude that $N \cong_{G/A} \overline{N}$. \square

We are now ready to prove Theorem A, which we state again.

Theorem 4.5. *Let G be a finite group, $Q \in \text{Syl}_2(G)$ and $P \in \text{Syl}_3(G)$. Then $P_v(G) < P_v(A_7) = \mathbf{a}$ if and only if either*

- (a) *G is an A -group such that $[G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = m \leq 6$. In addition, if $m = 5$, then $|\pi(\mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G)) \cap \{2, 3\}| \leq 1$; or*
- (b) *Q is nonabelian; G has an abelian normal subgroup A such that $|G/A| = m \leq 6$ where m is a composite number; and one of the following holds:*

- (b1) $m = 4$ and $\mathbf{O}_2(A) = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$;
- (b2) $m = 6$, $G/A \cong S_3$ where $A = \mathbf{F}(G)$; $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$; $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] = C \times C^x$, where $x \in P - \mathbf{O}_3(A)$, such that $1 < C = \mathbf{C}_{[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P]}(Q) \lesssim C_4 \times (C_2)^k$;
- (b3) $m = 6$, $G/A \cong C_6$; $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$; $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] = C$ where $[C, Q, Q] = 1$;
- (b4) $m = 6$, $G/A \cong C_6$; $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$; $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] = B \times C$ where C is normal in G such that $\exp([C, Q]) \leq 2$ and $[C, Q, Q] = 1$ and B is a direct product of k (> 0) copies of cyclic G/A -module, say $B_0 = \langle b_0 \rangle^G$ where $b_0 \in B$, such that $\exp(B) > \exp(C)$; for $c \in C$, $\text{rank}(B_0) \geq \text{rank}(\langle c \rangle^G)$, and one of the following is true:
- (b4.1) For a suitable generator x of P and for all $y \in Q - A$, $B_0 = \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_8)^2$ such that $b_0 b_0^y = b_0^{4x}$; $\text{rank}(\langle c \rangle^G) = 2$ and $c^y = c^{-1}$ for $c \in C$;
- (b4.2) For a suitable generator x of P and for all $y \in Q - A$, $B_0 = ED$ where $E = \langle b_0, b_0^x \rangle \cong (C_{2^n})^2$ ($n \geq 3$) and $D = [E, y] \cong (C_4)^2$ such that $b_0^{2^{n-1}} = [b_0^2, y]^x$.

Proof. Suppose that $P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$. By Theorem 2.8, G has an abelian normal subgroup $A = \mathbf{N}(G)$ such that $[G : A] = m \leq 6$. Also by Lemma 4.2, every Sylow p -subgroup of G , where $p > 2$, is abelian. Now we divide into two cases.

Suppose that Q is abelian. Then G is an A -group and hence $\mathbf{F}(G)$ is abelian. As A is an abelian G -invariant subgroup having index m , to show that $[G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = m$, it suffices to show that $\mathbf{F}(G) \subseteq A = \mathbf{N}(G)$. If $m = 5$, since $G > \mathbf{F}(G) \geq A$ and $[G : A] = 5$, then $A = \mathbf{F}(G)$. Assume that $m \neq 5$ and $m > 1$. Applying Lemma 4.1 to G , we have that $\mathbf{F}(G) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ if and only if $\mathbf{O}_p(G) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ for $p = \min \pi(m)$. However, $\mathbf{O}_p(G) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ follows directly from Lemma 2.7. Next, we show that if $m = 5$, then $|\pi(\mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G)) \cap \{2, 3\}| \leq 1$. Otherwise, $2, 3 \in \pi(\mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G))$. Let $P \in \text{Syl}_5(G)$ and K a 5-complement of A . Since $K = \mathbf{C}_K(P) \times [K, P]$,

$$\mathbf{Z}(G) = \mathbf{C}_K(P) \times Z \text{ where } Z = A \cap P.$$

Since $[K, P] \cong \mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G)$ has order divisible by both 2 and 3, then there exists a factor group \overline{G} of G that verifies the assumptions of Lemma 4.3, which is impossible as $P_v(\overline{G}) \leq P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$. So $|\pi(\mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G)) \cap \{2, 3\}| \leq 1$ when $m = 5$.

Suppose that Q is nonabelian.

Let K be a 2-complement of A . Write $\overline{G} = G/K$. Since Q is nonabelian, $m = 4$ or 6. In fact, otherwise $m = 2$, $P_v(G) = \frac{1}{2}$ and $Q \cong \overline{G}$, and so

$$P_v(Q) \leq P_v(\overline{G}) \leq P_v(G) = \frac{1}{2}$$

which contradicts Q being nonabelian. Therefore $P_v(G) = \frac{m-1}{m} = \frac{3}{4}$ or $\frac{5}{6}$. Since $P_v(\overline{G}) \leq P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$, again by Theorem 2.8, \overline{G} has an abelian normal subgroup $\mathbf{N}(\overline{G})$ such that $[\overline{G} : \mathbf{N}(\overline{G})] = n \leq 6$,

and hence $P_v(\overline{G}) = \frac{n-1}{n}$. Recall that $\overline{Q} \in \text{Syl}_2(\overline{G})$ is nonabelian, we have that $P_v(\overline{G}) = \frac{3}{4}$ or $\frac{5}{6}$. Since $A = N(G)$, $\overline{A} \leq N(\overline{G})$, and hence by calculation $P_v(G) = P_v(\overline{G})$ and $\overline{A} = N(\overline{G})$.

Assume that $m = 4$. Then $\overline{G} = \overline{Q}$ is a nonabelian 2-group and so $\overline{A} = N(\overline{G}) = \mathbf{Z}(\overline{G}) = \mathbf{Z}(\overline{Q})$ by Lemma 2.6. As $A = \mathbf{O}_2(A) \times K$, $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), Q] \leq K \cap \mathbf{O}_2(A) = 1$, i.e. $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \leq \mathbf{Z}(Q)$. Observe that $[Q : \mathbf{Z}(Q)] \geq 4$ (as Q being nonabelian) and that $[Q : \mathbf{O}_2(A)] = [G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = 4$, and hence $\mathbf{O}_2(A) = \mathbf{Z}(Q)$, i.e. (b1) holds.

Assume that $m = 6$. Now $P_v(G) = P_v(\overline{G}) = \frac{5}{6}$, so $\overline{P} \cong C_3$ acts nontrivially on $\overline{A} = \overline{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}$ and $\overline{Q} \in \text{Syl}_2(\overline{G})$ is a nonabelian 2-group with an abelian maximal subgroup \overline{A} . Now, part (4) of Lemma 3.3 yields that $\mathbf{C}_{\overline{A}}(\overline{P}) \leq \mathbf{Z}(\overline{G})$. As $\overline{\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P)} \leq \mathbf{C}_{\overline{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}}(\overline{P}) = \mathbf{C}_{\overline{A}}(\overline{P})$,

$$[\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P), G] \leq \mathbf{O}_2(A) \cap K = 1,$$

i.e. $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$.

We argue that $\overline{Q}' \leq [\overline{A}, \overline{P}]$. Otherwise $\overline{G}/\overline{N}$, where $\overline{N} = \overline{P}[\overline{A}, \overline{P}]$, is a nonabelian 2-group and $N(\overline{G}) \subseteq \overline{Z}$, for $\overline{N} \leq \overline{Z} \leq \overline{G}$ such that $\overline{Z}/\overline{N} = \mathbf{Z}(\overline{G}/\overline{N})$, by Lemma 2.6. So $N(\overline{G}) \subseteq \overline{Z} \cap \overline{A}$ by part (3) of Lemma 3.3. Since $[\overline{G} : \overline{Z}] \geq 4$, $|\overline{A}/\overline{Z} \cap \overline{A}| = |\overline{A}\overline{Z}/\overline{Z}| = \frac{1}{2}|\overline{G}/\overline{Z}| \geq 2$ and we get the contradiction $P_v(\overline{G}) \geq \frac{11}{12} > \mathfrak{a}$.

Set $\widehat{G} = \overline{G}/\mathbf{C}_{\overline{A}}(\overline{P})$. Then \widehat{Q} is still nonabelian. Since $\overline{A} = \mathbf{C}_{\overline{A}}(\overline{P}) \times [\overline{A}, \overline{P}]$, \widehat{P} acts nontrivially on \widehat{A} . As $[\widehat{G} : \widehat{A}] = [G : A] = 6$, an application of parts (3) and (4) of Lemma 3.3 to \widehat{G} yields that $P_v(\widehat{G}) = P_v(\overline{G}) = \frac{5}{6}$. Applying part (1) of Lemma 3.3 to \widehat{G} , \widehat{A} has a complement in \widehat{G} and hence \widehat{G} satisfies Hypothesis 3.4 such that $P_v(\widehat{G}) = \frac{5}{6}$. Let $L = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \times K$ and $\widetilde{G} = G/L$, and observe that $\widetilde{G} \cong \widehat{G}$. So, \widetilde{G} satisfies Hypothesis 3.4 such that $P_v(\widetilde{G}) = \frac{5}{6}$. Also, $\mathbf{F}(\widetilde{G})$ is a 2-group. By Lemma 4.4, $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \cong_{G/A} \widetilde{A}$.

Assume that $\widetilde{G}/\widetilde{A} \cong S_3$. Then $\mathbf{F}(\widetilde{G}) = \widetilde{A}$ and $G/A \cong S_3$. Observe that $\widetilde{A} \leq \widetilde{\mathbf{F}(\widetilde{G})} \leq \mathbf{F}(\widetilde{G}) = \widetilde{A}$, and hence $\widetilde{A} = \widetilde{\mathbf{F}(\widetilde{G})}$. As L is a G -invariant subgroup of A , $A = \mathbf{F}(G)$. Since $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \cong_{G/A} \widetilde{A}$, (b2) holds by Proposition 3.6.

Assume that $\widetilde{G}/\widetilde{A} \cong C_6$. Then $G/A \cong C_6$. If \widetilde{Q} is nonabelian of class 2, since $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \cong_{G/A} \widetilde{A}$, then (b3) holds by Proposition 3.15. If $c(\widetilde{Q}) > 2$, since $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \cong_{G/A} \widetilde{A}$, (b4) holds by Proposition 3.15.

We next prove the other implication. Now there exists an abelian normal subgroup A (if (a) occurs, then $A = \mathbf{F}(G)$ of G such that $[G : A] = m$ and $G - A \subseteq V(G)$). To see $P_v(G) < \mathfrak{a}$, it suffices to show that $A \subseteq N(G)$. So we may assume that $1 < m \leq 6$. Let K be a 2-complement of A .

Suppose $m \neq 5$. Then G satisfies the hypothesis of Lemma 4.1, and hence in order to show $A \subseteq N(G)$ we only need to show that $\mathbf{O}_\ell(A) \subseteq N(G)$ for $\ell = \min \pi(m)$. Let $L \in \text{Syl}_\ell(G)$. Observing that if $\mathbf{O}_\ell(A) \leq \mathbf{Z}(L)$, then $\mathbf{O}_\ell(A) \subseteq N(G)$ by Lemma 2.7, we may assume that $\ell = 2$, $m = 6$ and $L = Q$ is nonabelian. We now proceed to show $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \subseteq N(G)$. Let H be a Hall $\{2, 3\}$ -subgroup of

G , and observe that $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \leq H$ and that $G = \mathbf{C}_G(\mathbf{O}_2(A))H$. An application of Lemma 2.4 yields that $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ if and only if $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(H)$. So, it suffices to show that $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(H)$. Without loss of generality, we may assume that G is a $\{2, 3\}$ -group. Let $N = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \times K$ and $\overline{G} = G/N$. Now, \overline{G} is a group satisfies Setting 3.4. Since $A = [\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \times N$, it follows by Lemma 2.5 that $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ if and only if $\overline{A} = \overline{[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P]} \subseteq \mathbf{N}(\overline{G})$. We next show that $\overline{A} \subseteq \mathbf{N}(\overline{G})$. If (b2) holds, then by Proposition 3.6 $\overline{A} \subseteq \mathbf{N}(\overline{G})$. If (b3) holds, i.e. $c(\overline{Q}) \leq 2$, then $\overline{A} \subseteq \mathbf{N}(\overline{G})$ by part (2) of Lemma 3.3. If (b4) holds, then by Proposition 3.15 $\overline{A} \subseteq \mathbf{N}(\overline{G})$. Therefore, $[\mathbf{O}_2(A), P] \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$. Recall that $\mathbf{O}_2(A) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \times [\mathbf{O}_2(A), P]$ where $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(A)}(P) \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$. Consequently, an application of Lemma 2.3 yields that $\mathbf{O}_2(A) \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$.

Suppose $m = 5$. Write $Z = \mathbf{Z}(G)$. Let $R \in \text{Syl}_5(G)$ and B a 5-complement of A . Note that $A = \mathbf{F}(G) = \mathbf{O}_5(G) \times \mathbf{C}_B(R) \times [B, R]$, by the hypothesis $Z = \mathbf{O}_5(G) \times \mathbf{C}_B(R)$. We also observe that $|[B, R]|$ is coprime to 5. Let now $a \in [B, R]$ and $\alpha \in \text{Irr}(A)$. Then $\alpha^G(a) = \sum_{i=1}^5 \alpha^{x_i}(a)$, where $\{x_1, \dots, x_5\}$ is a transversal for A in G , and for every $i \in \{1, \dots, 5\}$ $\alpha^{x_i}(a) \in \mathbf{U}_n$, where $n = |[B, R]|$. Observe that $|\pi(n) \cap \{2, 3\}| \leq 1$, and hence Lemma 2.1 implies that $\alpha^G(a) \neq 0$. By Lemma 3.2, we deduce that $[B, R] \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$ and by Lemma 2.3 we conclude that $A \subseteq \mathbf{N}(G)$. \square

In the next theorem, we give a detailed description of groups of type (a) in Theorem A. Recall that a *quasi-Frobenius group* is a group G such that $G/\mathbf{Z}(G)$ is a Frobenius group with a Frobenius kernel $\mathbf{F}(G)/\mathbf{Z}(G)$ and a Frobenius complement $H/\mathbf{Z}(G)$; and $\mathbf{F}(G)$ is called a *kernel of a quasi-Frobenius group* while H is called a *complement of a quasi-Frobenius group*. For instance, if G is an A -group such that $[G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = p$ for some prime p , then G is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(G)$.

Theorem 4.6. *Let G be a finite group, m a positive integer such that $1 < m \leq 6$. Set $\pi = \pi(m)$. Then G is an A -group such that $[G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = m$ if and only if one of the following holds:*

- (1) G is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(G)$ such that $G/\mathbf{F}(G) \cong C_m$;
- (2) $m = 4$; G has an abelian Sylow 2-subgroup and an abelian Fitting subgroup $\mathbf{F}(G)$ such that $G/\mathbf{F}(G) \cong (C_2)^2$;
- (3) $m = 6$; $G = K \rtimes H$ where $H \in \text{Hall}_\pi(G)$ and K is an abelian normal π -complement of G ; write $\pi = \{p, q\}$, H is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(H)$ such that $H/\mathbf{F}(H) \cong C_p$; $T = K\mathbf{F}(H)$ is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(T) = K \times \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{F}(H)}(K)$ such that $T/\mathbf{F}(T) \cong C_q$;
- (4) $m = 6$; $G = K \rtimes H$ where $H \in \text{Hall}_\pi(G)$ and K is an abelian normal π -complement of G ; $\mathbf{F}(G) = K \times \mathbf{F}(H)$; and H is one of the groups below:
 - (4.1) $H/\mathbf{Z}(H) = F_1 \times F_2$ where F_i are quasi-Frobenius groups with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(F_i)$ such that $F_i/\mathbf{F}(F_i) \cong C_{i+1}$ for $i = 1, 2$;

(4.2) $H/\mathbf{F}(H) \cong S_3$, for $P \in \text{Syl}_3(H)$, $T = P\mathbf{F}(H)$ is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(T) = \mathbf{F}(H)$ such that $T/\mathbf{F}(T) \cong C_3$.

Proof. One implication is trivial. Suppose that G is an A -group such that $1 < [G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = m \leq 6$. Let H be a Hall π -subgroup of G , $O = \times_{q \in \pi} \mathbf{O}_q(G)$ and K a normal π -complement of G . Then $\mathbf{F}(G) = K \times O$ is abelian, $G = K \rtimes H$ and also $K = \mathbf{C}_K(H) \times [K, H]$ as $(|K|, |H|) = 1$.

Suppose that H is abelian and $G/\mathbf{F}(G) \cong C_m$. Then $O \leq \mathbf{Z}(G)$ and so $\mathbf{Z}(G) = \mathbf{C}_K(H) \times O$. Set $\overline{G} = G/\mathbf{Z}(G)$. Observe that $\mathbf{C}_{\overline{K}}(\overline{H}) = \overline{\mathbf{C}_K(H\mathbf{Z}(G))} = \overline{\mathbf{C}_K(H)} = \overline{1}$ and that $\overline{H} \cong G/\mathbf{F}(G) \cong C_m$, and hence \overline{G} is a Frobenius group with kernel $\overline{\mathbf{F}(G)}$ and a cyclic complement which is isomorphic to C_m . Consequently, (1) holds.

If H is abelian but $G/\mathbf{F}(G)$ is not cyclic, then $m = 4$, $G/\mathbf{F}(G) \cong (C_2)^2$ and Sylow 2-subgroup of G is abelian.

Suppose that H is nonabelian. Then $|\pi| \geq 2$ and so $m = 6$ and $\pi = \{p, q\} = \{2, 3\}$. Write $[H : \mathbf{F}(H)] = n$. Since $[H : H \cap \mathbf{F}(G)] = 6$ and $H \cap \mathbf{F}(G) \leq \mathbf{F}(H) < H$, $n \in \{2, 3, 6\}$.

If $n \in \pi$, say $n = p$, then Sylow p -subgroup of H is abelian, and hence H is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(H)$ such that $H/\mathbf{F}(H) \cong C_p$. Write $T = K\mathbf{F}(H)$. Then $[K, \mathbf{F}(H)] > 1$. In fact, otherwise $\mathbf{F}(G) = \mathbf{F}(H) \times K$, a contradiction to $[G : \mathbf{F}(G)] = 6$. Observe now that $\mathbf{Z}(T) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{F}(H)}(K) \times \mathbf{C}_K(\mathbf{F}(H))$, and that $\mathbf{F}(G) = \mathbf{F}(T) = K \times \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{F}(H)}(K)$, and hence $|T/\mathbf{F}(T)| = [\mathbf{F}(H) : H \cap \mathbf{F}(G)] = q$. Since T is an A -group, T is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(T)$ such that $T/\mathbf{F}(T) \cong C_q$.

Suppose that $n = m = 6$. Then $\mathbf{F}(G) = K \times \mathbf{F}(H)$. Let $Q \in \text{Syl}_2(H)$ and $P \in \text{Syl}_3(H)$. Assume that $H/\mathbf{F}(H) \cong C_6$. We claim that (4.1) holds. Since $\mathbf{O}_2(H) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(H)}(P) \times [\mathbf{O}_2(H), P]$ and $\mathbf{O}_3(H) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_3(H)}(Q) \times [\mathbf{O}_3(H), Q]$, $\mathbf{Z}(H) = \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_2(H)}(P) \times \mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{O}_3(H)}(Q)$. Observe that $H/\mathbf{F}(H) \cong C_6$, and hence $H/\mathbf{Z}(H) = F_1 \times F_2$ where $F_1/\mathbf{F}(F_1) \cong C_2$ and $F_2/\mathbf{F}(F_2) \cong C_3$. Thus (4.1) holds. Assume that $H/\mathbf{F}(H) \cong S_3$. Let $T = P\mathbf{F}(H)$. Then $T \trianglelefteq H$ and $\mathbf{F}(T) = \mathbf{F}(H)$ has index 3 in T . Since T is an A -group, T is a quasi-Frobenius group with abelian kernel $\mathbf{F}(T)$ such that $T/\mathbf{F}(T) \cong C_3$. \square

References

- [1] J. Brough, *Non-vanishing elements in finite groups* J. Algebra **460** (2016), 387–391.
- [2] S. Dolfi, E. Pacifici and L. Sanus, *On zeros of characters of finite groups* Group Theory and Computation, Indian Stat. Inst. Ser., Springer, Singapore, 2018, pp. 41–58.
- [3] S. Dolfi, E. Pacifici, L. Sanus and P. Spiga, *On the vanishing prime graph of solvable groups* J. Group Theory **13** (2010), 189–206.

- [4] M. Grüninger, *Two remarks about non-vanishing elements in finite groups* J. Algebra **460** (2016), 366–369, 2016.
- [5] M. Harris, *On p' -automorphisms of abelian p -groups* Rocky Mountain J. Math. **7** (1977), 751–752.
- [6] B. Huppert, *Endliche gruppen I*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1983.
- [7] B. Huppert and N. Blackburn, *Finite groups II*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1982.
- [8] I.M. Isaacs, *Character theory of finite groups*, AMS Chelsea Publishing, Providence, RI, 2006.
- [9] I.M. Isaacs, G. Navarro and T.R. Wolf, *Finite group elements where no irreducible character vanishes*, J. Algebra **222** (1999), 413–423.
- [10] T.Y. Lam and K.H. Leung, *On vanishing sums of roots of unity*, J. Algebra **224** (2000), 91–109.
- [11] A.R. Miller, *Dense proportions of zeros in character values*, C. R. Math. Acad. Sci. Paris **357** (2019), 771–772.
- [12] A. Moreto and P.H. Tiep, *Nonsolvable groups have a large proportion of vanishing elements*, preprint.
- [13] L. Morotti and H.P. Tong-Viet, *Proportions of vanishing elements in finite groups*, Israel J. Math., (2021), DOI: 10.1007/s11856-021-2256-4.
- [14] B. Poonen and M. Rubinstein, *The number of intersection points made by the diagonals of a regular polygon*, SIAM J. Discrete Math. **11** (1998), 135–156.
- [15] Y. Zeng, D. Yang and S. Dolfi, *On the proportion of vanishing elements in finite groups*, J. Algebra **614** (2023), 825–847.